e-ISSN: 2656-7997
p-ISSN: 2775-3425

The Impact of Covid-19 on The Understanding and Perceiving of The Eucharist in The Indonesian Catholic Church

Emanuel Pranawa Dhatu Martasudjita [a,1]
Yohanes Subali [a,2]
Paulus Erwin Sasmito [a,3,*]

Faculty of Theology, Universitas Sanata Dharma [a]

martasudjita@usd.ac.id [1]
yohanessubali@usd.ac.id [2]
winsasmita@gmail.com [3]

corresponding author [*]

Submitted: 29-03-2023 | Accepted: 31-07-2023

Abstract:

Covid-19 has changed the order of people's lives in society all over the world, this also includes the Catholic Church's order of living. One of the effects that Catholics feel, be that those living in cities or the outskirts is the initiating of online Eucharist masses. As experienced by the Catholic Church all over the world, the Catholic Church in Indonesia experiences inevitable adaptations in regard to applying both online and offline masses. This article is a result of research regarding the understanding and perceiving of the Catholics towards online and offline masses during the times of the Covid-19 pandemic in one of the provinces in the Republic of Indonesia, which includes both urban and rural areas. This research utilizes a mixed method namely quantitative and qualitative through theological, and liturgical approaches. The result of the research shows that generally Catholics still comprehend and perceive offline Masses as something important, but several people are beginning to get used to online Masses which causes inclinations towards perceiving both online and offline Masses as two sides of the same coin.

Keywords:

offline Mass, online Mass, covid-19, understanding of Eucharist, perceiving of Eucharist.

DOI: https://doi.org/10.24071/jaot.v5i2.6171
Web: http://e-journal.usd.ac.id/index.php/JAOT| E: jaot@usd.ac.id

This work licensed under CC BY-SA
Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License

Introduction

The Covid-19 pandemic which started at the beginning of 2020 all over the world has greatly impacted almost all aspects of people's lives. People all over the world feel the huge impact of this pandemic in all aspects of their lives which include the economic, social aspects as well as health care, food, tourism, transportation, education, and even in the spiritual and religious field. Such is also the case in Indonesia. To prevent the spread of Covid-19, many countries apply the lockdown regulation along with its implications. The Indonesian government does not apply the lockdown regulation considering that the whole Indonesian Republic consists of islands. With a region that reaches a width of over 1,910,931.32 sq km and islands consisting of 17.504 islands (*Statistical Yearbook of Indonesia* 2012), the Indonesian government chose to apply the regulation of restricting social activities to maintain a balance between efforts to hinder the spread of covid-19 and attempts to increase healthy economic growth. Such a policy also has implications for the implementation of religious activities in the lives of people in Indonesia.

During the early days of the pandemic, which was around March until June 2020, the Indonesian government prohibited all forms of communal religious activities such as the act of worship in mosques, churches, temples, and many others, to disallow the spread of Covid-19. As time passed, when the spread of the virus started to be under control and began to decrease in July and August 2020, the government allowed leniency by allowing offline religious activities in places of worship although within a very restricted number and under the regulation of a very strict health protocol. Based on the Church's Decree in the time of Covid-19 [II]), The Indonesian Catholic church began to hold online Masses since the start of the pandemic while live streaming of Masses on television has been commonly held for so long in the Catholic church. However, such live streaming Masses through television are usually broadcasted only during big religious days such as Christmas and Easter, and they are more regarded as televised spectacles for Catholics in Indonesia considering the broadcasted Mass is a Mass led by the Pope in the Vatican. With the pandemic situation which enforced people to not go to Church to celebrate the Eucharist, online masses became the only way for people to conduct worship during the times of service in churches that are fully restricted. However, when leniency over the

restrictions was granted, in which offline Masses are allowed to be held although with restrictions on the number of people, online Masses are still offered as an alternative, especially to those prone to being infected which includes elders and minors.

