



Indonesian Journal of English Language Studies

Vol. 5, No. 1, March 2019

Indonesian Journal of English Language Studies

**Questioning Bourdieusian Symbolic Violence on Lesbian Characters
in Ayu Utami's *Saman* and Djenar Mahesa Ayu's *Nayla***

Fahrudin and Desca Angelianawati

Spivak's Strategic Essentialism Reading On Amy Tan's "The Red Candle"

Vania Williany and Didimus E. Turuk

**Discourse on Creole Identity: from Ambivalence to Madness
Post-Colonial Reading on Rhys' *Wide Sargasso Sea***

Asep Subhan and Didimus Estanto T.

**Ambivalence of Identity and Dislocation Seen in
"Lotus Eater" by W. Somerset Maugham
and "The Prisoner Who Wore Glasses" by Bessie Head**

Christoforus Sigi Bramaditya

**The Function of Myth within Noah's and Utanapishtim's Stories:
A Comparative Analysis of the Deluge in *Genesis 6-9*
and the *Epic of Gilgamesh Tablet XI***

Natan Setiawan Gultom

**Code-Switching and Portuguese Influence
in the Invention of Tetun-Portu as a Creole**

Jean Antunes Rudolf Zico Ma'u



THE GRADUATE PROGRAM
IN ENGLISH LANGUAGE STUDIES

SANATA DHARMA UNIVERSITY



Indonesian Journal of English Language Studies

©2019 Sanata Dharma University

p-ISSN 2442-790X (Printed)

e-ISSN 2175-0895 (Online)

EDITORIAL BOARD

Chief Editor:

Dra. Novita Dewi, M.S., M.A. (Hons), Ph.D.

Associate Editors:

Dr. J. Bismoko

F.X. Mukarto, Ph.D.

P. Sarwoto, S.S., M.A., Ph.D.

Dr. B. B. Dwijatmoko, M.A.

Dr. E. Sunarto

Managing Editors:

Angela Kurniawati Joice Paila

Johan Tobias Kristiano

Layout and Design:

Aditya Cahyo Nugroho

IJELS, an Indonesian Journal of English Language Studies is intended for enthusiasts in English Language Studies (ELS), chiefly graduate students, to express themselves. They do so in trying to contribute to human progress and development by way of English Linguistics, Literature, Education, and other relevant sub-disciplines. IJELS focuses but not limited to ELS in Indonesia and neighboring countries, including English in Asia.

IJELS is an online and print journal, published at least twice a year, and managed by the Graduate Students of ELS Study Program, Sanata Dharma University. The academic editors are ELS lectures of Sanata Dharma University and its collaborators. IJELS gratefully accepts qualified articles from contributors of different universities and institutions, domestic and overseas.

Editor and Administration Address: Graduate
Program in English Language Studies Sanata
Dharma University
Jl. Affandi, Tromol Pos 29, Yogyakarta 55002
Ph. +62-274-513301, 515352 Ext. 1501
E-mail: ijels@usd.ac.id, Website: www.usd.ac.id/jurnal/ijels

GUIDELINES FOR ARTICLE CONTRIBUTORS

Indonesian Journal of English Language Studies (IJELS) welcomes articles and research reports from enthusiasts of English Language Studies, chiefly from graduate students. The articles and research reports focus on issues related to English Linguistics, Literature, Education, and other relevant sub-disciplines which have never been published elsewhere. The writing guidelines are as follows:

1. Manuscripts must be written in English, in Ms. Word doc. format, double-spaced on A4 paper, font 12, Times New Roman, and 15-20 pages in length, with two hard copies and the soft copy.
2. Articles should be written in essay style with a subheading for each part, except for the introduction. The subheading system is as follows:
LEVEL ONE : ALL CAPITALS, BOLD, LEFT JUSTIFICATION
Level Two : Capitals-lowercase, Bold, Left Justification
Level Three : Capitals-lowercase, Italic-bold, Left Justification
3. Research report articles should include:
 - Title
 - Full name of the contributor(s) without title(s) and institution (affiliation)
 - Abstract (± 100-150 words)
 - Keywords (4-6 words)
 - Introduction
 - Methods
 - Findings and discussion
 - Conclusions and suggestions
 - References
 - Appendix, if any.
4. Non-research articles should include:
 - Title
 - Full name of the contributor(s) without title(s) and institution (affiliation)
 - Abstract (± 100-150 words)
 - Key words (4-6 words)
 - Introduction
 - Body text
 - References
5. Articles will be reviewed by subject reviewers, while editors have the right to edit the articles for format consistency without altering the substance.
6. All manuscripts should conform to the APA Style Manual, for example:
ALvesson, M. & SKoldberg, K. (2000). *Reflexive methodology: News vistas for qualitative research*. London: Sage Publications.
Dewi, N. (2006). As simple as ABC. *Phenomenology Journal of Language and Literature*, 10(1), 49-57.
7. Manuscripts, as well as contributor's brief CV, and two hard copies, should be sent to the Secretariat of the Graduate Program in English Language Studies, Sanata Dharma University in Campus II Mrican, Sanata Dharma University, Jl. Affandi, Gejayan, Yogyakarta.
8. The soft files of the manuscripts should be sent as e-mail attachment files to: **ijels@usd.ac.id**
9. An article contributor is entitled to two offprint editions of the current issue.

Indonesian Journal of English Language Studies

Volume 5, Number 1, March 2019

CONTENTS

CONTENTS.....	1
EDITORIAL.....	2
Questioning Bourdieusian Symbolic Violence On Lesbian Characters In Ayu Utami's <i>Saman</i> And Djenar Mahesa Ayu's <i>Nayla</i> <i>Fahrudin and Desca Angelianawati</i>	3
Spivak's Strategic Essentialism Reading On Amy Tan's "The Red Candle" <i>Vania Williany and Didimus E. Turuk</i>	11
Discourse on Creole Identity: from Ambivalence to Madness Post-Colonial Reading on Rhys' <i>Wide Sargasso Sea</i> <i>Asep Subhan and Didimus E. Turuk</i>	18
Ambivalence of Identity and Dislocation Seen in "Lotus Eater" by W. Somerset Maugham and "The Prisoner Who Wore Glasses" by Bessie Head <i>Christoforus Sigi Bramaditya</i>	24
The Function of Myth within Noah's and Utanapishtim's Stories: A Comparative Analysis of the Deluge in <i>Genesis 6-9</i> and the <i>Epic of Gilgamesh Tablet XI</i> <i>Natan Setiawan Gultom</i>	29
Code-Switching and Portuguese Influence in the Invention of Tetun-Portu as a Creole <i>Jean Antunes Rudolf Zico Ma'u</i>	35

EDITORIAL

“There is always another side, always.”
— Jean Rhys, *Wide Sargasso Sea*

The six articles in this present issue of *The Indonesian Journal of English Language Studies (IJELS)* offer readers various perspectives to see the same realities that may contradict one to another, hence the epigraph from the prequel to Charlotte Bronte’s *Jane Eyre*. Examining various objects of study using their respective lenses, the contributors would argue why people see reality differently.

