RESURRECTION AND COMMUNITY OF JESUS IN HISTORY

Hartono Budi

Abstract:

Bagaimana komunitas kristiani yang lahir dari peristiwa kebangkitan Kristus, dari masa ke masa tetap setia pada pengalaman dasarnya itu? Bagaimana dijelaskan dinamika internalnya sebagai pendengar Sabda Allah dan sekaligus sebuah komunitas historis yang mengalami perubahan? Komunitas kristiani dari masa ke masa mewartakan kabar gembira Yesus Kristus yang menyelamatkan dan berkembang dengan aneka macam tradisi yang sebagian lebih menekankan ciri kelembagaannya, kharisma para pemimpinnya atau pun kepatuhan kepada Roh Kudus atau Sabda Allah saja. Tulisan ini ingin mengulas pengalaman dasar dan dinamika komunitas para murid Yesus ini terutama sebagai pendengar Sabda, serta sarana-sarana organisatoris bagi pelestariannya seperti ajaran dan perayaan iman serta kuasa mengajar.

Key Words:

Ecclesiology, Resurrection, scripture and tradition, Catholic doctrine, Vatican II

A community is a social unit that shares and learns common values. Resources, beliefs, preferences, needs, choices, risks as well as history are conditons affecting the formation of its identity and the identity of the participants as well as their degress of mutual commitment and cohesiveness. Christian community was born of the Resurrection of Jesus Christ which by its nature missionary. Second Vatican council of the Catholic Church redefined its understanding of community as *a church in the world* or *a world church*,"that the world might be fashioned anew acoording to God's design and reach its fulfilment" (GS 2). This eventually has given a stronger self understanding of a community initiated by the risen Christ and his disciples.

The following discussion is an attempt to retrace an ecclesiology born by the resurrection of Jesus Christ and the sending of Holy Spirit (John 14:15-17, 15:26 and Acts 1:4) as well as its development in the light of an actual experience of being Catholic today.

RESURRECTION AND CHRISTIAN COMMUNITY

Jesus' resurrection takes place by definition on *the other side of death*. Easter stories suggest, the disciples' experience of the risen Christ was very different from their previous experience of Jesus. Their initial reactions are hesitation, incredulity, fear and even doubt. It is worth noticing thatin all stories, there is stress on their initial non-recognition, confusion, doubt and fear (Mark 16:8, Luke 24). Jesus had to lead them to believe (Luke 24: 38-42), including to lead those who loved Jesus most like Peter, Mary Magdalene or Thomas (John 20:14). Though community of Jesus' disciples obviously started when Jesus was calling them to be with him bringing God's Reign to all people, a new community was reborn by his resurrection and the sending of Holy Spirit marked by a singular mission to "Go into all the world. Preach the good news to everyone.Anyone who believes and is baptized will be saved..." (Mark 16:15-16a)

Resurrection is *more than* mystical experience of the transcendent God.It is deeply personal process in which Jesus discloses himself as present in a new way. Accordingly, Kenan Osborne stated that belief in the resurrection of Jesus is not an easy matter, either in the case of the disciples or in the case of the early Jesus communities generally[1]. Osborne further explains that Resurrection belongs to the realm of religious experience, a revelatory religious experience and not merely of an empirical, historical perception or an objective inference. In other word, it has a transcendent character.

Coming to believe in Jesus' new life was more *a gradual process* than an instant recognition, a compelling belief that reverses one's freedom as well as one's historical point of reference. In the Gospels this means that Jesus had to lead them, just as in his ministry before in Galilee and Jerusalem (Mark 6:5). Jesus' followers themselves had to allow grace to lead them to faith.Remember, Jesus manifested himself to *his* friends, that was those who had opened their hearts, loved Jesus personally and in community as well asto have relationship with Jesus. The community of Jesus are those who had faith in its fundamental sense which is an openness to God, and to respond personally in faith, freedom and love.