As the pandemic has been going on for more than a year, from the observations and interviews of several Parish Priests in some parts of Indonesia, there is an impression regarding the shift of understanding and perceiving of people towards such a form of Mass. During the time between March and June 2020, Mass service for Catholics in the Catholic Church in Indonesia were practically held online, this is to consider the Indonesian Government's regulation to ban all sorts of activity that involves a crowd gathering. However, since July 2020, the government provided a leeway for people's activity by giving permission for offline religious activities with the condition that the number of people must not be over 50% of the capacity as well as implementing very strict health protocols. This regulation was implemented in all layers of society be that Muslims, Christians, Buddhists, Hindus, or Confucians. As such, starting from July 2020, Catholics from all the dioceses in Indonesia were allowed to follow Masses online or offline in Churches, though very restricted to a certain number of people with invitations and those enlisted. Meanwhile, online Masses still continue especially for those who are unable to come to attend offline Masses in the Church.

Research Questions

The resumption of offline masses at the beginning of July 2020 was not necessarily welcomed ceremoniously and enthusiastically by the people. Several parish priests from urban and rural areas in Indonesia gave witness that the people attending the Mass on Sundays in the Church during this time of pandemic was only around 30% - 40% of the total number of people who are permitted and able to attend the Mass offline in Church (closed discussion October 2020). After almost a year from March 2020 up to March 2021 during this time of the Covid-19 pandemic, Catholics have started to get used to the choice of following the Mass, whether to follow Masses offline like how it has been conducted these times. There are symptoms that Catholics are getting used to online masses and they even enjoy it. However, how do Catholics themselves understand and perceive these two types of masses in the

times of the pandemic still becomes a question? These then became the core question of this research: How do Catholics understand these offline and online Masses; how do these impact their faith? How do they appreciate the presence of Christ in online and offline Masses? And then, how does the online and offline Mass affect Catholics' daily lives?

Theoretical Review

This research on the understanding and appreciation of the people for the celebration of the Eucharist during this pandemic from a theological, liturgical, and psychological point of view, stems from the practice of celebrating the Eucharist that occurs in society. This approach is a form of contextual theology because the concrete life context of the faithful becomes the starting point and *locus theologicus* of theological reflection. In the field of sacrament theology, a contextual approach like this is also used in various places, especially through the method of liturgical theology. Liturgical theology in the field of sacramental theology is widely developed among English-speaking circles, such as in the United States (K. Irwin, 2003, pp. 465-479). Sacrament theology that uses a liturgical theology approach is principally a systematic theological reflection that stems from the liturgical celebration of the faithful which is then communicated with the teachings of the Church and the theological views of theologians in the entire Catholic tradition (K.Irwin, 2005, p. 19). This way of doing theology with liturgical theology is discussed in detail, for example in Kevin Irwin's article: *Context and Text: Method in Liturgical Theology* (K. Irwin, 1994). One of Kevin Irwin's important works dealing with liturgical theology related to the celebration of the Eucharist is entitled *Models of the Eucharist* (K. Irwin, 2005). Through this book, Irwin examines what is celebrated in the celebration of the Eucharist, as revealed through words, prayers, symbols, and rituals. From this research, he concludes that there are 10 models of understanding and living the Eucharist as it is celebrated in the celebration of the Eucharist.

Irwin argues that a Catholic's understanding and appreciation of the Eucharist can be approached according to an ancient adage: *lex orandi* and *lex credendi*, but later added *lex vivendi* (K. Irwin, 2005). So here, the liturgical theology approach focuses on which material to study, namely

with these three laws: *lex orandi, lex credendi*, and *lex vivendi*. The three laws refer to the following steps: the law of prayer or what is prayed for or celebrated (*orandi*) expresses what is believed or understood (*lex credendi*), and what is understood (should) be manifested in what is lived or lived in the steps of daily practice with the community or society (lex vivendi). By using the focus of the three laws (*lex*), this research will pay attention to what people celebrate at Mass online and offline, and from there it will be explored how they understand the Holy Mass, and then live it in the life of the church and society.