To begin with the article on Indonesian literature, same-sex relationships depicted in contemporary novels are proof of resistance to the Indonesian homophobic society. Nonetheless, the representation of the oppressed, “normalized” characters strikes a chord with the symbolic violence of the mainstream, the heterosexual oppressor that the novels seek to challenge. The next three articles are postcolonial readings of contemporary English fictions set in different settings with different postcolonial contexts. Interestingly, two articles feature female central characters who cruise along each own difficult cultural waterways, i.e. traditional Chinese patriarchy v. Chinese American modernity and care-free Creole spirit v. rigid Victorian norms. The other ‘postcolonial’ article examines similar conundrum experienced by the once privileged Englishman in the island of Capri and a Dutchman in South Africa. Ambivalence, hybridity, and displacement are among the concepts substantiated in these articles. The fifth article brings readers to antiquity – the story of Noah in the Bible and Utanapishtim in *Epic of Gilgamesh*. Given their striking resemblances, one might think of either history or myth – one side or the other or both? How important is it to know the “truth” today? Finally, this March issue of IJELS concludes with the preliminary investigation on the invention of the hybrid language Tetun-Portu. The postcolonial question needed to elaborate further would be the contestation of power among the local, creole, and ex-colonizer’s languages and its respective implication(s) to the users.

Enjoy the debates and IJELS invites readers to share the same or another side of each story. There is always another side, always. Readers’ contributions will help ensure this journal’s sustainability.

Editor-in-Chief

Novita Dewi

Questioning Bourdieusian Symbolic Violence on Lesbian Characters in Ayu Utami's *Saman* and Djenar Mahesa Ayu's *Nayla*

Fahrudin and Desca Angelianawati

PGRI University of Yogyakarta

e-mail: fahrudin@upy.ac.id and descang@upy.ac.id

ABSTRACT

LGBTIQ has become a controversial topic concerning one's sexual preference over the past few years in Indonesia. Indonesian sexuality will always intersect with the norms, religious values and the state laws. Therefore, this phenomenon is socially binding as it restricts the identity construction of differing sexual preferences in Indonesia. The issue about sexuality particularly LGBTIQ is addressed in several Indonesian literature, given the significant and notable increase in Indonesian novels with LGBTIQ themes since 2000s. Taking the novels of Ayu Utami's *Saman* and Djenar Mahesa Ayu's *Nayla* as the objects of investigation, this study examines (1) how Bourdieusian symbolic violence is being questioned in the novels (2) how these novels also challenge the hetero-normativity in Indonesia. The study reveals the symbolic violence towards the lesbian characters in the selected novels through the process of 'normalisation.' However, by raising the issues of lesbianism, the novels and their circulation can somehow be seen as a form of resistance towards the Indonesian homophobic society.

Keywords: *symbolic violence, Indonesian novels, lesbianism, heteronormativity*

INTRODUCTION

Gender is considered as being unstable and unfixed as it is but a social construction (Diamond and Butterworth, 2008). It causes numerous interpretations and varied discourses on gender. Meanwhile, the society and culture also form their creation on gender roles and the differences of both sexes in behaving based on the social conventions. Thus, gender is 'not only a constructed identity but also a performative accomplishment with social audience.' The remarks later confirm Butler's statement on the performance of sex, gender and sexuality in which she says that it is related to the power in society (Butler, 1990).

This study specifically focuses on the issue of symbolic violence against the lesbian characters in two Indonesian novels.

Homosexuality and lesbianism in Indonesia are often considered as a taboo subject for both Indonesian government and the society. Most of public discourses on same-sex particularly lesbianism will be limited by the fact that human sexuality in any form is rarely depicted openly and is rarely discussed. Moreover, the discussion about sexuality in Indonesian context will always circulate around the heteronormative relationship, national law, religion belief and also the *adat* value. Yet there is a growing number of Indonesian novels with LGBT themes.

Indonesian novels with LGBT themes share a similarity: the gay and lesbian characters are often being 'normalised' to each *kodrat* as a man and woman. The rights for each human to embrace his or her sexual preference is often neglected in most

novels. As their *kodrat*, male will have to take a woman as a partner and vice versa. This kind of normalisation and restriction of sexual preference between male and female can be stated as a form of symbolic violence as addressed by Pierre Bourdieu. Through promulgation in the form of literature, sexual preference is controlled only by either of the two sexes – male or female. Under Bourdieu's view, the concept of heteronormativity, which states that the dichotomy between masculinity-femininity and male-female is challenged as it is merely socially constructed and binding. That kind of condition is portrayed in Ayu Utami's *Saman* and Djenar Mahesa Ayu's *Nayla* in which the manifestation of symbolic violence and the resistance of the novel towards homosexuality can be seen clearly. Using content analysis, this study explores how the narratives construct the portrayal of lesbianism and by extension how discourse on lesbianism is always expansively charged in the novel. Library study is used in this research.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The majority of Indonesians see men's and women's roles and sexuality as God-given attributes. They use those attributes to control and to maintain the family honour and community orders (Benner, 2005). Yet lesbianism along with homosexuality stand in the grey area within the society because people will always have two ways of seeing lesbianism. In the traditional way, one should see it from the heteronormative perspective. It means that a woman should take a man as her companion. On the contrary, some people accept LGBTs and see it as a social construction of gender (Butler, 1990).

Those systematic pressures regarding the acceptance of lesbianism lead into the difficulties faced by the lesbian actors to assert their sexual identity. It is hard for them to 'come out of the closet' in the society and openly states their sexual preferences. This perception of gender

sexuality and sexual preference in Indonesia are in relatable to Pierre Bourdieu's concept of symbolic violence. In understanding this concept, one should start with Bourdieusian concepts of dispositions and habitus. Bourdieu defines dispositions as things that 'generate practices, perceptions and attitudes that are regular without being co-ordinated or governed by any 'rules' (Bourdieu, 2003). These dispositions later constitute the habitus which are inculcated, structured, durable, generative and transposable. It means that they are acquired through a gradual process of inculcation. The childhood experiences are particularly important in this gradual process. Through these processes, one would acquire a set of dispositions which shape their personality. These dispositions are also structured which means that they reflect the society and the social condition where they are acquired. The structured dispositions are also durable because they embed in a way that they endure through one's life and operate in an unconscious way. These dispositions are also generative and transposable in the sense that they are able to generate a multiplicity of practices and perceptions.

The dispositions later will form habitus as what Bourdieu defines as, 'set of dispositions that generate practices and perceptions within the original meaning in a normal or typical condition, state, or appearance of the body. The discussion about habitus cannot be separated also with its relations to the specific social context in which Bourdieu refers as market or capital. The fields or capital are divided into three which are economic capital, cultural capital and symbolic capital. Among these three, it is the cultural capital and symbolic capital that have a close connection to the discourse about LGBT particularly lesbianism in Indonesia. It is mainly because the discourse about lesbianism is related to certain factors such as one's understanding, knowledge and level of education.

