



International Journal of Humanity Studies
<http://e-journal.usd.ac.id/index.php/IJHS>
Sanata Dharma University, Yogyakarta, Indonesia

**THE MYTH OF FEMALE BEAUTY:
STUDY OF REPRESENTATION TOWARD POST-NEW ORDER
NOVELS WRITTEN BY MALES**

Lelu Dina Apristia

Universitas Gadjah Mada

lelu.dina.a@mail.ugm.ac.id

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.24071/ijhs.2019.020204>

Received 2 February 2019; revised 12 February 2019; accepted 18 February 2019

Abstract

Males representing female beauty without experiencing to be real females in post-New Order era become the background of this study. This study is aimed: (1) to identify female beauty in post-New Order era represented by male writers, (2) to identify factors forming the representation. To achieve the aims, this study is done by applying Stuart Hall's representation theory which is not only about meaning produced through language and knowledge produced through discourse, but also about revealing patriarchal structure containing in discourse. After applying Stuart Hall's representation theory, it is found that female beauty in post-New Order era is not the same as the one in New Order era. Male writers represent that beautiful females in post-New Order are the ones whose body attracting other people and who struggle for freedom. The representation is formed by male writers in relation with males in post-New Order era and in discursive formation in post-New Order siding with males to keep masculine domination.

Keywords: representation, female beauty, freedom, post-New Order, male writers, masculine domination

Introduction

Literary work is produced in society. That is based on the explanation of Bourdieu (1995: 229), "The producer of the value of work of art is not the artist but the field of production as a universe of belief which produces the value of the work of art." Therefore, literary work as part of art contains values that reflect society.

Literary work containing the reflection of society is bound of space and time as stated by Hall (1990: 222), "We all write and speak from a particular place and time, from a history and a culture which is specific. What we say is always 'in context', positioned." Writers always work in context. It means that the change of space and time influences writers when they produce literary work.

One of the topics in society reflected by writers in their works is beauty. Anthony (2008: 90) states, "The cult of beauty [...] is a feminine cult."

Meanwhile, Burns (2007: 3) states that standard of beauty is imposed on females by society. Hence, discussion about beauty cannot be separated from females.

Beautiful means attractive face. Attractive itself means form, figure, et cetera that looks good and harmonious (Tim Penyusun Kamus, 2008: 260), so beauty can be stated as a concept about physical of female that is beautiful. Females have known the concept since early age as explained by Burns (2007: 3):

A female newborn and an elderly woman may share the same physical characteristics but only one is considered beautiful by the artificial standard by which society measures beauty.

Thus, standard of beauty relating with physical is reference for females to interpret themselves as parts of society.

If a lot of life aspects of society members both males and females change constantly, then standard of beauty referred by females is not permanent. Umberto Eco in Novita (2010: 8) states that definition of beautiful changes from time to time. To be defined beautiful, females keep adapting to the change of standard of beauty.

Standard of female beauty in a period of time and space is different with the one in another period of time and space. It means that standard of female beauty in this world varies. Burns (2007: 5) explains, "Trying to pick just one to represent all of us [women] is just not possible [...] The resulting standard of female beauty would therefore to be a myth." Therefore, contestation of standard of female beauty is unavoidable.

Female beauty can be contested in literary work, especially novel. Novel is narration having been liked by society since childhood, because novel has language which is easy to understand (Sumardjo, 1999: 11). Remy Sylado also known as Alif Danya Munsyi (2012: 176-177) states that novel writers as narrators describe life and enclose their personal thoughts through the characters of their works. In other words, writers can represent their concepts about female beauty explicitly in novels to be understood by society.

Moreover in Indonesia in post-New Order era, especially after Soeharto released his position as President of the Republic of Indonesia on May 21, 1998, society is free from repression that has occurred for 32 years (Heryanto, 2012: 109; Sudirman, 2014: 450). Society achieves freedom of expression. It constructs the freedom of novelists in narrating various concepts of female beauty.

Novelists can emphasize physical female beauty in post-New Order era as applied in New Order era. To be categorized as beautiful, females must be young and—if it is possible—virgin or single (Suherman, 1998: 156). Ibrahim (1998: 375) states that being old is unforgivable sin. According to him, females are 'crazy' about aerobics, plastic surgery, facial cream, and other physical treatments to stay beautiful. That kind of beauty adds attractiveness of female.

On one side, the attractiveness brings in recognition and earning for females. Sobary (1998: 26) states that females who are given high honorarium because of their beauty shown in an advertisement symbolize honor for them indeed. But on the other side, commercial star beauty that tempts males brings in harassment (Sobary, 1998: 26-27). In connection with harassment, Piliang (1998: xv) explains that females whose bodies 'stripped naked' through thousand varieties of gesture,

style, appearance, and ‘personality’ construct and naturalize their bodies socially and culturally as fetish objects that mean ‘adored’ objects because they are considered to have the strength of ‘charm’ including certain excitement, desire, love. So, the position of females as objects is resulted by physical female beauty.

Nevertheless, novelists can also stress non-physical female beauty as expressed by Burns (2007: 6) in her book titled *Soul Beautiful, Naturally* that there is real beauty that is sourced from the soul, so real beauty can be mentioned as soul beauty that shines brighter along with age. Soul beauty is not temporary. In other words, it is permanent.

Whereas, Hall (1997: 32) argues:

All meanings are produced within history and culture [...] This opens representation to the constant ‘play’ or slippage of meaning, to the constant production of new meanings.

There is no permanent meaning or concept, especially about female beauty, in dynamic society. However, Burns makes society know about standard of beauty that does not always focus on beautiful physical in young age.