The three laws, namely *lex orandi, lex credendi*, and *lex vivendi* as conveyed by Kevin Irwin are in line with concepts in the field of psychology known as Bloom's taxonomy. Bloom's taxonomy is a concept in psychology proposed by Benjamin Samuel Bloom to describe the three domains of human behavior that should be cultivated and developed. The three domains are (a) the cognitive domain - which emphasizes intellectual aspects, such as understanding, knowledge, and understanding; (b) the affective domain - which emphasizes aspects of feeling or emotion, such as attitude, appreciation, and taste; and (c) the psychomotor domain - which emphasizes the motoric skill aspects which include actions, behavior, and practice (Bloom, 1956).

The three realms of Bloom's taxonomy can be used as a psychological perspective to dig deeper into what is understood, felt, embodied, and lived by the people during the Eucharistic celebration during the pandemic. The cognitive domain is in line with Irwin's idea of *lex credendi* which aims to refer to what is understood or understood about the celebration of the Eucharist. This is also in line with the cognitive function of the liturgy proposed by Wikstrom (Wikstrom, 2014). Wikstrom formulated four psychological functions of religious experience in liturgical celebrations, namely: (a) cognitive function: giving meaning/comprehensive answers to human existential questions; (b) the function of emotion: providing a sense of security, guaranteeing certainty of the presence and inclusion of God in human life; (c) ethical function: providing guidelines and moral demands in doing good, for example regarding forgiveness and repentance; and (d) expressive function: fostering feelings of adore, awe, gratitude, and joy when confronted with the sacred with various symbols and rituals. The affective domain is similar to Irwin's idea of *lex orandi* which refers to what is celebrated, felt and experienced in prayers during the celebration of the Eucharist. In Wikstrom's concept

of psychological functions, this realm is included in the emotional and expressive functions of the liturgy. The psycho-motoric domain is congruent with Irwin's concept of *lex vivendi* which refers to what is lived, lived, done, and practised in daily concrete actions. Wiktstrom incorporates this realm into the ethical function of a liturgy.

The psychological functions of this Eucharistic celebration suppose a real encounter between the faithful who actively participates in a whole series of rituals led by an ordained minister (priest or bishop) in a physical (factual) space in a church building. The question is, how are the experience and religious appreciation of the faithful when celebrating Mass online due to the Covid-19 pandemic situation? However, the religious experience and appreciation of the faithful when celebrating Mass offline with the movement and singing is also limited. Is it possible for people to still get answers and a comprehensive understanding of faith on the basic questions in their lives (cognitive function)? Do people still feel the certainty of the real presence and inclusion of God in online/ virtual Mass (emotional function)? Can online Masses move people to repentance, forgiveness, and other Christian ethical-moral actions (ethical functions)? Can the online Mass thrill and touch the deepest emotions of the faithful so that it can eventually lead to the experience of gratitude (expressive function)? Questions related to these psychological functions will be explored further in this study.

Method

Procedure:

This study uses a mixed sequential explanatory method to obtain quantitative and qualitative data related to the theological, liturgical, and psychological understanding and appreciation of Catholics in Indonesia during the Eucharistic celebration during the pandemic (Cresswell, 2009). There are two stages of data collection and analysis in this study. In the first stage, the researchers collected data quantitatively through a survey method using Google Forms. The questionnaire contained questions related to the understanding and appreciation of the people in the celebration of the Eucharist, which is reviewed theologically, liturgically, and psychologically. Quantitative data was collected using the survey questionnaire method from March 19 - April 9, 2021. In the

second stage, based on the results of quantitative data, the researchers collected qualitative data using in-depth interviews (deep interviews) from May - June 2021. Researchers involved 5 students of the Faculty of Theology, Sanata Dharma University to conduct direct interviews with 10 respondents based on purpose sampling. The interview transcripts were then interpreted and integrated to support and enrich the data results from the quantitative research in the first phase.