Bourdieu then regards symbolic capital such as prestige and honour as an essential source of power. A symbolic capital holder will likely use his or her power against the agent who has less power, thereby s/he exercises the symbolic violence. Therefore, symbolic violence is kinds of violence coming in the form of signs that are accepted by the oppressor and ones being oppreed. Further explanation related to the manifestation of Bourdieu's symbolic violence will be explained in the next subsequent.

DISCUSSION

Applying those concepts in Ayu Utami's *Saman* and Djenar Mahesa Ayu's *Nayla*, the stigma about relationship had been shaped since one is in her/his childhood. In the novel, one can see that childhood experiences play an important role in Nayla and Shakuntala in both novels. The heroine of Djenar Mahesa Ayu's novel which is Nayla herself lives only with the mother who keeps changing male partners. She goes for one man to another. The bitterness surrounding the absence of the father that left the mother for the younger women leads Nayla's mother to transfer her anger towards Nayla. Every time Nayla wets herself when she was a kid, her mother will punish her:

Ibu menyalakan pemantik lantas membakar peniti yang sudah dipilihnya. Peniti dengan ukuran terkecil tentunya. Dan ketika peniti yang menurut Ibu sudah steril itu ditusukkan ke selangkangannya, ia akan mengapit rapat-rapat kedua pahanya. Terisak. Meronta. Membuat ibu semakin murka. [Mother turns the lighter on and then burns the pin she has chosen: the smallest one of all. And when the pin that she thinks is sterile, she jabbed into her thighs, she will flank her two thighs together: sobbing and wiggling. It makes her mother angrier] (Ayu, 2005, p.1).

Despite all those horrible things, Nayla keeps trying to love her mother. Nayla

illustrates, "Saya pernah belajar mencintai perempuan. Mencintai Ibu. Tapi sayangnya, Ibu tak pernah belajar mencintai saya. [I have ever tried to love a woman. To love mum. Unfortunately, mum has never loved me in return]," (Ayu, 2005, p.5). Her disappointment of experiencing unrequited love eventually leads to enmity and hatred. Nayla does not understand the real reason behind her mother's cruelty. Her mother considers Nayla's laziness, such as her wetting herself as a betrayal to her generosity in providing Nayla with the finest care. She thinks that by doing so Nayla hurts herself such as her husband. She says,

...aku ini ibumu, satu-satunya yang bisa kamu andalkan. Kenapa kamu tega menyakitiku seperti ayahmu? Kenapa begitu banyak sifatnya yang menurut padamu? Kenapa tidak ada sedikit saja sifat dan sikapku yang setiap hari kucoba contohkan kepadamu ini kamu jadikan panutan" [I am your mother, the only one you can rely on. Why do you have to hurt me like your father? Why do you resemble him more? Nor even inherit some of my attitude that I try to demonstrate to you as your role model every day] (Ayu, 2005, p.7).

Nayla's mother emphasises that if Nayla is lazy, she cannot be independent and always depends on male. She considers that to conquer male, a woman should possess her richness in body, mind, and soul. She tries to implement her opinion into Nayla, yet she is unable in doing so.

Although Nayla tries to love her mother, her mother does not love her in return. Due to her Nayla's unrequited love toward her mother, she looks for other shelter outside her house. She finds solace in Juli's character that helps her during the time she faints in a discotheque. Through her interaction with Juli, Nayla's opinion toward male worsen. Juli keeps telling her that male only wants women's body. We

can see how Juli has important influence in shaping Nayla's worldview towards man.

Persoalannya...lelaki menciptakan mitos perempuan ideal perempuan ideal adalah perawan. Alat kelamin perempuan yang ideal ada kelebihan cairan dan otot vaginanya kencang [The problem lies in the male's myth about women. To a man, an ideal woman is one who is still virgin. The perfect female genital is one over liquid and a tight genital muscle] (Ayu, 2005, p.78).

Based on Juli's counselling, Nayla has low appreciation toward man, eventually she chooses to be Juli's lesbian partner in which Nayla grows her emotional and physical bound. This situation illustrates how women start to have close connection, both emotionally and sexuality toward each other due to their shared enmity toward man. She always confirms, "Lebih baik saya memilih mencintai Juli ketimbang laki-laki yang menginginkan selaput dara saja [I'd rather be with Juli than being with a man who want my hymen]" (Ayu, 2005, p. 6).

The impact for not being able to have the emotional connectedness with the father leads those characters to find a "shelter" from their same-sex friends. As aforementioned, one can look at the example of Nayla-Juli. Nayla finds and feels not only emotionally secured but physically secured when she is surrounded by her female companion which is Juli. The portrayal of this *lesbian continuum* in which women grow togetherness can be seen also in Ayu Utami's lesbian characters in *Saman* which is Shakuntala. She is portrayed as a Javanese Catholic yet is considered as an immoral and a bisexual. When she was young, she realises that she is a bisexual by claiming,

"Sometimes I'm the Ramayana monkey-king Sugriwa, complete with a low guttural growl. Other times I am Cangik, whose slow, sluggish voice somehow seems to suit the flabby skin around her armpits.

When I was a teenager I always used to dance as Arjuna in the *wayang orang* and all the girls would idolize me without realizing it, they saw no sign of femininity in me. But I was also Drupadi who ignites the passion of all five Pandawa brother." (Utami, 2015, p. 122).

Mentioning one of the Javanese leather puppets characters that is Arjuna who is an androgyny so people say, the implication is that Shakuntala does not recognise herself as a woman but as a fusion between male and female. She also does not have good emotional bound with her father who sends her away to the remote area. This will later lead her dislike towards men, as she says, "It was 1975, and my father sent me off to a strange new city...I learnt a lot from Hansel and Gretel. They had an evil father too (Utami, 2015, p. 133).

Although Shakuntala does not identify herself as a woman, her father's presence obliges Shakuntala to embrace her womanhood. In other word, her willingness to be a woman does not come within her own conviction as her parents especially her father is the one who forced her to do so. Her father is the first person she knows who made a clear description between the functions of boys and girls. He also uses the bible verse to "legitimise" the women's duties which is "*beranak pinak*" [bearing children], while men *make* the children. She points out:

Orang tuaku percaya bahwa pria cenderung rasional dan wanita emosional. Karena itu pria akan memimpin dan wanita mengasihi. Pria membangun dan wanita memelihara. Pria membikin anak dan wanita melahirkan...Aku tak pernah dipaksanya untuk hal yang sama, sebab ia percaya pada hakikatnya aku tak mampu (My parents believe that men tend to be rational while women are emotional. Because of that men will lead and women will be the compassionate ones. Men are the ones who develop while women are the caretakers. Men make children and women

will nurture them...I have never been forced by him [her father] to do things like my brother because he believes that I am not able to do them (Utami, 2015, p. 146).