The novels chosen as the samples of study are *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa* (1999) written by Remy Sylado and *Blakanis* (2008) written by Arswendo Atmowiloto. Through *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa* (1999) that contains narration about Tinung—very famous *ca-bau-kan* or prostitute in Kali Jodo, Remy Sylado was awarded *Penghargaan Sastra dari Komunitas Nobel Indonesia* or *Literary Award from Indonesian Nobel Community* in 2011. Meanwhile, Arswendo Atmowiloto was nominated to get *Kusala Sastra Khatulistiwa* also known as *Khatulistiwa Literary Award* in prose category in 2008 through *Blakanis* (2008) that contains narration about Ai—businessman’s wife that steals the attention of community in Kampung Blakan. In other words, those novels are chosen because they are both published in post-New Order era, successful in society through the award indicating success (Ivancevich et al, 2006: 215), containing narration about females related with beauty, and written by awarded and deservedly popular male novelists.

As beauty, literature section pursued by Remy Sylado and Arswendo Atmowiloto is feminine as explained by Suryakusuma (2012: 366) that literature has already more inclined to be feminine. According to her, it gets inspiration from sense, soul and other non-rational elements. Hence, it is probably free from masculine ideology that is rational, narrow and always trying to be dominant. However, no matter how feminine literary works produced by Remy Sylado and Arswendo Atmowiloto are, Sylado and Atmowiloto do not experience and do not know beauty that is truly desired by females. They are still males who are clung by masculine ideology. In addition, freedom from the ideology is just probability. Therefore, study about female beauty constructed by males in literature section which is feminine in post-New Order era is interesting and important to do.

Based on the explanation above, research problem that arises is males represent female beauty in novels in post-New Order era as democracy era. It arises research questions: (1) How is female beauty represented by Remy Sylado in *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa* and by Arswendo Atmowiloto in *Blakanis*?

(2) Why do Remy Sylado and Arswendo Atmowiloto produce such representation?

Method

This research is the qualitative one. It emphasizes quality over quantity, so method used in it is also qualitative which takes form of document study that is called literary review by Nurgiyantoro (2015: 52). Qualitative research method consists of data collecting method and data analysis method. Coming from document or literature, collected data is descriptive (Creswell, 2013: 293; Moleong, 2011: 11) in the form of words. More about data collecting method, Sudaryanto (2015: 11-12) states that there is data recording, data selecting, and data arranging. So, first step to collect data in this research is recording data from primary data sources which are *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa* written by Remy Sylado and *Blakanis* written by Arswendo Atmowiloto and secondary data source in the form of books, journals, research reports, articles and so on. Second step is selecting data that is needed. Third step is arranging data according to category such as data about beauty representation and data about factors that form the representation.

Next, the collected data is analyzed to get relation between data (Faruk, 2012: 25) according to theory that has already established. Theory used in this research is Stuart Hall's representation theory providing constructionist approach toward representation. Regarding to the approach, first step to do is analyzing data in the form of words as signs representing female beauty in *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa* written by Remy Sylado and *Blakanis* written by Arswendo Atmowiloto that can be considered as knowledge of Sylado and Atmowiloto about female beauty. As explained by Fokkema and KunneIbsch (1977: 44), "Any so-called autonomous interpretation of a literary text that does not take into account its function in the larger socio-cultural context must fail", second step to do for the success of this research is relating knowledge of Sylado and Atmowiloto contained in their works with discourse about beauty that occurs post-New Order society. For the success of this research too, Stuart Hall's representation theory as one of cultural theories that can explain patriarchal domination and oppression structure (Hall, 2011: 43) is applied to identify factors that form knowledge of Sylado and Atmowiloto about female beauty relating with male domination.

Findings and Discussion

Representation of Post-New Order Female Beauty

Post-New Order era is the era expected to be free from authoritarianism of New Order regime that broke Indonesian morality (Ancol, 2004: ix). Furthermore, Ancol (2004: x-xi) explains that Indonesians can directly choose their representatives in parliament or choose their president for the first time. According to him, Indonesians are in new stage of democracy to more free economy, culture, and politics. Chosen directly by Indonesians, government cannot be authoritarian in formulating policy. Government policy accommodates aspirations of Indonesians regarding to economy, culture, politics and other sectors.

Sectors relating with post-New Order female beauty are economy and sexuality, because beautiful females have ability in seducing others to buy a product. Then, libido economy is formed (Piliang, 1998: xv-xvi, xx).

Since New Order era, precisely since *Repelita IV* or Fourth Five-Year Development Plan from 1984 till 1989 and *Repelita V* or Fifth Five-Year Development Plan from 1989 till 1994 were set, females have been given the same right, obligation, and opportunity as males (Suryakusuma, 2012: 114). According to Suryakusuma (2012: 282-284), females come into various development sectors with economic and political reason. Female participation in development driven by economical factor has lasted until post-New Order era. Sigiyo (2012:8) states that females are responsible for nurture and household economy at one time. Thus, discourse rolling in post-New Order era pushes females to be breadwinners as well as males.

Regarding to libido, Indonesians in post-New Order era can realize sexual desire in normative or non-normative sexuality that takes various forms as long as they happen in private area and happen between females and males as justified in *Undang-Undang Pornografi* or Pornography Law set on October 30, 2008 (Suryakusuma, 2012: 415). Davies (2018: 59) argues:

Reaksi-reaksi terhadap pengawasan seksual ini dipandu oleh kepentingan-kepentingan yang berupaya menciptakan subjek seksual yang beragam, sesuai dan berlawanan.

[Reactions toward this sexual control are guided by interests that try to create diverse sexual subjects, corresponding and contradictory]

If controlled sexuality reaps supporting and opposing government, it means that discourse to be free from New Order authoritarianism affects sexuality practiced by post-New Order society.

In the middle of discursive formation that strives for female emancipation, Sylado produces representation that contains female physical qualities through Tinung's character as seen below.