The sequential explanatory mixed method in this study presupposes that there are two stages of data analysis. In the first part, the quantitative data obtained by the survey method from the participants were analyzed using the descriptive quantitative method (Fowler, 2002). This quantitative data analysis was then synthesized with qualitative data analysis. This study uses six steps of qualitative data analysis from Creswell to identify emerging themes. The results of this qualitative analysis process strengthen and clarify the results of the quantitative data analysis in the first stage which is a priority in this research.

Measures:

The survey method in the first stage of this study used four measuring instruments in the form of self-administered questionnaires using a Likert scale to determine: (a) motivation; (b) understanding; (c) appreciation; and (d) the fruits of participating in the Eucharistic Celebration during the pandemic. Each item is rated on a 4-point scale: (1) strongly disagree; (2) disagree; (3) agree; and (4) strongly agree. Regarding motivation, there are 10 statement items that were compiled to determine the motivation of participants in attending mass during the pandemic. For example: “I was forced to attend Mass online because I couldn’t attend Mass at church”. Regarding understanding in following the Eucharist during a pandemic; There are also 10 item scales which include “In my opinion, Mass during this pandemic can be replaced with the rosary or other personal prayers at home”. There are also 10 items to find out how far people’s appreciation is in participating in the Eucharistic Celebration during the pandemic. For example: “I can’t enliven the online masses during this pandemic”. Regarding the fruits of the Eucharist, there are 10 items statements. For example: “My life is still blessed, it’s the same whether it’s online or offline mass”.

Participants:

There are two stages of recruitment of participants involved in this study. In the first stage, the collection of quantitative data using the survey method involved a random sample of 1,776 Catholics spread across Indonesia, particularly in Yogyakarta and Central Java. In the second stage, qualitative data collection with the recruitment technique of 'purposive sampling' involved 10 people (Tongco, 2007). Stratification (gender, education level, age, and place of residence) is considered to obtain a proportional percentage of the entire population related to the theological, liturgical, and psychological understanding, appreciation, and fruit of the eucharist during a pandemic (Palinkas, et.al., 2015). By category of parish origin, 25.8% (458 people) were from rural parishes; and 74.2% (1,318 people) are from urban parishes. It can be understood that participants from urban parishes dominated this study because the survey method in this study uses Google Forms. Whatsapp as a social media is also most accessible in urban areas. In terms of age, respondents under 18 years old were 0.8% (14 people); aged 18-25 years 4.1% (73 people); aged 26-35 years 7.9% (139 people); aged 36-45 years 17.9% (317 people); aged over 64 years 11.4% (201 people); those aged 46-65 years 57.9% (1,023 people). As for the level of education, only a small percentage of elementary school graduates 0.5% (8 people); respondents whose last education level was junior high school were 1.7% (30 people); high school graduates as many as 26.3% (463 people); 15.4% vocational school graduates (272 people); the majority of graduates from bachelor's degree as much as 43.5% (766 people); and those whose last several education levels were postgraduate as many as 12.6% (222 people). Meanwhile, in terms of gender, the respondents involved in this study were quite balanced; namely men as many as 46% (814 people); while women were 53.9% (953 people). Then, related to the type of work, the highest percentage is private employees 19.8% (350 people). There are relatively quite a lot of retirees involved in this study, namely 16.7% (295 people). While others are self-employed people which are as many as 14.1% (249 people); Teachers/ Lecturers as many as 13.6% (241 people); 9.5% of which are civil servants (167 people); housewives as many as 13% (230 people); the rest are police-officers, the armed forces, university students, farmers, laborers, drivers, and others.

Results

Table 1 presents an overview of the survey results related to the motivation to participate in the Eucharistic Celebration and the understanding, appreciation, and fruit of the Eucharist as initiated by Kevin Irwin in his concept of *lex orandi, lex credendi*, and *lex vivendi*.