As aforementioned, this kind of low appreciation towards men which holds biased and sexist view towards woman leads Shakuntala to experience her lesbian escapades. Her first experience of being bisexual starts with a *pesinden* (Javanese traditional female singer) who has taught her to dance and to sing. She learns about *Serat Centhini*, a classic Javanese manuscript which is likely considered as an erotic manuscript, and experiences her first same-sexual interaction. In the end, she understands that she has the tendency of being a bisexual as she states,

Ia seorang pesinden. Aku pun datang padanya untuk berguru ...Tapi ia juga membacakan aku Serat Centhini dan menyanyikan keluhan dengan suara duka ...Suatu malam, ketika aku duduk dalam sebuah ruang dan mengagumu dia menyanyi...lelaki dalam diriku muncul dari belakang tubuhku seperti energy yang lepas...Mereka melepas kain masing masing dan berdekatan (“She is a *pesinden*. Then, I came to her to learn...But she also read me *Serat Centhini* and sang with a sad voice...One night, when I was sitting in the room and admiring her voice... The male side in my body emerged from the back of my body like a liberated energy...They [the male side of her and the *pesinden*] took off each other’s *kain* [traditional clothes] and got close one to another”) (Utami, 2015, p. 149).

Being someone who lived in the United States of America, it is a lamentable situation because no one in Indonesian society is likely capable to understand Shakuntala’s sexual desire. It is probably the reason why Ayu Utami takes the U.S as her setting of place where people are relatively more considerate on one’s sexual preference. Therefore, when she meets her Indonesian friends especially Laila, she can

relate herself and expresses her love to Laila. Laila herself is a virgin who is ready to give up her virginity to her lover, Sihar.

Based on the analysis of the two novels, one can see that childhood experiences play important part of forming those characters to have the same-sex desire. The examples in three novels mentioned in the previous paragraphs do not only indicate the emotionally absent father from Nayla and Shakuntala’s side but also the dominant of the mother in Nayla’s case. Those are the indications for their lesbianism. It also confirms Joseph Nicolosi’s statement saying that a man is looking for emotional connectedness with his father through homosexual behaviour (Nicolosi, 1991). The lack of emotional connectedness with the parents during one’s childhood has a great impact in forming one’s sexual orientation. In addition, the fixation of the gender in the society as what one can see in the novel will lead into stereotyping an individual in which male and female are taught to behave according to their ‘*kodrat*’ in the society. It is also a doxa as what conceived by Bourdieu as a particular “truth” that is accepted as the “universal” truth. The symbolic violence occurs when both sexes accept the stereotype as their label.

Another manifestation of symbolic violence in the novel is seen by the notion of Indonesian heteronormativity that is reflected in the novel. Ayu Utami through her lesbian character Shakuntala also raises the issue of women’s ‘*kodrat*’ and gender roles in the patriarchal society. As aforementioned, Shakuntala lives with the dominance of her father. She borrows a parable, the story of the ogres in Hansel and Gretel when she tells how cruel her father is; and in which she comes out with a realisation: she is educated within a society that sets double standard for male and female. From the parable of Hansel and Gretel, she muses over the following thought:

First, it is prerogative solely of the male to approach the woman. A woman who chases men is a whore. Second, a woman shall give her body only to the right man, who shall support her for the rest of her life. That's what is known as marriage." (Utami, 2015, p. 155)

This concept of gender roles in Indonesian patriarchal society makes Shakuntala see marriage as "nothing more than hypocritical prostitution" (Utami, 2015, p. 155). She also believes that society "considers women only from their physical appearance" and "people did not consider a girl who didn't yet have breast to be virgin" (Utami, 2015, p. 118). Shakuntala who was born and raised as Javanese Catholic woman, was also advised by her parents about virginity as "woman's gift to her husband. And virginity is like a nose, once you lose it, it can't be replaced." Therefore, she must never give it away before she gets married, because then she will be "damaged good" (Utami, 2015, p. 118). It is assumable that the concept of virginity that is enforced by her parents is the trigger for her rebellious character. Instead of obeying her parent's order, she gives up her virginity to her foreign lover before she leaves for the United States.

Regardless of the fact that she had exposed herself to sexuality and eroticism when she was a teenager, people can see from these texts that Shakuntala does not only represent the gender role oppression in Indonesian patriarchal society but also portrays Ayu Utami's perspective on the East and West dichotomy. As a lesbian character in the novel, she describes her understanding of how people from the West think about people from the East.

In this country (America) people thought those in the East lived according to strange customs. Their men attached decorations to their penises, on the surface or within the skin. Their women, without shame, aroused the desire of their men and also of strangers, since they indulged in sex

without any sense of taboo." (Utami, 2015, p. 127).

Shakuntala sees that American's women are more liberal in expressing their sexual desire. She then compares it with the women's sexuality which is perceived differently by her society.

In this country, people speak of your land and our land, your people and our people. We are the noble of the East. You, the depraved of the West. Your women wear bikinis in the streets and have no regard for virginity. Your school children, boys, and girls, live together out of the wedlock. In this country, sex belongs to adult through marriage even if they were married at the age of eleven and regarded as already mature. In your country, people have sex on television. We do not have sex on television. We have a decent foundation in the in the great East. Your customs in the West are not noble." (Utami, 2015, p. 127).

In its relation to Pierre Bourdieu's symbolic violence, one can see that it is not only the acceptance of homosexuality in the Indonesian homophobic society, but also the gender roles which is used to control the relationship between male and female in Indonesian heteronormative society are the form of symbolic violence. It is also a doxa as what conceived by Bourdieu as a particular "truth" that is accepted as the "universal" truth. To illustrate this issue from gender perspective, the rigid adherence of two-sexes; male and female is usually considered as universal truths. Yet in fact, this conception is an example of particular truth, as although this view is held by the religious believers and conservatives, the feminists and LGBTQ agents dispute this perception by pointing out the existence of intersex. This symbolic violence then occurs when both sexes accept the gender dichotomy of male-female and live within the unwritten gender roles context in the society.

This study therefore confirms that the characters' childhood experiences as a form

of disposition shape that individual as a habitus. This habitus is strongly shown in Ayu Utami's *Shakuntala* in *Saman* and Djenar Mahesa Ayu's *Nayla*. Returning to the discussion on symbolic violence, those habitus later will deal with the power which Bourdieu refers as a capital in the society.

As this study analyses the lesbian characters, these characters often experience the symbolic violence because the discussion about homosexuality in Indonesia will always intersect with bigger cultural capitals that are norms, religious belief, and *adat*. The symbolic violence occurs when the dominated accept what the dominant does to them such as accepting their gender roles in the society or the stereotype that the society puts as their label. In this case, most of the homosexual characters in the selected novels likely accept their label as sick lesbian or homosexual men. In this point of accepting, Bourdieu's theory of symbolic violence is applicable to discuss the homosexuality in Indonesia.