'Lu sih mude, Nung,' kata Saodah. 'Pasti banyak yang naksir. Kalo pas lu dapet cukong, lu tinggal buka baju, lu antepin dienyé nikmatin badan lu, duit bisa segepok. Kalo cukong entu nagih, bisa-bisa lu diapiare kayak si Atim tuh dijadiin ca-bau-kan. Punya rume, perabotan, gelang kalung mas.' (Sylado, 1999: 14)

['You're young, Nung,' Saodah said. 'There must be a lot of men having crush on you. If you get a financier, you just put off your clothes, let him enjoy your body, then you'll get a lot of money. If the financier is hooked on you, you'll be kept as a mistress as happened to Atim. She has house, furniture, gold bracelet and necklace.' (Sylado, 1999: 14)]

Sylado narrates Tinung as soon-to-be young prostitute, so she will be liked by a lot of males. It means Tinung will surely raise male sexual desire. Sylado's narration reflects social viewpoint toward old female as stated by Winarnita (2018: 376) that old female is not sexually attractive and is not appropriate to represent idealized Indonesian female beauty. Sexually attractive is important,

especially for females involved in prostitution which is almost in the same age as human civilization and is hardly destroyed (Trisnadi et al, 2004: 4), including prostitution in post-New Order society. Sexually attractive brings in male who can improve economic condition of prostitutes as expressed by Zalduondo (1999: 311), "Economic factors play diverse roles in the supply and demand sides of commercial sex." By referring to the social viewpoint and narrating Tinung to be sexually attractive, Sylado associates Tinung with income and fulfilment of basic needs such food, clothing, and housing from males who pay for her sexual service.

Beside being narrated young, Tinung is narrated by Sylado as follows.

Setelah kencan pertama ini usai, masih ada lagi malam-malam lain, yang kedua, ketiga, kesepuluh, keduapuluh, dan seterusnya. Tinung pun menjadi perempuan populer di Kali Jodo, dijuluki 'Si Chixiang', bahasa Kuo-Yu artinya 'sangat masyur dan dicari-cari' [...] Pasti itu disebabkan Tinung masih muda dan memiliki tubuh yang indah, langsing, elok, berpadan antara dada dan pinggul (Sylado, 1999: 16)

[After this first date ends, there are still other nights, the second, third, tenth, twentieth, and so on. Tinung becomes popular in Kali Jodo, nicknamed 'Si Chixiang' that means 'very famous and sought after' in Kuo-Yu language [...]] That must be because Tinung is still young and has beautiful body, slim, nice, fit chest and hips (Sylado, 1999: 16)]

Sylado represents Tinung nicknamed 'Si Chixiang' or very well-known and wanted prostitute. In other words, Tinung is a prostitute who has been dated a lot of males in the realm of prostitution named Kali Jodo, because she is young and has beautiful body, slim, nice, fit chest and hips. Sylado's narration refers to females in society who struggle for being slim as stated by Ide (2013: 43) that slim female body is Indonesian female beauty standard built by society and sustained by industry. Slim bodied females attract attention (Melliana S., 2016: 11). Ditmore (2006: 107) explains, "Many clients seek a sex partner in a specific age range, or one whose physical beauty is above average." In the realm of prostitution, young age and beautiful body bring many clients to females who whores. If Sylado's narration shows that young age and beautiful body add attractiveness of females, so post-New Order female beauty is the same as New Order female beauty at first glance.

However, further search shows that beautiful female through Tinung's character in *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa* written by Remy Sylado is not *nrimo* or submissive as females in New Order era (Sobary, 1998: 27). Tinung frees herself from pressure caused by Tan Peng Liang from Gang Tamim, Bandung—one of males keeping Tinung as mistress—and his guards as narrated by Sylado below.

Pelan ia bangkit, dan tetap mengawasi keadaan si centeng, barangkali seperti anak tikus. Sebentar lagi ia pasti akan lari tunggang-langgang, mencari selamat. Hanya sempat mengambil kain dan kebaya yang dibuntelnya buru-buru dengan sepundi uang, ia kabur meninggalkan rumah. Ia tidak lari ke tempat yang sama tadi. Bukan sebab kesadarannya

membuatnya begitu, tapi semata-mata sebab naluri ingin merdeka. Ia berlari dikuasai takut, menembusi kebun pisang di belakang rumah, ke arah yang berbatasan dengan belukar (Sylado, 1999: 25)

[Slowly she gets up, and keeps watching condition of guards, maybe like a mouse. Soon she'll surely run headlong, look for safety. Just having time to take cloth and kebaya bundled in a hurry with a coffer of money, she runs away from home. She doesn't run to the same place like she did before. It is not that her consciousness makes her do that, but it is just about her instinct to be free. She runs controlled by fear, gets through banana plantation behind the house, toward area that borders on thickets (Sylado, 1999: 25)]

Sylado's narration about Tinung running away from house of Tan Peng Liang from Gang Tamim, Bandung (next abbreviated TPLGTB) driven by her instinct to be free reflects the struggle of Indonesian females to defend rights of females who face massive sexual harassment in riot that happened on May 1998 (Anggraeni, 2014: x). According to Anggraeni (2014: xi-xiii), they did not set back in the middle of threat and mental and physical attack from the party who wanted to deny great tragedy in Indonesian history in the beginning of Reformation. Female right defenders hoped that victims of the tragedy opened up and were brave to take any step to defend their rights. Female right defenders also hoped the victims knew that a lot of society members cared and looked for them that established National Commission on Violence against Women (*Komnas Perempuan*). Through his narration, Sylado supports the struggle of female to fight her fear and to achieve her right in the form of freedom.

Meanwhile, Arswendo Atmowiloto represents female through Ai's character as follows.

Dengan sekali melihat, mudah mengingat Ai. Seluruh tubuhnya sangat putih—betul-betul putih, bersih, mempesona [...] Pada usia lima belas, enam belas, sampai hampir tujuh belas tahun, Ai dikenal secara luas karena membintangi iklan pemutih kulit, juga beberapa produk kosmetik [...] Kakinya panjang—dan semakin panjang karena putih, betisnya jadi semakin indah sejak dinyatakan sebagai yang paling indah. Pergelangan kakinya kecil. Tangan lelaki dewasa bisa melingkari. Ini semua merupakan kombinasi antara fantasi dan kenyataan, bahwa perempuan dengan ciri seperti ini memberikan kenikmatan seksual yang luar biasa, dan mendatangkan rezeki berlimpah.