Table 1. Assessing the motivation, understanding, perceiving, and the fruits of Eucharist

(N = 1,776)

		Strongly Disagree (%)	Dis-agree (%)	Agree (%)	Strongly Agree (%)
A.	Motivation to celebrate the Eucharist				
1	I am forced to follow the online Mass because I cannot follow the Mass in church	9.1	22.1	46.8	22.1
2	I follow the online Mass happily because it is practical and easy	11.2	40	38	10.8
3	I like to follow the online Mass because I can choose the priest by myself and where to hold the Mass	11.2	46	9	33.8

B.	The Understanding of the Eucharist				
1	In my opinion, Masses during the pandemic can be replaced with reciting the Rosary and other forms of personal prayers at home	25.6	53.1	16.4	4.9
2	I do not go to Masses at church during the pandemic because God can also be welcomed through online Masses which are available on the internet, television and radio	14.2	40.7	38.7	6.3
3	I am certain that the spiritual communion through online Masses has no difference with the sacramental communion which is received at church	9.3	41.1	41.5	8
C.	Appreciation towards the Eucharist				
1	I can still feel the presence of the same Christ the Lord both in online or offline Masses	2.5	22.8	57.6	17.1
2	I can only feel satisfaction if I receive communion in the offline mass at church	2.8	23	47.5	26.7
3	I enjoy online Masses at home because I can do other more important and urgent matters at home	38.9	55.4	4.4	1.3

D.	The Fruits of The Eucharist				
1	My life is still as blessed as both joining online or offline Masses	1.3	15.4	62.5	19.6
2	I feel full gratitude and fervor after I attend online Masses	1.3	14.7	69.6	14.5
3	For me faith is a personal matter between me and God, so both online and offline Masses are one of the same thing for me	10	40.9	38.2	11

The results of the quantitative data in the first stage became the basis for exploring the qualitative data in the second stage with in-depth questions. The results of this qualitative data are collaborated in the discussion section of this study.

Discussion

The focus of this research is on how the understanding and appreciation of Catholics in Indonesia which includes rural and urban areas is related to offline and online Masses during this covid-19 pandemic. In terms of motivation in celebrating the Eucharist, it was found that most of the people felt compelled to attend online Masses (A.1: agree and strongly agree: 68.9%). This expression has been clarified through interviews with informants who stated that the feeling of compulsion was especially true at the beginning of the pandemic, considering that online Masses were something new. *"But because of circumstances, what can be done is to join the (online) Eucharist so there is no other way, just follow what is available. In terms of certainty, yes, stay strong, come to church"* (informant. 5). But what's interesting is that in later developments, people are getting used to it and some even say that they feel happy with online Mass (agree and strongly agree 48%). This was +also recognized in the results of interviews with informants.1, *"(online mass) .... practically, people don't need to go out, they don't need to spend energy to come to church, simply at home with available tools, they can attend mass"*. For those who like online Masses, an answer was found stating the reason, namely because they can choose their priest who presides over the Mass and chooses place to hold the Mass (A.3: agree and strongly agree 42.8). However, in terms of this motivation, those who like online Masses become less (no.2: agree and strongly agree: 48.8%) than those who do not like it (A.2: disagree and strongly disagree: 50.2%). This means that from the motivation it appears that there are still many people who crave for the offline Mass at church more than those who are satisfied with online Masses.

The people's appreciation for the importance of the Mass can be seen from the data on their understanding of the Mass which cannot be replaced with other devotional prayers (B.1: disagree and strongly disagree 78.7%). Concerning encountering God at online Masses, the majority of the people disagreed if it was a reason not to go to offline Masses at church (B.2: disagree and strongly disagree 54.9%). This is a good sign that people are still prioritizing live Masses at church over online Masses. This was confirmed by the respondent's answer regarding the appreciation of the stability of receiving Communion even during offline Masses at church (C.2: agree and strongly agree 74.2%). A feeling

of being more satisfied to receive sacramental communion through an offline Mass is also revealed by several people in deep interviews. *"If you want to choose, it's the same. But I tend to go offline because I can receive the body of Christ directly."* (Informant.2); and informants. 3, *"... If you can have it offline, why do you have to be online, if you can eat God directly, why do you have to do it virtually"*. Appreciation towards the seriousness of attending the Holy Mass is also considered important for most respondents. This was revealed, for example, with the answers of respondents who did not agree to attend online Masses while doing other things even though it was urgent (C.3: disagree and strongly disagree 94.3%)