Resurrection is an act of God's power bringing Jesus from the dead. As such, the resurrection cannot be seen, except the results of that act: the appearances, the empty tomb, and Christianity itself.Yet, Walter Kasper pointed out thatResurrection has as well a historical dimension as it happened to the crucified Jesus of Nazareth. Two extremes of explanations could be first, perceiving resurecction merely as an objective or this worldly event, a public event that can be seen by any neutral observer. Somehow, New Testament' witnesses*testify* to the experience of the risen Christ; and

secondly, perceiving it as purely a subjective event, an interior feeling of the disciples. By the way, New Testament is familiar with the language of dreams, visions, raptures, and avoids it here.

One thing certain is that the encounter with the Risen Jesus *changed the lives* of those who had originally constituted the Jesus movement. This dramatic change has provided the strongest historical evidence for the truth of Jesus' Resurrection, a community of Jesus reborn for a mission or "evangelization" that is to share the Good News of Jesus Christ guided by the Risen Christ.

Indeed, most of the Gospel accounts about the appearances of the Risen Jesus feature the theme of mission. The women are ordered *to tell* the men that Jesus will meet them in Galilee (Matthew 28:9-10, Mark 16:7, John 20:17-18), the disciples are *to forgive* and retain sins (John 20:23), pastoral commission for Peter (John 21:15-19), eleven disciples are *to make new disciples* of all nations (Matthew 28:19-20), that "repentance and forgiveness of sins is to be proclaimed, beginning from Jerusalem" (Luke 24:27). In this commission, the Church was born and Jesus' movement became the Church of Jesus Christ. The experience of Jesus as alive once more gave them the courage and the energy to carry on the movement that Jesus had begun. This is the heart and foundation of any Christian community and her missionary nature (AG 1)[2].

NEW TESTAMENT CHRISTOLOGIES AND CHRISTIAN COMMUNITY

It is in our Christian memory that the early disciples had been demoralized and scattered. How could Jesus, they had followed with great hope, die in a humiliating death with the cruelest form of capital punishment? That way of dying would seem merely to die under a religious curse and outside the camp of God's covenantal people (Hebrews 13:12-13)[3] What had happened? What did it mean? Who was this Jesus?How do we make others understand these events as some might consider already scandalous or foolishness? (1 Corinthians 1:22-24)

It is also in our understanding that In the New Testament, Easter experience is presented as a creative forcestronger than any force of doubt of Jesus' disciples. Because of that experience, the disciples of Jesus gave personal as well as communal witnesses that the God of Abraham, Isaac and Jacob had actedpowerfully and vindicated Jesus as well as his message. The God of Israel whom Jesus called Abba, had delivered Jesus from the bonds of death.

Earliest christologiesoriginated in early Christian preaching and represented by fragments, titles, hymns and formulas embedded in later Christian texts such as letters of Paul as well as the Acts of the Apostles. St. Paul wrote "For, if you confesswith your mouth that Jesus is Lord and believe in your heart that God raised him from the dead, you will be saved" (Romans 10:9 which is also a creedal formula from the early Palestinian Church.See also 1 Thessalonians 1:9-10, Romans 1:3-4). Ephesians 3:8-10 reflects another early Christology, "To me…this grace was given, to preach the inscrutable riches of Christ, and to bring to light for all what is the plan of the mystery hidden from ages past in God who created all things, so that the manifold wisdom of God might now be made known…". Analysis on its vocabulary, imagery, style and thought will explain further the character of this early christology used in different Christian communities.

The early christologies are best reflected in the context of worship among early Christians. Larry Hurtado pointed to six main features of this worship which are hynm both celebrating Christ and sung to him (see John 1: 1-8, Colossians 1:15-20, Philippians 2:5-11), prayers addressed to him, including prayers during the liturgy (Acts 7:59-60, 2 Corinthians 12:2-10, 1 Corinthians 16:22); the use of Jesus'name regularly, invoking Jesus (Acts 9:14, 21, 1 Corinthians 1:2) and baptizing in the name of Jesus (Acts 2:38, 8:16); The Lord Supper; Confession of faith in Jesus; Prophesy in the words of the risen Christ (Revelation 1:17-3:22). This form of worship where disciples of Jesus celebrated Christ the beloved servant and son of God, contributed to the deeper sense of who Christians were and what their relationship with Jesus Christ meant. Soon, the increasing number of their martyr because of what they believed and put into practice, rounded up the meaning of their post Easter faith and community[4].