These selected novels also articulate the resistance towards heteronormativity in Indonesian homophobic society through their circulation. The Indonesian *adat* almost universally acknowledge that any sexual relationships outside heterosexual marriage are morally prohibited (Bennet, 2005). It is in this light that one needs to understand the recent increase in homophobic attacks in Indonesia has increased (Dearden, 2017). While in the West, the concept of sexuality is seen as something as a part of the daily life as they embrace one's sexual preference openly, in Asian countries especially in the Indonesian state and *adat* emphasise gender normativity, the Indonesian media are telling stories about homosexuality since the beginning of the 1990s (Blackwood, 2007). Scholars have observed that Indonesian media tend to treat homosexuality as a crime or mental illness or disease. In addition, people associate LGBT often with free sex, prostitution,

promiscuity and criminality (Gayatri, 1993). Thus, through their circulation and the portrayal of lesbian heroines, these novels also portray kind of resistance towards the Indonesian heteronormativity.

As a lesbian, the heroines of those two novels will have to face the obstacle and the rejection from the society. Therefore, *Shakuntala* will have to struggle in order to embrace her sexual preference as a lesbian. In the perspectives of character, the character of *Shakuntala* is contradictive. She hates the oppression that she experiences through Indonesian heteronormativity yet she does not show a strong resistance because she prefers living in the U.S where people are more considerate about others' sexual preference. Meanwhile, through the perspective of characterisation, *Nayla* in Djenar Mahesa Ayu shows no resistance at all. The reason is because she accepted her "*kodrat*" as a woman. In other word, she is willingly being "normalised" in the novel.

To summarise the discussion, living in the Indonesian standards of "morality", a lesbian is oppressed and forced to normalise herself by taking a male partner and also often being submissive. One sees the manifestation of symbolic violence in the form of stereotyping Indonesian lesbianism and in the form of Indonesian heteronormativity. Meanwhile, the novel also resists the Indonesian heteronormativity by raising the issue of LGBTIQ in Indonesian homophobic society.

CONCLUSION

The two novels *Saman* by Ayu Utami and *Nayla* by Djenar Mahesa Ayu enrich Indonesian literature by offering new perspectives to the Indonesian readers. These novels raise the controversial issue about lesbianism in the country where lesbians often experience violence, be it physical or symbolic, when they are honest about their sexual preferences. The physical

and emotional attraction and contact have been narrated clearly in both novels with regard to the same-sex relationship.

In relation to the symbolic violence, the lesbian characters have experienced violence since their childhood amidst the mainstream Indonesian society's belief in heteronormativity. They cannot embrace their sexual preference and are considered into sexual deviation. The absence of father figure, the dominance of a father and a mother have become their reasons to look for a 'shelter' in same-sex relationship.

Meanwhile, the symbolic violence towards the lesbian characters in the novels also shows resistance towards the heteronormativity itself. Led by the discussion of LGBT that always intersects with the law state, norm and *adat* that reject, LGBT actors are seen as someone deviant and sick. Yet these novels show their resistance by having the lesbian heroines in their story. Meanwhile, from the perspectives of a character, Shakuntala in Ayu Utami's *Saman* resists the Indonesian heteronormativity by keeping her sexual identity as a lesbian even she prefers to live in the U.S. This kind of resistance is not seen in the character of Djenar Mahesa Ayu's Nayla because she finally returns to her *kodrat* as a "normal" woman through a process of social and cultural normalisation.

REFERENCES

- Ayu, Djenar Mahesa. 2005. *Nayla*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Bennet, L. 2005. *Women, Islam and modernity: single women, sexuality and reproductive health in contemporary Indonesia*. London: Routledge.
- Blackwood, E. 1995. *Senior women, model mothers and dutiful wives: managing gender contradictions in a Minangkabau village*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Butler, J. 1990. *Gender trouble: feminism and the subversion of identity*. NY: Routledge
- Classic.
- Bourdieu, P. 2003. *Language and symbolic power*. Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- Diamond, L. M., & Buttherworth, M. 2008. Questioning gender and sexual identity over time to time. *Sex Roles: A Journal for Research*, 59.
- Dearden, Lizzie. 2017. *Sharia court in Indonesia sentences two gay men to 85 lashes each after being caught having sex*. Retrieved from <http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/asia/islamic-court-indonesia-gay-men-85-lashes-sex-caught-homosexuality-laws-first-time-khairil-jamal-a7740626.html> on November 15.
- Utami, Ayu. *Saman*. 2015. Jakarta: Kepustakaan Populer Gramedia, 2015.

Spivak's Strategic Essentialism Reading on Amy Tan's "The Red Candle"

Vania Williany and Didimus E. Turuk

Sanata Dharma University

e-mail: vania.williany@gmail.com and tantosanpio@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

This paper analyzes the struggle of a Chinese-American woman in "The Red Candle", one of the vignettes in Amy Tan's novel *The Joy Luck Club* (1989). The main character namely Lindo Jong, is confined with patriarchy and tradition and is forced to marry her fiancée at her teenage. Fascinatingly, Lindo can free herself from the arranged marriage and her oppressive new family by a clever scheme. Spivak's strategic essentialism is then applied to scrutinize this particular issue. Indeed, by strategic essentialism, Lindo still upholds her value as a Chinese woman and her respect to her filial piety, also, she can obtain her own independence as a woman.

Keywords: *Chinese-American woman, patriarchy, tradition, strategic essentialism*

INTRODUCTION

Amy Tan was born on February 19, 1952, in Oakland, California. Her significant works include *The Joy Luck Club* (1989) and *The Kitchen God's Wife* (1991). Currently, she lives in San Francisco and New York.

Based on Ling as mentioned in Lauter (1994: 2925), Amy's parents are of Chinese mainland descent. His father is a Baptist minister and an electrical engineer father; her mother is a nurse and member of *The Joy Luck Club*. Amy's family emigrated from China in 1949 leaving behind three young daughters and giving birth to three children in the US. The intended separation from the family in China which was thought of as 'temporary' indeed became one that lasted for four decades through political exigencies. There was not any contact with her Chinese family. In the late 1980s, the three daughters were finally found. She spent her childhood in Northern California. While Amy was still in teens,

her father and older brother both died from brain tumors. This incident hurts her mother so much. As a result, in 1966, she moved with her mother and younger brother to live in Europe, where she attended high school in Montreux, Switzerland for two years. She returned to the United States for college, attending Linfield College in Oregon, and San Jose City College. From San Jose State University, she earned a B.A. and M.A. in English and linguistics.

After graduation in 1974, Amy married classmate and tax attorney Lou DeMattei. Subsequently, she took a variety of jobs. She worked as a language development consultant and as a corporate freelance writer. In 1985, she wrote the story "Rules of the Game" for a writing workshop. This story became the early foundation of her first novel entitled *The Joy Luck Club*.