The findings that can be discussed are the balanced number of answers for the understanding that views that spiritual communion through online Masses and sacramental communion through offline Masses are the same (B.3: disagree and strongly disagree 50.4%, while those who agree and strongly agree 49.5%). On the one hand, there is already a priority concerning offline Masses in the church over online Masses which still seems to be strong among the faithful, and on the other hand, there are more and more people who understand spiritual communion in the context of online Masses which are considered tantamount to the sacramental communion as received in the offline Mass. The view that equates spiritual communion through online Masses to sacramental communion through offline Masses above seems to find its reason in the respondents' answers to questions regarding the Eucharist. Most people experience the same presence of Christ, whether in online Masses or offline Masses (C.1: agree and strongly agree 74%). This is also confirmed in the results of deep interviews with several informants, both from rural areas (Informant. 1: "...I see it as the same thing. God is present in various ways, although online and offline, I think it's because God is omnipotent, I think we also believe in our hearts and believe that whatever form God takes, he will still be present in the eucharist..."), as well as from urban areas (Informant 5: *"In terms of value, it's actually the same, communion is given at church or home"*). Generally, people do not distinguish the presence of Christ in the Eucharist sacramentally through offline Mass or from within through online Masses. This finding is interesting to discuss because in the teaching of the Catholic Church on the sacramental presence of Christ in the Eucharist is the most special form of presence which indeed goes beyond the mere presence of

Christ in inner communion as in online Mass (cf. Ecclesia de Eucharistia art.15). Is it a matter of lack of catechesis so that the Church's teaching regarding the specialness of the sacramental presence of Christ in the Eucharist is poorly understood, or is it that people are finding it increasingly difficult to distinguish the sacramental and the presence of Christ from within so that the two forms of presence are considered the same?

The tendency to equate the form of Christ's presence in offline Mass in church and online Mass seems to parallel the findings regarding the fruits of the Eucharist. Most people agree with the statement that their lives are still blessed with online and offline Masses (D.1: agree and strongly agree 82.1%). That is, people do not differentiate the influence of offline or online Masses. The two kinds of mass have the same effect in everyday life. Even they are still excited and grateful after attending Mass online (D.2: agree and strongly agree 84.1%). From deep interviews, data was obtained that generally, people feel the impact of the power of the Holy Mass on their social activities. It's just that people do not differentiate, which one has a greater impact on their social life than offline Mass or online Mass. "Same … yes still the same … depends on our hearts. God is present everywhere. …. if we have mass, it just unites like electricity. In my opinion, you know, after that, the more we have the power to change" (Informant. 9). However, the respondents were almost evenly divided in their answers regarding the meaning of faith as a personal matter, as 49.2% agreed and strongly agreed, and 50.9% disagreed and strongly disagreed. This is also worth discussing considering the Church's view which teaches that the first and foremost celebration of the Eucharist is the Mass directly held in a church, that is, "assembly around the altar" (Lumen Gentium art. 26) and such a Mass should have an impact towards the daily life, namely "to practice in their daily life what they gain in faith" (Sacrosanctum Concilium art. 2), and the Mass is a joint celebration and not a matter of personal faith (Sacrosanctum Concilium art. 26).