New Testament was developed over about 70 years. Asearly as the year of 50 or about 20 years after the crucifixion of Jesus, first texts were appearing such as the authentic letters of Paul[5] sent to various churches in the course of Paul's missionary journeys.While Paul gave more emphases that the basis of his Christian faith and his call to be "apostle" lay in the direct call of God and in a divine revelation to him of Jesus as the Son of God (Galatians 1:11-17), his letters did not indicate that he made a real innovation or that his view on Christ was fundamentally unique. In fact in Paul's letter there are good numbers of passages that reflect the devotion of his Christian predecessors[6]. Reflection on Christ, of who he was and what he did, developed along the history while Christians facing different challenges and questions posted by outsider as well as insider[7].

New Testament successfully balanced its inherited Jewish monotheism and faith in the Risen Christ as it was invoked in worship and honored with

divine names, functions or roleby the*Original* believing community.In any case, its focus on relation (salvific as well as historical) between God-Father and Jesus-Son remained as fundamental root of faith as they constantly framedtheir "new" life in the common prophetic timetables[8]. Christianity began as some sort of Jewish sectarian movements grounded in the experience of Christ's resurrection[9].

IN THE SPIRIT OF CHRIST: ONE, HOLY, CATHOLIC, APOSTOLIC

Raymond Brown demonstrates struggles between churches over a diversity of traditions as well as struggles within an individual church over diverse interpretations of the same christological experience and tradition. This was creatively expressed, for example, that the Church did not only profess a Jesus as perfectly divine but also perfectly human, virginally conceived as well as pre-existent as God's Son. The Church teaches about a Spirit who is given to an authoritative teaching magisterium as well as the Paraclete or teacher who is given to each Christian. Early Christian communities also demonstrated their love toward Peter as well as toward the Beloved Disciple. This is a brilliant theological reflection, communication of faith and discernment that dares a creative tension in understanding its revelation and faith[10].

Francis A. Sullivanpoints that Church's indefectibility (permanence in existence) is secured by Christ himself who built the Church (Matthew 16:18) and that Christ will always remain faithful (Ephesians 5:25,29) and by our faith in Jesus as Lord. This faith on the Lordship of Jesus empowers us to remain faithful despite any internal corruption as well as a possible external hostility against the Church. This interior or transcendental integrity is crucial to the self-understanding of this respective community called Church (Catholic Church to be more precise)[11].

The Church will remain in the true faith for the abiding presence and assistance of the Holy Spirit (John 14:16, 15:26, 16:13). 1 Timothy 3:15 underlines its permanence in the truth.St. Thomas Aquinas remarks that our faith is formed by charity and animated by grace. An individual Christian could fall away from faith and a group of Christians could form a heretical sects yet the Church as a whole community remains indefectible. Ecclesiology perceives that the Church is indefectibly one, holy, Catholic, Apostolic as they are properties with divine assurance (LG 39)[12]. On the other hand, we need to understand them as gift as well as goal, as object of faith as well as a test of faith[13].

The Church is indefectibly holy means she never lacks of members who are actually living in the grace of Christ. She is indefectible in faith means

she never lacks of members who are maintaining Christian faith, actually being lived in the grace of Christ. The Church is indefectibly apostolic means in faith she accepts witness of the apostles as normative (Peter, Paul, New Testament Church; 1 Corinthians 15:5-7, DV 7-8, John 21:25, 1 John 1-3), derived her living faith from it and does not contradict it[14].

Indeed, the understanding of infallibility of whole people of God (supernatural sense of faith LG 12) is the fruit of our foundational belief: 1) Jesus is Lord and he loved the Church and gave himself up for her (Ephesians 5:26), 2) Christ's eschatological victory and his universal Lordship is the soul of the theology of the Church as Christ's body, bride, flock of which Christ is the chief Shepherd (1 Peter 5:4), 3) She will never be led away from the truth of the Gospel by one inherited the charge given to Peter to 'feed his lambs and feed his sheep' (John 21:15-17)[15].