Talking about her significant work, it should be started by discussing *The Joy Luck Club*. The book appeared in 1989, and it met critical and public success. It

remained in the New York Times' bestseller nine times. It received the Los Angeles Times Book Award and was translated into 25 languages. There are three major themes depicted in this novel. First, it is about the Chinese American Women. This book continued to give voice to the previously silent Chinese American women. Second, it problematizes the mother and daughter's relationship. It depicts the bondage between Chinese American mothers and daughters. Third, it narrates about diaspora. The conflict of Chinese-American mother-daughter also illustrates the issue of first-generation immigrant parents and second-generation American children. Next, Amy's second book is entitled *The Kitchen God's Wife*. The book was published in 1991. It was much awaited and equally well received. Amy's mother heavily influenced her to write this story. It focuses on the complexities of mothers and daughters.

To return to *The Joy Luck Club*, it comprises of stories of eight women, i.e. the four original members of *The Joy Luck Club* and their four daughters, all born in the States. The mothers started to gather weekly, despite the death and devastation they faced, to create their own moment of joy around the mah-jong table in China. The novel then reveals the heroic and tragic lives of the four older mothers whereby one mother finally dies. It also contains the tale-tell of the continuities and discontinuities of the mothers' lives and characters in their daughters' lives. In particular, this paper would discuss 'The Red Candle', one of the excerpts in *The Joy*

Luck Club. Below is the plot summary. Young Lindo Jong (2 years old) was visited by two ladies, who turned to be the old village matchmaker and Huang Taitai, the mother of the boy Lindo forced to marry. The old matchmaker bragged about Lindo's suitability for the boy. Huang Taitai first looked down at her, but then Huang smiled and accepted Lindo. The boy whom Lindo marrying is named Tyan-yu (meaning:

leftovers of the father's spirit), a very spoiled boy. His family always watches over him and makes a decision upon him. Lindo was certain she was unhappy with that. Moreover, Lindo's family began treating her as if she belonged to Huang's family already.

INTRINSIC READING OF 'THE RED CANDLE'

Lindo never met Tyan-yu until she was nine. In their first encounter at the red-egg ceremony, Lindo didn't have an instant love for her future husband the way people see on TV today. Yet, her life changed when she was 12. The summer heavy rain came. The Fen river ran through the neighborhood. This terrible flood forced her family to move to Shanghai. Her father then explained that Lindo was old enough to move and live with Huangs. Lindo's family granted Huangs furniture and bedding as dowry and gave Lindo a golden necklace to be a lucky charm. Lindo must promise to obey her new family and must not disgrace her own family.

In Huang's huge house, Lindo realized Huang was of a much better position than her family. Lindo wasn't welcomed well. Instead, Huang ushered her to go to the kitchen, a place for cooks and servants. Lindo knew her standing. Lindo was forced to learn to be an obedient wife. She learned to cook so well until she knows the meat is too salty before even tasting it. She could sew the small stitches as if the embroidery has been painted on. She was made to serve Tyan-yu and Huang only. Huangs almost washed their thinking into her skin. Tyan-yu is God and Huang is her real mom whom she must please and obey without questions (Lauter, 1994: 2930).

After a while, I didn't think it was a terrible life, no, not really. What was happier than seeing everybody gobble down the shiny mushrooms and bamboo shoots I had helped to prepare that day? How much happier could I be after seeing Tyan-yu eat

a whole bowl of noodles without once complaining about its taste or looks? Can you see how the Huangs almost washed their thinking into my skin? I came to think of Tyan-yu as a god, someone whose opinions were worth much more than my own life. I came to think of Huang Taitai as my real mother, someone I wanted to please, someone I should follow without question.

When she turned 16 in the lunar year, Huang wanted a grandson by the spring. Lindo was forced to marry soon. On the wedding day, Lindo was perplexed. She really didn't want to marry Tyan-yu. The situation got worse as the Japanese invaded China several days before her wedding. Lindo reflected upon herself whether all the events she went through changed her as a person. She then figured out that she was more valuable than she thought. She is strong, pure, and has genuine thoughts none could take. Lindo attended the wedding bravely and she was made officially Tyan-yu's wife with the symbol of the red candle. The red candle was the marriage bond that sealed her forever with Tyan-yu and his family, with no excuse (Lauter, 1994: 2931).

I asked myself, What is true about a person? Would I change in the same way the river changes the color but still be the same person? And then I saw the curtains blowing wildly, and outside rain was falling harder, causing everyone to scurry and shout. I smiled. And then I realized it was the first time I could see the power in the wind... I wiped my eyes and looked in the mirror. I was surprised at what I was... what I saw was even more valuable. I was strong. I was pure. I had genuine thoughts that no one could see, that no one could ever take away from me. I was like the wind.

Lindo stayed up all night crying about her marriage. Luckily, she was sleeping outside, as Tyan-yu rejected to sleep with

her. Outside, looking at the red candle, she hoped that it blew out. It was not, though.

Within the marriage, Lindo suited herself to the role of the obedient wife. She served Tyan-yu the fresh young chicken tonic soup called tounau. But it wasn't enough to make Huang happy. One day, while working on embroidery, Huang suddenly slapped and cursed Lindo for she refused to sleep with Tyan-yu. Lindo then agreed to sleep on Tyan-yu's bed. She took off her gown but no response from Tyan-yu. She learned to understand Tyan-yu was impotent and couldn't perform. Lindo tried to care for Tyan-yu as his big sister. She helped him rub his back and they still slept together. Months passed, Huang again complained. Tyan-yu eventually lied saying he planted seeds for Lindo but Lindo was not pregnant yet. Lindo then was locked in the room, forbidden to do anything and forced to drink herbals to concentrate on having babies. Only one servant girl served her.

Huang examines Lindo's fertility through the old matchmaker. They found out that Lindo had too much metal because of gold jewelry given by Huang. Lindo then returned the jewelry to happily reclaimed Huang. Lindo felt freer and more independent. She also thought that it was the right time for her to escape the marriage without breaking her promise to her family. One morning of the Festival of Pure Brightness, Lindo woke up Tyan-yu and entire house with her wailing. She told Huang she got a nightmare and a strong warning from the ancestor that her marriage is cursed when the red candle blew out. There are three signs of this. First, Tyan-yu's back has a black spot. Second, her teeth began falling. Third, Tyan-yu's real wife is the servant having imperial blood. Huang believed in Lindo. Finally, Lindo can leave the family, move to the US, remarry, have 3 children and buy herself 24-carat jewelry to remember that she is a worthy woman. She retells this story to her daughter: 'How nice it is to be that girl

again, to take off my scarf, to see what is underneath and feel the lightness come back to my body!' (Lauter, 1994: 2936).

OVERVIEW OF SPIVAK'S STRATEGIC ESSENTIALISM

Feminism is the framework used to analyze this text. Before the discussion about Spivak's strategic essentialism, it is better to start with how feminism become one of the prominent lenses in scrutinizing the gender-based discrimination, especially patriarchal domination toward women. The reason this framework is employed is that this article centralizes the issue of gender discrimination in one of the Ami Tan's short stories in her book *The Joy Luck Club*. This framework later becomes the critical lens to uncover the form of the discrimination and discursive way out which is performed by the characters to release the discrimination. This part will expose the short overview of feminism and Spivak strategic essentialism as the theory chosen among other feminist theories.