Conclusion

For the Catholic Church, the celebration of the Eucharist is truly seen as the source and the pinnacle of life for all Christians (Lumen Gentium art. 11). In fact, all other activities of the Church's life,

such as proclamation, communion, service, and various daily social activities, find their culmination of purpose and at the same time their source of strength in liturgical celebrations, especially the Eucharist (Sacrosanctum Concilium art. 10). The Covid-19 pandemic that cut across the globe has changed almost all aspects of lives. Likewise, this pandemic has had an impact on the understanding and appreciation of the Eucharist for Catholics, especially with the emergence of online Masses which have become another alternative after for centuries the Catholic Church has only known Masses being conducted in churches. Considering the importance of the Eucharist or Holy Mass, this research was thus conducted. The places and people studied are indeed limited to one area in the territory of Indonesia. However, the results of this study can provide an overview of the understanding and appreciation of offline and online Masses of Catholics who are in an archipelagic country with a population that is so plural and with the vast majority of Muslims. The following conclusions are expected to enrich the readers at a wider level.

First conclusion: Catholics are still very much looking forward to and prioritizing offline Mass. The longing to be able to attend Mass in person in the church continues to burn. This opinion appears clearly in the results of deep interviews with almost all respondents. Indeed, this is good news for the ministers of the Church. It means that the significance of the celebration of the Eucharist is still alive in the hearts of the faithful, especially in the Indonesian Catholic Church. Whether this view is held simultaneously for Catholics in urban and rural areas has not been specifically investigated. However, from our experience as Indonesian researchers, the condition of Catholics as a minority amid a strong religious atmosphere from Muslims who are the majority which has great influences [THIS SENTENCE SEEMS INCOMPLETE OR NEEDS FURTHER CLARIFICATION] Inspired by the strong religious atmosphere of the Muslims, the life of faith and worship of Catholics in Indonesia is also very alive and strong. This can be said to be a kind of a *blessing in disguise* regarding the faith life of Catholics in Indonesia, compared perhaps to other more secular places or countries.

The second conclusion is a symptom that shows the difficulty of the people in distinguishing the form of Christ's presence in offline and online Masses. On the one hand, there are Catholics who prioritize receiving communion in a sacramental manner, but on the other hand, the presence of Christ in both forms of Mass, offline or online, tends to be understood the same way. People recognize the privilege of sacramental communion,

moreover, psychologically the reception of sacramental communion is truly felt from the emotional and expressive function compared to mere spiritual communion. However, the theological meaning, especially the sacramental and liturgical meaning of the special presence of Christ in the form of bread and wine (Eucharist) is not well understood by the faithful. This is where the need for Church servants to provide adequate catechesis on the meaning of Christ's presence and various forms of His presence (Kubicki, 2006). In the catechesis, it is necessary to clearly define the special presence of Christ in the Eucharist. The Second Vatican Council has stated the teaching of the Catholic Church which clearly recognizes the various forms of Christ's presence, but at the same time mentions the special presence of Christ in the form of the Eucharist (Sacrosanctum Concilium art. 7).

The third conclusion is the belief of the people who say that the two forms of Masses are the same in influencing their daily lives. This indistinguishable effect of offline Mass and online Mass for services and social activities raises pertinent sacramentological-liturgical questions considering that the Church has always understood the Eucharist as the source and peak of Christian life (*Lumen Gentium art. 11*), and the Eucharist here, of course, means offline Masses. Online masses can certainly help people in appreciating their faith. This is clear. However, the Church views that participation in liturgical celebrations through mass media communication "does not fulfill the obligation to attend Mass" because "visual images can indeed represent reality, but they never really produce it" (Sacramentum Caritatis art. 57). Thus, attending Mass online on Sunday should not be thought of as a substitute for an offline Mass. Online Mass is indeed permitted and supported by the Church because there are situations and conditions such as during the pandemic, when it is necessary to limit community activities to prevent the transmission of COVID-19. But the dangers of online Mass must be realized because "the ideal of the Church is always with the people and with the sacraments", as Pope Francis said (The Catholic Weekly, April 20, 2020). Facing the understanding and appreciation of the people who simply equate the influence of the offline Mass and the online Mass, the Church needs to develop an observant and effective catechesis so that the centre of the offline Mass in the entire life of the Church is realized again by the faithful.