This ecclesiology has been kept alive by our *Sensus fidei* (subjective quality of a believer) which is aroused and sustained by the Spirit of truth, a gift of grace of Holy Spirit which all receives. Remember, some significant effects of this gift are 1) by it, we could accept wholeheartedly the Word of God and not only as "human" word or utterance, 2) cling without failing to the same faith once delivered to the saints, 3) penetrate deeper the accurate insight of Christian wisdom, 4) and apply more thoroughly to our daily life[16].

DOCTRINE AND DOGMA:DIRECTING OUR GAZE TOWARD LOVING GOD

Human beings live in history, consequently our encounter with God will always be mediated through historical expressions[17]. Church teachings are important because of the way in which it can direct our gaze toward God, illuminating for us to ever incomprehensible mystery of God (therefore it is not an end in itself). A dogma is specific historical mediation of the one revelation of God (therefore it is not a revelation in itself)

Christians asserts that we have encountered the one revelation of God in the covenants recounted by the ancient Israel, witnessed in the life and teaching of the prophets as well as in the various ways in which Israel preserved their encounter with God in their sacred writings. Christianity has encountered God's revelation in the oral and written testimony of the early Christians who first walked with Jesus on the shores of the Sea of Galilee, continued his ministry to the end in Jerusalem and then encountered him as risen. Revelation continues to be handed on and received in the liturgy, in the teachings of councils and popes, in the theological meditations of great Christian theologians (doctors of Church), in the dramatic testimony of

saints and martyrs, and in the more mundane testimony of simple believers struggling to follow the Gospel in their daily lives.

Christian community explains what they believe in its *doctrine*. Therefore its doctrine is an authoritative or normative formulation of a belief of the Church, whether revealed or not. Indeed a doctrine is intended to articulate a formal belief of the Church that it draws in some fashion from its reflection on divine revelation even if it may not itself be divinely revealed. Because of that, doctrine covers a broader field than dogma, though sometimes synonymous. Accordingly, doctrine is crucial since it is an organic self-explanation of what the community believe since it develops throughout the centuries, guides its doctrinal discernment as to listen faithfully to the wisdom of the past as well as continuously to be open to the Word of Godand God's ever new revelation, with its unique regulative role and in turn forms the Church's historical as well as narrative identity as she is journeying toward God.

Dogma, as part of the doctrine, refers to propositional formulation which is divinely revealed and proposed as such by the magisterium or the teaching office of the Church, either through a solemn definition of a pope or council, or by the teaching of the college of bishops in their ordinary and universal magisterium[18]. As divinely revealed doctrine, a dogma, therefore is definitive and irreversible. The church teaches that this has the character of a revelation (to which the faithful say: I believe), which means not erroneous and eventually adequately interpreted since God wills that human being understands who God is. In the Catholic community or even in the Christian community in general, most of the dogma is found in the basic creedal statements of the Church like the Nicene-Constantinopolitan Creed which is the central aspects of our faith such as the divinity of Christ and the bodily resurrection. In Church's history this core faith has been further elaborated in the later Marian dogmas such as on the Divine Motherhood of Mary (by the Council of Ephesus in 431), on Perpetual Virginity of Mary, mother of Jesus (by the Council of Lateran in 649), on the Immaculate Conception of Mary (by Pope Pius IX in 1854) and on the Assumption of Mary (by Pope Pius XII in 1950).