(Atmowiloto, 2008: 36-37)

Menjelang usia tujuh belas tahun, Ai menghentikan semua kegiatannya. Ai memilih menjadi istri Linggar Jimaro, anak pengusaha paling menonjol dari kelompok grup bisnis Jimaro. Sejak itu tak ada kabar beritanya. Kini, delapan tahun kemudian, muncul kembali. Masih mempesona (Atmowiloto, 2008: 37-38)

[With one look, Ai is very easy to remember. All parts of her body are very fair—truly fair, clean, charming [...] at the age of fifteen, sixteen until seventeen, Ai is widely known because she stars skin whitening ad, also some cosmetic product ads [...] Her legs are long—and longer because of their fairness, her legs have become more beautiful since stated as the most

beautiful ones. Her ankles are small. Hands of an adult man can circle. All of them are combination between fantasy and reality, that female whose such characteristics gives fantastic sexual pleasure, and brings in abundant sustenance (Atmowiloto, 2008: 36-37)]

[By the age of seventeen, Ai stops all of her activities. Ai chooses to be Linggar Jimaro's wife, son of the most prominent businessman from Jimaro business group. Since then, there has been no news about her. Now, eight years later, she comes back. Still charming (Atmowiloto, 2008: 37-38)]

Atmowiloto's narration stresses Ai's fair skin. It reflects female condition in post-New Order Society as explained by Ide (2013: 43) that females who fulfill Indonesian female beauty is not only the ones who have slim body, but also fair skin. According to Novita (2010: 9), females take various ways including plastic surgery or changing skin color for the sake of slim body and fair skin. It is no wonder if female beauty becomes part of industry as stated by Sadewo (2014: 3) that beautiful is commodity. A number of people can earn dollars from it through many sides; cosmetic company, beauty salon up to medical world through plastic surgery. Based on the statement, beautiful females in post-New Order society are considered as commodity, too. Referring to the social condition, Atmowiloto narrates Ai as commercial star who can sell skin whitening and cosmetic product and as model with the most beautiful legs from the age of fifteen to almost seventeen which represents teenage.

Teenage is considered as puberty by society. Kauma (1999: 7) states that puberty approximately begins from the age of fourteen and ends by the age of seventeen. Puberty is considered as early young age (Madani, 2003: 237). Meanwhile, the age of twenties is considered as young age (Kwan and Deddy, 2011: 42). If Atmowiloto narrates Ai as commercial star and model from her young age, then Ai as well as Tinung in *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa* written by Remy Sylado is sexually attractive. Therefore, Ai is narrated by Atmowiloto married by Linggar Jimaro—son of the most prominent businessman from Jimaro business group—by the age of seventeen that means Ai is not financially deficient in her puberty. Ai is also narrated by Atmowiloto as a female who still charms community in Kampung Blakan by the age of twenty-five that means Ai is still young and promising sexual pleasure for males.

As well as Remy Sylado's narration, Arswendo Atmowiloto's narration about beautiful female who is young and has fair skin is at first glance the same as females in New Order era who were very fond of plastic surgery, facial cream, and other physical treatments to stay young, to have fair skin and to be considered beautiful. However, beautiful female through Ai's character as well as Tinung's character in *Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa* written by Remy Sylado is not submissive like females in New Order era narrated by Atmowiloto below.

'... Alasan saya ikut ke pertemuan ini, karena merasa ini pertemuan lucu, aneh, menarik.... Bisa jadi karena saya mulai bosan dengan yang saya jalani sekarang. Kehidupan saya tidak aneh, tidak lucu.'
'Apakah betul kamu tadi mandi di sungai dengan telanjang? Kenapa?' Tidak biasanya Suster Emak yang memulai bertanya.

'Ya, betul. Saya perlu membersihkan diri.... Saya mau mencoba jujur.... Semacam persiapan mental.' (Atmowiloto, 2008: 39)

Sejak itu para peserta baru—sebagian yang lama juga, ikutan berendam di sungai, telanjang, sebelum memakai selimut. Adalah Ai juga yang meminta bahwa saat-saat berendam di sungai, saat pertemuan, tidak boleh dipotret atau direkam. Sejak itu pula, keberadaan warung-warung mulai ditata. Dikumpulkan di satu tempat. Diprioritaskan penduduk setempat yang mengelola [...] Ada satu tempat yang dijadikan tempat parkir [...] Juga dibangun masjid yang lumayan besar [...] Ada juga salon. Termasuk kursus-kursus lainnya. Suasana menjadi lebih ramai, sekaligus lebih teratur (Atmowiloto, 2008: 43)

[‘... The reason I join this meeting, because I feel it funny, strange, interesting... Maybe I begin to be bored of what I’m going through now. My life is not strange, not funny.’]

[‘Is it true that you bathed naked in the river? Why?’ It is not usual Suster Emak begins to ask]

[‘Yes, true. I needed to clean myself... I wanted to be honest... kind of mental preparation.’ (Atmowiloto, 2008: 39)]

[Since then new participants—also some old ones, follow her to soak in the river, naked, before they use blanket. Ai is also the one who asks that moments of soaking in the river, moments of meeting, cannot be portrayed or recorded. Since then stalls have been arranged. Gathered in one area. It is prioritized that local people manage the stalls [...] There is a place used to be a parking lot [...] a pretty big mosque is built, too [...] there is also a beauty salon. Including other courses. Situation becomes more crowded and more organized at the same time. (Atmowiloto, 2008: 43)]

Through his narration, Atmowiloto shows that Ai frees herself from life saturation. Her nudity symbolizes freedom of expression carried by post-New Order society. In the same society, females participate in various fields. Ratna (2010: 406) explains that in many fields females take part as civil servants and private employees. There are many females who occupy important positions in government such as minister, directorate general, even president. Since freedom of expression was born, females have had authority over themselves and other people. Affected by such social condition, Atmowiloto narrates Ai’s nudity symbolizing her freedom of expression in term of cleanliness and honesty followed by community in Kampung Blakan. Atmowiloto also narrates Ai who encourages the arrangement of stalls, the construction of parking lot, mosque, beauty salon and the provision of courses for the sake of communal wealth in Kampung Blakan to reflect post-New Order female who plays role in private or governmental sector for the sake of social wealth.