Limitations

Research on the theological, liturgical, and psychological understanding and appreciation of the people towards the offline and online Mass has several limitations. Firstly, this study uses a *self-report instrument* in collecting quantitative survey data in the first stage. Through the *self-report instrument*, respondents have the opportunity to assess themselves, especially regarding their understanding and appreciation of celebrating the Eucharist. It is realized that the survey using *the self-report instrument* opens the possibility of being biased due to the tendency of respondents to give the best answer, not the truth (*social desirability*). The tendency to give the best answers and what most people want (social desirability) can also occur during interviews. However, this limitation has been overcome in such a way by involving Sanata Dharma University theology students. Secondly, the survey on the Eucharistic Celebration received little interest among young people and youth.

The data shows that only a small proportion of adolescents and young people were involved in this survey research. This means that this study cannot capture the views of the group of respondents aged teenagers and young people. Thirdly, this study found it difficult to reach those who are inactive, both in attending Masses online and offline. When looking for participants with these criteria to be interviewed, the researchers experienced difficulties even though they had collaborated with parish priests. Their information about the Eucharist will certainly enrich the data found from this research which can later become valuable inputs related to pastoral policy. Fourthly, this research was conducted on the island of Java, one of the many islands in Indonesia. This particularity of demographics, culture, and situation is very limited to capturing the entire multicultural society of Indonesia, let alone photographing the modern urban society of Indonesia.

References

Bevans. St.B.2022, *Teologi Kontekstual*, terjemahan dari *Models of Contextual Theology* oleh Yosef Maria Florisan, Maumere: Ledalero.

Bloom, B. S. ed. et al. (1956). *Taxonomy of Educational Objectives: Handbook 1, Cognitive Domain*. New York: David McKay.

Catholic New Service. 2020. "*Pope warns of danger in online Masses"* in *The Catholic Weekly*. https://www.catholicweekly.com.au/pope-warns-of-danger-in-online-masses/

Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*: Sage.

Creswell, J.W. (2009). *Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches. Third Edition*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Fowler, E.J. (2002). *Survey Research Methods (3rd ed.)*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Irwin.K. 2005. *Models of the Eucharist*, New York/Mahwah, N.J.: Paulist Press.

Irwin.K.1994. *Context and Text: Method in Liturgical Theology*. Collegeville: The Liturgical.

Irwin.K.2003. "Sacramental Theology", dalam New Catholic Encyclopedia, 2nd ed., vol.12. Washington DC: The Catholic University of America Press, New York: Thompson Glade, 2003, 465-479.

Judith M. Kubicki CSSF. 2006. *The Presence of Christ in the Gathered Assembly*, New York-London: Continuum.

Owe Wikstrom. (2014). Liturgy as Experience — the Psychology of Worship A Theoretical and Empirical Lacuna. *DOI:10.30674/scripta.67207Corpus ID: 55428972*.

Palinkas, L. A., Horwitz, S. M., Green, C. A., Wisdom, J. P., Duan, N., & Hoagwood, K. (2015). HHS Public Access. *Adm Policy Ment Health*, 42(5), 533–544. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10488-013-0528-y.

Pusat Penelitian Pengembangan Teologi Kontekstual USD.2020. "Wajah Baru Gereja Keuskupan Agung Semarang dalam dan paska Pandemi Covid-19".

Tongco, M. D. C. (2007). Purposive sampling as a tool for informant selection. *Ethnobotany Research and Applications, 5*, 147–158. https://doi.org/10.17348/era.5.0.147-158.

The Church Documents:

Sacrosanctum Concilium (This Sacred Council), the Constitution of the Second Vatican Council on the Sacred Liturgy, promulgated by Pope Paul VI on

4 December 1963.

Lumen Gentium (Light of the Nations), the Dogmatic Constitution of the Second Vatican Council on the Church, promulgated by Pope Paul VI on 21 November 1964.

Ecclesia de Eucharistia (The Church from the Eucharist), an encyclical by Pope John Paul II, published on 17 April 2003.

Sacramentum Caritatis (The Sacrament of Charity), an apostolic exhortation by Pope Benedict XVI, signed on 22 February 2007.