Within this Catholic circle, Gaillardetz explained further that we could still point to a more specific doctrine which is called non-dogmatic. There are three kind of non-dogmatic teachings. They are 1) *Definitive doctrine* which not divinely revealed but are necessary for safeguarding and expounding divine revelation. Therefore they are taught with the charism of infallibility (charism that assists the Church as a whole in a *judgment* of belief and the teaching office in a teaching *judgment*[19]. Infallibility shall be understood as God's promise to the Church that *when it comes to matters*

pertaining to our salvation, we can be confident that church teaching will be a sure guide. Yet, it is not saying that the church cannot commit error at all or that they are irreversible (or irreformable). One good example of this definitive doctrine is the determination of the books included in the canon of the Bible by council of Trent; 2) *Authoritative doctrine*. The teaching office of the Church (magisterium)proposes it authoritatively to guide the faith of believers, drawing from the wisdom of the church as it reflects on Scripture and tradition. This will include many moral teachings for example the Catholic teaching on immorality of directly targeting civilians in an act of war or prohibition of certain reproductive technologies like *in vitro* fertilization; 3) *Prudential admonition and Church discipline* that deserve serious attention and consideration as they determine whether one's moral judgments are consistent with the Gospel. Here, Catholics might legitimately differ with the bishops regarding these moral applications and prudential judgments. Good example of these are bishops' teaching of the use of nuclear weapon or Church discipline and requirement of celibacy for diocesan priests[20].

At this point, it is important for the dynamic of Church community to know the gradation of Church teachings. It is certain that all faithful are called to respond in faith to God's Self revelation and this includes the exercise of full responsibility on behalf of the faithful, individually and as community. Here the underlining moral and theological principle is the gift of freedom. In Christian theology, freedom is presupposed in an act of faith as well as of moral. Freedom determines the quality of one's faith and moral action.

Not every dogma is equally central to Church's life. Yet, for about 2000 years, various church teachings have been remarkably trustworthy and Catholics have justifiably given them the presumption of truth, and there will be no point in discernment or dialogue if there is no truth. In this regard, the people of Godcame to a new understanding that someprevious teachings were surely not divinely revealed, for example on slavery, and they have witnessed some bishops and even popes had been untruthful, doing imprudent things and even leading immoral lives.This should count as a simple reminder of our reality as pilgrim Church, that all are called in Christ to progress in holiness of a disciple (LG 48).

VATICAN II AND THE PLENITUDE OF DIVINE TRUTH

Pope John XXIII who was canonized in April 27, 2014 explicated that the Church is not an archeological museum. The people of God is a living community of faith, tireless, and continuously life-giving therefore this community would make its way forward, often in unexpected ways. We

remember the wisdom of the council of Vatican II that opened the door for the Church, promoted new respect for modern science and the fruit of historical scholarship. The council called for more cooperation between laity and clergy as they shared a common identity of all believers as *Christifideles* (the Christian faithful)[21].

The council perceives that bishops and theologians share a common service to the Word of God (not just explaining church teaching to the laity) and welcomes explicitly the working of God's grace in the world (not just as a dangerous place), therefore supported a respectful and fruitful dialogue with different communities, religious and non-religious[22]. Indeed the council has brought the Church *up to date*, continuously *returning to primary resources* (Bible and early Christian experience including the Church's Fathers), as well as fostering a continuous discernment on the signs of the times. In the area of scriptural studies, St Gregory the Great reminds us that Scripture grows with those who read it(*cum legentibus crescit*). It grows by constantly being read and lived, to the extent that new questions and new challenges in history arise (*Commentary on Job* XX, 1).

Vatican II teaches the possibility of knowing God in Christ by the power of the Holy Spirit (DV 5, 8), also on the primacy of Scripture and necessity of church doctrine. Revelation should not be reduced to a body of information (or a set of statements) about God, but a living encounter with God. Divine revelation is a divine invitation into relationship which is summed up in Jesus Christ. Scripture is the inspired, testimony to the living Word *of* God (not just the word *about* God), a privileged witness to what God has revealed to us. For Catholics and many Christians, the Bible, liturgy, creeds, doctrinal pronouncements and personal testimony are diverse mediations of the one revelation of God in Christ through the power of the Holy Spirit.