Forming Factors of Post-New Order Female Beauty Representation

As explained in Research Method section, representation is approached in constructionist way. According to Stuart Hall (1997: 27), constructionists state that representation is relational. It means that representation of post-New Order female beauty stressing physical qualities and concerning with freedom is relational. In this research, relation is fixed using one of principles offered by Hall

(1997: 17-18), which is difference or opposition principle. Concerning with the statement of Connell and Messerschmidt (2005: 848), "Gender is always relational, and patterns of masculinity are socially defined in contradiction from some model [...] of femininity", female construction is got in relation with males. Similarly, post-New Order female beauty construction is got in relation with post-New Order males.

Construction is bound to discourse, too. It is based on the opinion of Hall (1997: 44), "Meaning and meaningful practice is therefore constructed within discourse." Discourse itself is created to legitimize the strength of masculine order neutrally (Bourdieu, 2001: 9). In other words, post-New Order discourse about freedom of expression spread over various fields, especially economy and sexuality regarding to female beauty, basically favors males.

Females who are responsible for nurture and household economy at one time are the ones whose double role. Although double role represents progressive Indonesian society, it means double burden for females (Suryakusuma, 2012: 114). According to Candraningrum (2013: 14), female commitment to the household is eternal. Meanwhile, males do not have any commitment to that, so they do not get any burden. With double role, females do not have any capital consisting of qualification, training, and experience as many as males (Walby, 2014: 42). Hence, job segregation and wage gap cannot be avoided.

Having higher capital than females, males are constructed to get job concerning with leadership or domination, while females are constructed to get job in the matter of domestication such as helping, typing or serving the leaders (Candraningrum, 2013: 9). Getting that kind of job, females gain lower wage than males. Eventhough females get the same job as males, females' wages are still lower than the males' ones. That is caused by males' role as head of family or breadwinner (Suryakusuma, 2012: 284) and by quality of their jobs considered as honored (Bourdieu, 2001: 60). Thus, males are more superior than females.

Male superiority is legitimized by post-New Order discourse about sexuality. Although applied to society members both males and females, Pornography Law that contains prohibition against picture, sound, word, movement or display in public area relating with sexual exploitation (Suryakusuma, 2012: 415) perpetuates male superiority. It is based on the opinion of Gandhi (2011: 3) that most law products are produced by males. Meanwhile, Hall (2011: 43) states that socio-cultural institution is patriarchal. If Pornography Law belongs to socio-cultural institution (Cao, 2011: 41), then Pornography Law has the same quality as the institution; patriarchal.

Patriarchal is the quality of system named patriarchy that fixes one of its structures in heterosexuality (Walby, 2014: 185). In other words, heterosexuality justified in Pornography Law (Suryakusuma, 2012: 424) preserves oppression against females. Thus, post-New Order discursive formation constructing female beauty in relation with males sides with males.

Ca-Bau-Kan: Hanya Sebuah Dosa written by Remy Sylado that contains narration about female through Tinung's character dated by a lot of males in Kali Jodo carries male superiority. That refers to the acts of males involved in prostitution in society as stated by Jensen (2013: 75), "Men sell women to other men for sex: pimps and johns." Males who act as pimps sell prostitutes to males who act as *johns*. According to Trotter (2011: 92), pimps make efforts to get a lot

of johns or clients for prostitutes in order to get better financial condition. Referring to the acts of pimps and clients in prostitution, Sylado (1999: 15) narrates:

Kali Jodo, selama berabad telah menjadi tempat paling hiruk pikuk di Jakarta pada malam hari. Di sini, sejak dulu terlestari kebiasaan-kebiasaan imigran Tionghoa menemukan jodoh, bukan untuk hidup bersama selamanya, tapi sekadar berhibur diri sambil menikmati nyanyian-nyanyian klasik Tiongkok, dinyanyikan oleh para ca-bau-kan.

[Kali Jodo, for centuries, has been the most frenzied place in Jakarta at night. Since long time ago, there have been sustainable habits of Chinese immigrants to find partners—not for living together forever, but just for self-entertaining while enjoying Chinese classical songs, sung by prostitutes]

Furthermore Sylado (1999: 15) narrates, “Para ca-bau-kan itu umumnya dikelola oleh tauke-tauke.” That the prostitutes are commonly managed by *tauke*. According to Sylado’s narration, *tauke* means manager of prostitutes. According to *Kamus Bahasa Indonesia* or Indonesian Dictionary, *tauke* means employer of a company (Tim Penyusun Kamus, 2008: 1460). In other words, *tauke* symbolizes employer of prostitutes or pimp who handles them in the realm of prostitution. Meanwhile, Chinese immigrants who entertain themselves with songs sung by prostitutes in Kali Jodo symbolize clients who look for sexual pleasure in the realm of prostitution and who have abilities to improve economic condition of prostitutes. Sylado also associates them with *cukong* that means financier (Tim Penyusun Kamus, 2008: 298). In this case, Sylado refers to Chinese society who plays vital role in Indonesian economy (Suryakusuma, 2012: 235). Through narration about *tauke* or pimp who looks for clients or financiers for Tinung and about clients or financiers who date Tinung until she is nicknamed ‘Si Chixiang’, Sylado shows female dependency on males financially.