The earliest milestone of Feminism was the First Wave which took place in 1880 to the early of the 20th Century. This wave managed to uphold the right of most women in industrialized countries to vote. The spirit of feminism glorified by this wave is the importance of the individual and individual autonomy which are protected by guaranteed rights, economic justice and equality of opportunity. However, this Liberal feminist outlook is limited in various ways so it is criticized due to its vague attitude including in explaining the separation of public versus private sphere and no challenge towards capitalism (Madsen, 2000).

The Second Wave of feminism occurred thereafter with the aspiration of enabling women participation in sexual equality and abortion. Though it addresses a serious matter concerning women's equality and sexuality, the Second Wave of Feminism was criticized for it only caters to the needs

and experiences of middle-class white women in the United States and marginalizes the voices of women of color and events they undergo. Becky Thompson has called the Second Wave as the 'hegemonic feminism' whereby: 'Hegemonic feminism deemphasizes or ignores a class and race analysis generally sees equality with men as the goal of feminism and has individual rights-bases, rather than the justice-based vision of social change' (Madsen, 2000).

Finally, the Third Wave of Feminism emerged in the 1980s. In essence, the Third Wave of Feminism is the response to the failure of First and Second Waves. The Third Wave focuses on the effort to fighting for each woman's group peculiarities and the cultural, social, religious, racial and sexual diversity as part of the reality of around the world. Some prominent figures of this wave include Gloria Anzaldúa, Chandra Mohanty, Trinh T. Minh-ha, Gayatri Spivak, Rey Chow, Rosario Castellanos, and Cheryl Johnson-Odim. Within the Third Wave Feminism movement, there are two arguments the critics would like to stand up for. First, they reject earlier feminist approaches which assumed that women shared a common identity based on a communal experience of oppression. Second, they oppose the assumption that white middle-class women should be considered the norm of the discourse and practice of feminism. Instead, they support differences in the social positions of non-white women which produce very different problems and responses, even in relation to the same broad issues.

The success of the Third Wave mainly lies in its encouragement of New Feminism. At that time, there was a strong attempt in embracing the idea of a global 'sisterhood' to accommodate the articulation of many voices to creating inclusive feminism. One of the successful variants of the Third Wave feminism is the Feminism of Color. According to Madsen (2000), Feminism of

Color scrutinizes the relation between race and feminism. They bring up how colored feminist such as Alice Walker criticizes the middle-class white woman's version of feminism as it cannot contain the multiple issues of colored women who experience double oppressions; firstly, as the second class society of disenfranchised sex, and secondly, as minority race. Hence, Feminists of color advocates the right of the colored women around the world which are inhibited by "double consciousness", referring to the opposing experience of being one 'self' (a biologically born and structurally gendered woman) versus the cultural image imposed by the racism of being 'other'. Feminist of Color points to the emergence of Black Feminism, Chicana/ Hispana Feminism, Native Feminism, and Asian Feminism as distinct theoretical perspectives upon the oppression of women by virtue of their racialized sexuality.

The Third Wave concept of feminism, especially Gayatri Spivak's concept of feminism is the theory employed in scrutinizing the oppression experienced by the female character in Amy Tan's "The Red Candle". Her theory is chosen based on the local belief/culture in the story is seen as a main oppressive agent toward women. Strategic essentialism is a solution that Gayatri C. Spivak offers to overcome the issue of false representation of the oppressed voice, the colonized people especially colonized women. Reading through Sati, the Indian tradition in which the widowed woman is burned alive with the pyre of her dead husband, Spivak scrutinizes the issue of woman's voice in her writing "Can the Subaltern Speak?"

The answer to the question can the subaltern speak is "No, they cannot". Sati proves that woman is having double oppression, both from patriarchal culture and the British colonizer. In developing the concept, in her essay, one prominent theory she employs is Said's Orientalism. Regarding this theory, Spivak highlights

the colonizer-colonized relationship which is mystified by political interests (Said, 1979). Even though the British Empire seems to overthrow the Sati culture, highlighting their concern of humanism and underlining their position to support women, it is obvious that the colonizer does that for their own good in the colonized land. They aim to gain sympathy from the local women. Women here are being used, are exploited and marginalized. Colonizer seems to speak for the women, but women never speak in this real situation. The representation is manipulated (Spivak, 1988). The colonizer-colonized binary and the male-female binary seems to be detrimental for women.

Strategic essentialism later becomes Spivak's way to occupy her desire to speak up for the subaltern voice. Spivak suggests the scholar to use the criticism to vividly criticize and to speak for the subaltern people. Use any method and criticism that can sharpen the subaltern voice to be heard and later become the public concern which resulted in the voice is heard (Spivak, 1988). Spivak herself in scrutinizing the Sati using the marxist, feminist, postcolonial and deconstruction to show that the women in India cannot speak for their own and their voice is never really theirs.

To contextualize Spivak's theory in reading Chinese woman oppression in China, it is important to highlight the relation between feminist theory and strategic essentialism. Although Spivak's elaboration on her concept is located in India, how she read Sati issue to uphold her concern to give a voice for the Indian woman. Her focus is on giving a voice to the subaltern using the existed theories to scrutinize the oppressions from patriarchal culture, colonizer's domination, and the tied social class. In "The Red Candle", the focuses of the analysis are to uncover the oppression from patriarchal society and to expose the way out that the woman character used in voicing her will. The communalities that

they share are that both these situations embody the oppressive patriarchal family and both the situations consolidate various means in voicing their will. In Spivak's case, she uses marxist, feminist, postcolonial and deconstruction to give a voice for the subaltern and in the "The Red Candle", the woman character builds the scenario to manage her way out of the oppressive patriarchal family.

STRATEGIC ESSENTIALISM READING ON "THE RED CANDLE"

In *The Red Candle*, the story is narrated from the first-person point of view. Since the narrator is Linda Jong, it is presumed that it is her own story. In order to expose the strategic essentialism in the story, there are two steps needed before the show the strategic essentialism happened in the story. Those two steps are observing the subaltern subject (and the experiences) and identifying the oppressor

The Red Candle exposes the strict Chinese culture regarding faith and marriage. The character "I" is obviously oppressed by the patriarchal materialistic family. The character "I" is the subaltern subject of her family/ their promise/ her Chinese tradition. She cannot choose the situation that she wants to live in or she is having no opportunity to decide the turns in her life, she had the choices made for her. The proofs are when she had herself engaged with Tyan Yu in the age of 3, she is told to leave the family when the family is facing the disaster to the Tyan Yu's family since she has been considered theirs, she is accused as a bad wife (not serve her husband) by Tyan Yu even though the reality is that Tyan Yu is the one who drives her away from their room, she is accused as a barren woman by Tyan Yu even though the one that is barren is Tyan Yu. She had all her voices represented by others and those voices are not the truth and those are not her actual voices.