DEVELOPMENT WITH CREATIVE FIDELITY

A community is a social unit that shares and learns common values as well as beliefs, preferences, choices and history. Church community has developed a good understanding on its nature as people of God and her teaching that guides her journey throughout the history. As a community initiated by Jesus who started to gather his disciples when he was doing his ministry around Galilee and eventually Jerusalem, the Church came into being after going through the experience with Jesus who was finally killed and crucified and also raised from the dead according to the Scripture (1 Corinthians 15:3-4). The disciples of Jesus re-organized themselves as their eyes were opened in the light of faith in the Resurrection. This is the beginning of the missionary community to bring the Good News of Jesus Christ and the heart of its message as well as teaching. At this point, it is

clear that organization and institution came after and should serve its purpose of existence.The experience with Jesus Christ as the Good News is the foundational reason of the preservation, growth as well as changes(tradition) of the Church in the history.The dynamic of passing-on or tradition ismuch more than what is transmitted. It includes all forms of communication of faith and moral-religious practices that shape the identity of the community in every age as well as its way of relating to the world[23].

How this community, started with the Resurrection of Jesus Christ, has been faithful to its foundational experience? How do we explain its internal dynamic as faithful *hearer of the word*of God and at the same time a historical community of Christian faithful?

In 1988, John E. Thiel wrote about the *Senses of Tradition* to show its integrity precisely through continuity as well as development. There are four senses of tradition that form its inner dynamic. First is*Literal sense* which refers primarily to beliefs and practices that endured over long period of history. Stability characterizes this first sense and also is viewed as authoritative. The examples are ourChristian hope for eternal life or the teaching that Christ is fully human - fully divine[24]. Second sense is *development in continuity* which points to an aspect of tradition that gives evidence of significant growth and development (DV 8). This second sense presents tradition in view of divine providence. God's spirit is at work in the Church through generations. The example is the pronouncement of the dogma on the Immaculate Conception of mother Mary[25]. Third sense is*reversal of past beliefs and practices* which acknowledges the dramatic discontinuity amidst our consistent affirmation of the core belief.This sense of tradition involves not only the recognition of continuities with the past, but sometimes also of dramatic discontinuity and even reversal of positions. In fact, some belief and practices simply lose their authority over time. For example, we could recall the case of slavery which used to be accepted as fully in accord with natural law and divine revelation, orthe inherent inferiority of women in the natural order as well as denial of religious liberty to non-believers[26]. Fourth sense is*novel* which refers to the dynamic character of tradition that is openness to what appears as new, prophetic or evenprovocative. Here tradition is understood as not simply preservation or development of the old, yet moving onward to the fulfilment of God's reign, sometimes evenwas initiated by a minority of believers. Here we could recallthe insight that *Logos* was one in being with the Father,with coined word*homoousios.* Indeed, this was a minority position in 4th century that stood against the great Alexandrian theology and the Arian majority. Worth observing that yet it needs over 50 years for this Nicene faith position to be widely received[27].

To conclude, Pilgrim Church understands that divine truth is not something that the Church ever really possesses, since the people of God or the Church is still advancing towards the plenitude of divine truth[28].All the baptized contribute to the Church's corporate "listening" to God's Word (DV 12;Scripture and tradition as *distinct but inter-related mediations* of the same living Word)[29]. Accordingly, an *eschatological humility*has to be promoted as a true anticipation to the second coming of Christ.

Hartono Budi

Lecturer at the Faculty of Theology, University of Sanata Dharma, Yogyakarta and currently teaching at Loyola School of Theology, Ateneo de Manila University, Manila;
email: hartonobudisj@yahoo.com

CATATAN AKHIR:

[1] Kenan B. Osborne, *The Resurrection of Jesus. New Considerations for its Theological Interpretation*. (New York: Paulist Press, 1997), 55.

[2] Thomas P. Rausch, *Who is Jesus. An Introduction to Christology*. (Philippines: Claretians Publications, 2005), 111-124.

[3] Gerald O'Collins, *Believing in the Resurrection*. (New York: Paulist Press, 2011), 133.

[4] Larry W. Hurtado, *One God One Lord. Early Christian Devotion and Ancient Jewish Monotheism*. (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1988), 100-114 and *Lord Jesus Christ. Devotion to Jesus in Earliest Christianity*. (Michigan/Cambridge, U.K.: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2003), 619-625

[5] 1 Thessalonians, 1-2 Corinthians, Galatians, Philippians, Romans and letter to Philemon.