Sylado’s emphasis on the importance of young age and slim body for female who whores through Tinung’s character as well as Atmowiloto’s emphasis on the importance of young age and fair body for female who becomes commercial star of beauty product through Ai’s character shows their alignment with males. That is based on the explanation of Bourdieu (2001: 67):

Continuously under the gaze [...] of others, women are condemned constantly to experience the discrepancy between the real body to which they are bound and the ideal body towards which they endlessly strive. Needing the gaze of others to constitute themselves, they are continuously oriented in their practice by the anticipated evaluation of the price that their bodily appearance.

Continuously females struggle to have ideal body in accordance with the times, so they get gaze of others and get existence. Affected by such condition, Sylado and Atmowiloto narrate females through Tinung’s and Ai’ character to have ideal bodies. With their ideal bodies—slim and fair body in young age, Tinung and Ai draw attention of many people symbolizing the gaze of others and then they exist. As stated by Udasmoro (2017: 184), “Contemporary literary

works frequently indicate the presence of women through male characters”, the existence of Tinung is symbolized by her nickname ‘Si Chixiang’ that means a prostitute who is very famous and wanted by many clients. Meanwhile, the existence of Ai is symbolized by her popularity as commercial star of skin whitening and cosmetic product until she is married by Linggar Jimaro—son of businessman associated with wealth. The existence of Tinung and Ai constructed by Sylado and Atmowiloto does not only show female dependency on the gaze of others, especially of males who are sexually attracted to females, but also female position as commodity. Tinung is positioned by Sylado as commodity of pimp who manages her that refers to the acts of pimps in society as expressed by Barry (1995: 218), “Pimps earn their livings off the sexual exploitation of women as commodities.” Meanwhile, Ai is positioned by Atmowiloto as commodity in advertising world that refers to the acts of ad production team—dominated by males—as explained by Kriyantono (2013: 234) that females are treated to represent product. For instance, car body smoothness in car ad is symbolized by female who wears minimal dress to show her skin smoothness. Atmowiloto’s narration shows that young age and fair body of Ai is sold in skin whitening and cosmetic product ad. By positioning females as gazed and sold objects, Sylado and Atmowiloto confirm female subordination in post-New Order era society.

Female subordination is also found in Sylado’s narration about Tinung who gets out from house of TPLGTB and afterward gets into another house of Chinese male named Tan Peng Liang from Gang Pinggir, Semarang (next abbreviated TPLGPS) as seen in Sylado’s narration below.

Di malam harinya, Tinung seperti kebanyakan perempuan waktu itu, menganggap buka baju, telanjang bulat dan mengangkang di ranjang, demi kepuasan lelaki adalah fitrah. Dia mesti diam, tidak melakukan respon [...] dia biarkan dirinya menjadi seperti sawah atau ladang yang diam melulu jika dipacul, dibajak sebelum ditanami benih. Tinung pun hari pertama di Gang Chaulan ini ibarat patung yang bernyawa, tak lebih. Dia tak jadi mitra birahi di sini seakan putus tali sejarahnya dengan Kali Jodo, di mana orang setempat menjulukinya Si Chixiang. Tapi Tan Peng Liang menyukai keberadaan Tinung kini. (Sylado, 1999: 83-84)

Singkat kisah, Tinung akhirnya pindah ke rumah Gang Chaulan bersama anak perempuannya dari Tan Peng Liang asal Gang Tamim, Bandung [...] Disini dia merasa seperti suatu mimpi menyenangkan. Tan Peng Liang asal Gang Pinggir, Semarang ini memperlakukannya dengan kelembutan yang hampir tidak masuk akal. Semua diperhatikannya (Sylado, 1999: 84)

[At night, Tinung like mostly females at that time, assumes that putting off clothes, being stark-naked, and straddling in the bed, for the sake of male’s satisfaction is natural tendency. She must be silent, not doing any response [...] She lets herself become like a ricefield or lea that is always silent when it is bounced, plowed before it is seed planted. On the first day in Gang Chaulan, Tinung is like a lifeless statue, nothing more. She does not become a sexual partner in here as if she broke her historical bond with Kali Jodo, where local people nicknamed her Si Chixiang. But Tan Peng Liang likes her existence by now (Sylado, 1999: 83-84)]

[In short, Tinung finally moves in Gang Chaulan house together with her daughter with Tan Peng Liang from Gang Tamim, Bandung [...] Here, she feel like it is a pleasant dream. Tan Peng Liang from Gang Pinggir, Semarang treats her with almost illogical gentleness. Everything is noticed by him (Sylado, 1999: 84)]

Sylado's narration about Tinung who puts off clothes, gets stark-naked, straddles in the bed and be silent for the sake of male's satisfaction symbolizes sex work or prostitution that cannot be eliminated in society as stated by Corriveau (2013: 31), "'Prostitution'—that is, in our terms, sex work." Being kept by TPLGPS in Gang Chaulan house, Tinung is constructed by Sylado as mistress. In society, mistress is a female whose relation with male without legal marriage (Magdalena, 2014: 5). Regarding to mistress as part of prostitution, Engel (1996: 186) explains:

They began to prostitute themselves [...] They wanted to improve their lives. They said things like: 'It pays better,' or 'I wanted to increase my income', or 'It's more advantageous,' or 'It's an easy life'"

Meanwhile Nanette Davis in Matthews (2008: 36) states, "Women become wealthy in prostitution, or acquire riches by seducing a wealthy man." Women are involved in prostitution in order to increase income, ease and welfare of life. Referring to the involvement of women in prostitution, Sylado gives Tinung pleasure, meekness and attention from the TPLGPS that actually symbolizes superiority or dominance of the TPLGPS on Tinung. Through his narration, Sylado shows that post-New Order female freedom is freedom involving males—not driving them away. Meanwhile, Atmowiloto supports masculine domination through narration below.

'Apakah betul kamu tadi mandi di sungai dengan telanjang? Kenapa?'

Tidak biasanya suster Emak yang memulai bertanya.