[6] Larry Hurtado points to Rom.1:3-4 and 10:9-10 as common creedal statements, Rom8:15, 1 Cor.16:22, Gal.4:6 as fragments of church prayers and possibly some hymns reflected in Col.1:15-20, Phil.2:5-11 as well as expression taken from the early Christian community in Palestine such as "Maranatha" (1 Cor.16:22). See *One God One Lord. Early Christian Devotion and Ancient Jewish Monotheism*, 4

[7] This is reflected in various Christological titles such as Jesus as a prophet, Messiah, Lord, Son of Man, Son of God, titles used by New Testament authors or theological reflections based on different Christological moments in Jesus life, etc.

[8] Larry Hurtado defies the influence of the veneration of divine-figures spread in Greco-Roman paganism among the first generation of Christians due to the powerful experience of Christ's resurrection and the general antipathy of ancient Judaism toward pagan religion. *One God One Lord. Early Christian Devotion and Ancient Jewish Monotheism*, 3. See also JMR. Tillard, *Flesh of the Church. Flesh of Christ. At the Source of the Ecclesiology of Communion*. Colegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 2001, 2

[9] Thomas P. Rausch, *Who is Jesus. An Introduction to Christology*. (Philippines: Claretian Publications, 2005), 125-146.

[10] Raymond Brown SS, *The Community of the Beloved Disciple*. (New York: Paulist Press, 1979), 162-164 with its important note on the relative value of the Church office precisely because of recognition of a disciple whom Jesus loved more that he loved Peter.

[11] St. Augustine stated beautifully: "It was from the side of Christ as he slept on the Cross that came forth the wondrous sacrament which is the whole church". Quoted in Francis A. Sullivan, *The Church We Believe in. One, Holy, Catholic and Apostolic*. (New York: Paulist Press, 1988), 9

[12] Francis A. Sullivan, *The Church We Believe in. One, Holy, Catholic and Apostolic*, 214-222. Lumen Gentium 39 states: "The Church, whose mystery is being set forth by this Sacred

Synod, is believed to be indefectibly holy. Indeed Christ, the Son of God, who with the Father and the Spirit is praised as "uniquely holy," loved the Church as His bride, delivering Himself up for her. He did this that He might sanctify her…"

[13] Lumen Gentium 39 continues: "However, this holiness of the Church is unceasingly manifested, and must be manifested, in the fruits of grace which the Spirit produces in the faithful; it is expressed in many ways in individuals, who in their walk of life, tend toward the perfection of charity, thus causing the edification of others…"

[14] Francis A. Sullivan, *The Church We Believe in. One, Holy, Catholic and Apostolic*, 210-214

[15] John Fullenbach, *Church Community for the Kingdom.* (New York: Orbis books, 2002), 27-28. Lumen Gentium 12 first paragraph writes: "The holy people of God shares also in Christ's prophetic office; it spreads abroad a living witness to Him, especially by means of a life of faith and charity and by offering to God a sacrifice of praise, the tribute of lips which give praise to His name. The entire body of the faithful, anointed as they are by the Holy One, cannot err in matters of belief. They manifest this special property by means of the whole peoples' supernatural discernment in matters of faith when "from the Bishops down to the last of the lay faithful" they show universal agreement in matters of faith and morals…"

[16] Francis A. Sullivan SJ, *Magisterium. Teaching authority in the Catholic Church*. (New York: Paulist Press, 1983), 4-23. The occasion of beatification of Archbishop Oscar Romero in May 23, 2015 adds to the lists of saints of today with their unwavering faith before those with *odium fidei* as well as *odium pauperum*. See *Tablet*, 23 May 2015, 4-5

[17] Richard Gaillardetz in his*By What Authority. A Primer on Scripture, the Magisterium, and the Sense of the Faithful*. Collegeville, (Minnesota: Liturgical Press, 2003), 91 and further explained in the context of the work of Holy Spirit through human and historical processes (p. 64-66)

[18] Richard Gaillardetz, *By What Authority*, 92

[19] Thomas P. Rausch, *Authority and Leadership in the Church. Past Directions and Future Possibilities*. (Wilmington Delaware: Michael Glazier, 1989), 55-57.