'Ya, betul. Saya perlu membersihkan diri.... Saya mau mencoba jujur.... Semacam persiapan mental [...] Saya dengar Ki Blaka juga suka mandi di sungai.' (Atmowiloto, 2008: 39)

Aku mengusulkan agar pemimpin tetap Ki blaka, karena hampir tak tergantikan (Atmowiloto, 2008: 80)

[*'Is it true that you bathed naked in the river? Why?'* It is not usual Suster Emak begins to ask]

[*'Yes, true. I needed to clean myself... I wanted to be honest... kind of mental preparation [...] I heard that Ki Blaka also likes bathing in the river'* (Atmowiloto, 2008: 39)]

[I suggest that leader is still Ki Blaka, because it is almost irreplaceable (Atmowiloto, 2008: 80)]

Through narration, Atmowiloto shows that Ki Blaka—not Ai—is the one who initiates ritual which is bathing in the river, while Ai is the one who develops it by being naked. Besides, Atmowiloto shows that Ki Blaka is still chosen directly by community to be leader of Kampung Blakan though Ai has made the

situation of Kampung Blakan more crowded and more organized with the arrangement of stalls, the construction of parking lot, mosque, beauty salon and the provision of courses that affect communal wealth in Kampung Blakan. Atmowiloto's narration relates with post-New Order condition in which society for the first time chose their President and Vice President directly in President and Vice President of the Republic of Indonesia Election in 2004 (Sudirman, 2014: 474-475). Although appointed as the 5th President of the Republic of Indonesia in the MPR Special Session on July 23, 2001 (Department of Communication and Information Technology Republic of Indonesia, 2005: 55-56; Sudirman, 2014: 471) and stabilized Indonesian macroeconomics (Hidayat, 2007: 114), Megawati Soekarnoputri was considered weak in terms of leadership (Jones, 2015: 475). Therefore, Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono who looked charismatic and promised change was chosen as the 6th President of Indonesia (Sudirman, 2014: 475). Referring to the condition, Atmowiloto produces narration showing that authority of females cannot go beyond the one of males in post-New Order era.

Conclusion

Based on the explanation above, permanent female beauty is only myth. There is no such female beauty. It is seen from post-New Order female beauty represented by male novelists in post-New Order discursive formation that is different from New Order female beauty. Male novelists indeed emphasize physical qualities which attract other people of post-New Order Era females as found in New Order female beauty, yet male novelists construct beautiful females in post-New Order era to be free.

Post-New Order female beauty is formed in relation with post-New Order males who are sexually attracted to female physical qualities. Besides, it is formed in post-New Order discursive formation that is basically advantageous to males. Thus, male novelists represent beautiful females in post-New Order era as the ones who bring sexual pleasure for males and involve males in freedom they want to achieve in order not to threaten masculine domination.

References

- Ancol, K. (2004). *Kembali ke revolusi kemerdekaan: Demokrasi Indonesia gegar otak*. Yogyakarta: Lembaga Studi Budaya Politik Yogyakarta.
- Anggraeni, D. (2014). *Tragedi Mei 1998 dan lahirnya Komnas perempuan*. Jakarta: PT Kompas Media Nusantara.
- Anthony, M. (2008). *The Masculine Century: A heretical history of our time*. New York, Bloomington, Shanghai: iUniverse, Inc.
- Atmowiloto, A. (2008). *Blakanis*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Atmowiloto, A. (2011). *Mengarang novel itu gampang*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Barry, K. (1995). *The prostitution of sexuality*. New York and London: New York University Press.
- Bourdieu, P. (1995). *The rules of art: Genesis and structure of the literary field*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Bourdieu, P. (2001). *Masculine domination*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Burns, L. (2007). *Soul beautiful, naturally*. Summerland: Summerland Publishing.

- Candraningrum, D. (2013). Superwoman syndrome dan devaluasi usia: Perempuan dalam karier dan rumah tangga. *Jurnal Perempuan untuk Pencerahan dan Kesetaraan: Karier dan Rumah Tangga*, 18(1), 7-20.
- Cao, D. (2011). *Penterjemahan undang-undang*. Malaysia: Institut Terjemahan Negara Malaysia dan Pusat Penerbitan Universiti (Upena).
- Connell, R. W. & Messerschmidt, J. W. (2005). Hegemonic masculinity: Rethinking the concept. *Gender & Society*, 19(6), 829-859.
- Corriveau, P. (2013). Regulating sex work: Between victimization and freedom to choose. In C. Parent, et al (Eds.), *Sex work: Rethinking the job, respecting the workers*. Canada: UBC press.
- Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Research design pendekatan kualitatif, kuantitatif, dan mixed*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar
- Davies, S. G. (2018). Pengaturan seksualitas di Indonesia. In L. R. Bennett, S. G. Davies, and I. M. Hidayana (Eds.), *Seksualitas di Indonesia: Politik seksual, kesehatan, keberagaman, dan representasi*. Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia.
- Department of Communication and Information Technology Republic of Indonesia. (2005). *Indonesia 2005: An official handbook*. Jakarta: Foresight.
- Ditmore, M. H. (2006). *Encyclopedia of prostitution and sex work*. Westport, Conn: Greenwood Publishing Press.
- Engel, B. A. (1996). *Between the fields and the city: Women, work and family in Russia, 1861-191*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Faruk. (2012). *Metode penelitian sastra: Sebuah penjelajahan awal*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Fokkema, D. W. & Kunne-Ibsch, E. (1977). *Theories of literature in the twentieth century*. London: C. Hurst & Company.
- Gandhi, M. (2011). *Kaum perempuan dan ketidakadilan sosial*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Hall, S. (1990). Cultural identity and diaspora. In J. Rutherford (Ed.), *Identity community, culture, difference*. London: Lawrence and Wishart.
- Hall, S. (1997). The work of representation. In S. Hall (Ed.), *Representation: Cultural representations and signifying practices*. London: SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Hall, S. (2011). Cultural studies dan centre: Beberapa problematik dan permasalahan. In S. Hall, et al (Eds.), *Budaya, media, bahasa*. Yogyakarta: Jalasutra.
- Heryanto, A. (2012). Kewarganegaraan dan etnis Cina dalam dua film Indonesia pasca-1998. In A. Heryanto (Ed.), *Budaya populer di Indonesia: Mencairnya identitas pasca-orde baru*. Yogyakarta: Jalasutra.
- Hidayat, L. M. (2007). *Reformasi administrasi*. Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Ibrahim, I. S. (1998). Komodifikasi “aura” “cewek kece” dan “cowok macho” dalam industri kebudayaan pop hegemoni di balik “euphoria” pemujaan tubuh”. In I. S. Ibrahim and H. Suranto (Eds.), *Wanita dan media: Konstruksi ideologi gender dalam ruang publik orde baru*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Ide, P. (2013). *Agar tulang sehat*. Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo.