[20] Richard Gaillardetz, *By What Authority*, 94-101.

[21] Dennis M. Doyle, *The Church Emerging from Vatican II. A Popular Approach to Contemporary Catholicism*.(Connecticut: Twenty Third Publications, 1993), 13-15

[22]Pope Francis, *Evangelii Gaudium.* Apostolic Exhortation on the Proclamation of the Gospel in Today's World, 24 November 2013, 254.

[23]Here we should recall the groundbreaking theology of Yves Congar, O.P. especially *Tradition and Traditions: An Historical and a Theological Essay* (London: Burns & Oats, 1966) and *The Meaning of Tradition* (San Francisco : Ignatius Press, 2004)

[24] John E. Thiel, *Senses of Tradition. Continuity and Development in Catholic Faith*. Oxford: University Press, 2000, 31-35

[25] John E. Thiel, *Senses of Tradition. Continuity and Development in Catholic Faith*, 56-99

[26] John E. Thiel, *Senses of Tradition. Continuity and Development in Catholic Faith*, 100-128

[27] John E. Thiel, *Senses of Tradition. Continuity and Development in Catholic Faith*, 129-160

[28] Francis A. Sullivan, *The Church We Believe in. One, Holy, Catholic and Apostolic*, 223-224

[29] Pope and bishops are not the exclusive "organs of traditions" but with all the believers who through contemplation, study and intimate experience, allow church tradition to "progress" (Dei Verbum 8). Remember, the gift of*Sensus fidei*means the supernatural sense or instinct of the faith possessed by all believers through baptism.

BIBLIOGRAPHY:

Brown, Raymond, *The Community of the Beloved Disciple*. New York: Paulist Press, 1979.

Congar, Yves MJ., *Tradition and Traditions. An Historical and a Theological Essay*. London: Burns & Oats, 1966.

Congar, Yves MJ., *The Meaning of Tradition.* San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 2004.

Doyle, Dennis M., *The Church Emerging from Vatican II. A Popular Approach to Contemporary Catholicism*. Connecticut: Twenty Third Publications, 1993.

Francis, Pope, *Evangelii Gaudium. Apostolic Exhortation on the Proclamation of the Gospel in Today's World*. Roma: Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 2013.

Fullenbach, John, *Church Community for the Kingdom*. New York: Orbis books, 2002.

Hurtado, Larry W., *One God One Lord. Early Christian Devotion and Ancient Jewish Monotheism*. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1988.

_____, *Lord Jesus Christ. Devotion to Jesus in Earliest Christianity*. Michigan/Cambridge, U.K: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2003.

Gaillardetz, Richard R., By What Authority. *A Primer on Scripture, the Magisterium, and the Sense of the Faithful*. Collegeville, Minnesota: Liturgical Press, 2003.

O'Collins, Gerald, *Believing in the Resurrection*. New York: Paulist Press, 2011.

Osborne, Kenan B., The *Resurrection of Jesus. New Considerations for its Theological Interpretation*. New York: Paulist Press, 1997.

Rausch, Thomas P., *Who is Jesus. An Introduction to Christology*. Philippines: Claretians Publications, 2005.

Thiel, John E., *Senses of Tradition. Continuity and Development in Catholic Faith*. , Oxford University Press, 2000.

Thomas P. Rausch, *Authority and Leadership in the Church. Past Directions and Future Possibilities*. Wilmington Delaware: Michael Glazier, 1989.

Tillard, JMR., *Flesh of the Church. Flesh of Christ. At the Source of the Ecclesiology of Communion*. Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 2001.

Sullivan,Francis A., *Magisterium. Teaching Authority in the Catholic Church*. New York: Paulist Press, 1983.

Sullivan, Francis A., *The Church We Believe in. One, Holy, Catholic and Apostolic*. New York: Paulist Press, 1988.