- Ivancevich, J. M., et al. (2006). *Perilaku dan manajemen organisasi*. Jakarta: Penerbit Erlangga.
- Jensen, R. (2013). Just a John? Pornography and men's choices. In S. Tarrant (Ed.), *Men speak out: Views on gender, sex and power*. New York and London: Routledge.
- Jones, T. (2015). *Kebudayaan dan kekuasaan di Indonesia kebijakan budaya selama abad ke-20 hingga era reformasi*. Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia.
- Kauma, F. (1999). *Sensasi remaja di masa puber*. Jakarta: Kalam Mulia.
- Kriyantono, R. (2013). *Manajemen periklanan: Teori dan praktek*. Malang: UB Press.
- Kwan, M. & Deddy, M. (2011). *Cantik dengan totok aura wajah dan make-up serasi*. Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Madani, Y. (2003). *Pendidikan seks untuk anak dalam Islam*. Jakarta: Pustaka Zahra.
- Magdalena, M. (2014). *10 wanita simpanan paling mengejutkan dunia*. Jakarta: Kompas Gramedia.
- Matthews, R. (2008). *Prostitution, politics, and policy*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Melliana, S. A. (2006). *Menjelajah tubuh perempuan dan mitos kecantikan*. Yogyakarta: LKiS.
- Moleong, L. J. (2011). *Metodologi penelitian kualitatif*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Munsi, A. D. (2012). *Jadi penulis? Siapa takut!: Arahkan mudah menulis berita, puisi, prosa, dan drama dalam bahasa Indonesia yang pas*. Bandung: Kaifa.
- Novita, W. (2010). *Meraih inner beauty dengan doa dan zikir*. Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Nurjiyanti, B. (2015). *Teori pengkajian fiksi*. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press.
- Piliang, Y. A. (1998). Masih adakah 'aura' wanita di balik 'euphoria' media. In I. S. Ibrahim and H. Suranto (Eds.), *Wanita dan media: Konstruksi ideologi gender dalam ruang publik orde baru*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Ratna, N. K. (2010). *Sastra dan cultural studies representasi fiksi dan fakta*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Sadewo. (2014). *Cantik elegan dengan kebaya XL*. Jakarta: Kompas Gramedia.
- Sigiro, A. N. (2012). Perempuan dan kesejahteraan keluarga di Indonesia: Kritik atas model keluarga "laki sebagai pencari nafkah utama". *Jurnal Perempuan untuk Pencerahan dan Keadilan: Perkawinan dan Keluarga*, 7-17.
- Sobary, M. (1998). Perempuan dalam budaya dominasi simbolik dan aktual kaum laki. In I. S. Ibrahim and H. Suranto (Eds.), *Wanita dan media: Konstruksi ideologi gender dalam ruang publik orde baru*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Sudaryanto. (2015). *Metode dan aneka teknik analisis bahasa: Pengantar penelitian wahana kebudayaan secara linguistik*. Yogyakarta: Sanata Dharma University Press.
- Sudirman, A. (2014). *Sejarah lengkap Indonesia*. Yogyakarta: DIVA Press.

- Suherman, M. (1998). Penuh bedak tanpa detak, belepotan gincu tanpa memacu, “jangan beli” wajah wanita dalam media cetak. In I. S. Ibrahim and H. Suranto (Eds.), *Wanita dan media: Konstruksi ideologi gender dalam ruang publik orde baru*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Sumardjo, J. (1999). *Konteks sosial novel Indonesia 1920-1977*. Bandung: Penerbit Alumni.
- Suryakusuma, J. (2012). *Agama, seks dan kekuasaan kumpulan tulisan 1979–2012*. Jakarta: Komunitas Bambu.
- Sylado, R. (1999). *Ca-Bau-Kan (Hanya sebuah dosa)*. Jakarta: KPG (Kepustakaan Populer Gramedia).
- Tim Penyusun Kamus. (2008). *Kamus bahasa Indonesia*. Jakarta: Pusat Bahasa.
- Trisnadi, et al. (2004). *Dolly hitam putih prostitusi*. Jakarta: Gagas Media.
- Trotter, H. (2011). The virtue of dockside dalliance: Why maritime sugar girls are safer than urban streetwalkers in South Africa’s prostitution industry. In S. Dewey and P. Kelly (Eds.), *Policing pleasure*. New York and London: New York University Press.
- Udasmoro, W. (2017). Women and the reproduction of literary narratives in the construction of the nation. *Litera Jurnal Penelitian Bahasa, Sastra, dan Pengajarannya*, 16(2), 180-188.
- Walby, S. (2014). *Teorisasi patriarki*. Yogyakarta: Jalasutra.
- Winarnita, M. S. (2018). Nenek-nenek Indonesia dan seksualitas transnasional. In L. R. Bennett, S. G. Davies, and I. M. Hidayana (Eds.), *Seksualitas di Indonesia: Politik seksual, kesehatan, keragaman dan representasi*. Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia.
- Zalduondo, B. O. (1999). Prostitution viewed cross-culturally: Toward recontextualizing sex work in AIDS intervention research. In R. Parker and P. Aggleton (Eds.), *Culture, society and sexuality*. London and New York: Routledge Taylor and Francis Group.