Revisiting Spivak's "Can the Subaltern Speak", in the context Linda Jong's *The Red Candle* the answer to that question is yes the subaltern can speak, through strategic essentialism. The character 'I' manages herself to escape from the oppressive family without broken her family promise to Tyan Yu's family. The character 'I' does not use the rebellious way to facilitate her will/voice. She gets involved with the culture to facilitate her voice. She uses the culture which previously oppresses her. Seeing the opportunity that Tyan Yu is barren, she made up a story of ancestor revealing that she is not Tyan Yu's true soul mate by indicating three strong shreds of evidence. Finally, she is released, she is given a way out of the family with enough money to start a new life in America. In America, she is properly valued by others and by herself. She has two children and regularly buys herself a 24-carat gold. In this sense, her voice finally can be heard, meaning to say that she liberates herself from the false representation of herself. She stops people to speak on her behalf, she stops the culture to oppress her, and she manages herself to start a life that appreciates herself as a woman. In these three senses, she performs the strategic essentialism to liberate herself as a woman from gendered discrimination.

Post-colonial reading of this story is that why it has to be America, the ideal land that she imagines to have a better life. It is like having the colonial discourse embedded in her mind that the self/West is a better place than the other/West. It is observable that the journey to the west is a representative of an unconscious colonized entity. The colonial discourse can be traced in her free will/ desire/ voice to go to the west, America. This is not only proven by her final destination to start a new life, but her references on telling the story also indicate that consciously or unconsciously she considers the western people are superior to the eastern people/culture. The references are first when she is using the American TV movie

to show how women should be proposed and the second one is when she compares the Chinese traditional marriage to Catholic marriage. Those references are such an acknowledgment of the superior western to the eastern people and culture.

CONCLUSION

“The Red Candle” is one of the short stories in Amy Tan’s *The Joy Luck Club* centralizing the issue of a woman who manages herself free from the oppressive patriarchal family. Using Spivak’s Strategic Essentialism, this article tries to uncover the form of oppression and the discursive way out that is performed by the character. It is observable in the story that, the form of oppression within the story is in the form of a false representation of the woman’s voice, in this case, the woman’s character.

By neglecting her voice, her family, culture, and husband perform as the agent who interprets what the woman character is meant to say. She experienced the oppression because she is a woman. The representation as a woman locates her in marginal position in her patriarchal culture. Through Spivak’s strategic essentialism, the way out that is performed by the woman character is analyzed. The way the character manages her way out of the oppressive patriarchal culture using the patriarchal tradition indicates her success in employing strategic essentialism. The success is proven by how she stops people who speak on her behalf (avoiding the false interpretation of what she wants/means to say), liberates herself from the oppressive patriarchal Chinese culture, and builds a new life that appreciates herself as a woman. Account in “The Red Candle” is one of the examples that the subaltern can also speak; and that the strategic essentialism by Spivak is performable. This is the form of resistance and struggle of a woman against the patriarchal culture that is proven doable.

REFERENCES

- Biography. 2014. Retrieved from Amy Tan Biography:
<https://www.biography.com/writer/amy-tan>
- Lauter, Yarborough, & Novoa. 1994. *The Heath Anthology of American Literature*. Volume 2.
D.C. Heath: Lexington.
- Loktongbam, N. (n.d.). Chinese Diaspora: A Study of Amy Tan’s *The Joy Luck Club*. *IOSR Journal of Humanities and Social Science (IOSR-JHSS)*, 56-59.
- Madsen, D. L. 2000. *Feminist Theory and Literary Practice*. London: Pluto Press.
- Peng, X., Zhao, G., & Liu, X. 2013. Chinese mothers as other before American-born daughters- on the Chinese mothers' communication in *The Joy Luck Club* from the perspective of orientalism. *European Journal of Business and Social Sciences*, 1-9.
- Said, E. W. 1979. *Orientalism*. New York: Random House, Inc.
- Stanley, J. 2017. Immigrant identity in Amy Tan’s *The Joy Luck Club*.

Discourse on Creole Identity: from Ambivalence to Madness Post-Colonial Reading on Rhys' *Wide Sargasso Sea*

Asep Subhan and Didimus Estanto T.

Sanata Dharma University

e-mail: zoebhan@gmail.com and tantosanpio@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The portrayal of creole identity is presented in several literary works, one of them is in the portrayal of Antoinette Cosway in Jean Rhys' *Wide Sargasso Sea*. Antoinette Cosway firstly is the minor character in Charlotte Brontë's *Jane Eyre*. The research traces the link between Antoinette Cosway's creole identity with her madness. According to Bhabha's ambivalence theory, creole identity possibly creates a new identity as the result of interrelation between colonizer and colonized. Based on the research, Antoinette Cosway failed to create a new identity and became a madwoman instead. The cause is the complex situation faced by her and the lack of supporting aspects for constructing a new identity.

Keywords: *creole identity, ambivalence, Antoinette Cosway, Homi Bhabha*

INTRODUCTION

Wide Sargasso Sea is a novel written by Jean Rhys. She worked on the novel for twenty-one years and it was published in 1966 (Ramazani, p.2357). Later, the novel is commonly accepted as her masterpiece. Jean Rhys had written several novels and short stories before *Wide Sargasso Sea* but through this novel, she got her position as one of the distinguished authors in the world.

In *Wide Sargasso Sea*, Rhys creates West Indian prehistory for the first Mrs. Rochester, Antoinette Cosway, the madwoman in the attic of Charlotte Brontë's *Jane Eyre*. While in *Jane Eyre* the character has very little presentation and she does not speak for herself, in *Wide Sargasso Sea* she becomes the main character. The story in the novel is presented through her point of view, except for Part Two of the novel in which her

point of view and her husband's present the story alternately.

There is a similarity between the real-life of Jean Rhys and the imaginary life of Antoinette Cosway. Jean Rhys was born Ella Gwendolen Rees Williams on the small island of Dominica in the West Indies in 1890. Her father was a Welsh doctor; her mother is a creole descended from wealthy, slave-holding plantation owners. She leaves Dominica at the age of seventeen to attend the Perse School in Cambridge, England, and returns to her birthplace only once, in 1936 (Ramazani, p.2356).

Jean Rhys's feelings toward her Caribbean background and childhood were mixed: she deeply appreciated the rich sensation and cross-racial engagements of her tropical experience, yet she was haunted by the knowledge of her violent heritage and carried a heavy burden of historical guilt. As a West-Indian she felt estranged from mainstream European culture and identified

with the suffering of Afro-Caribbeans, yet as a white Creole she grew up feeling out of place amid the predominantly black population of Dominica.

In other words, in *Wide Sargasso Sea*, Jean Rhys gives an example of one possible result of creole identity. According to Homi Bhabha theory of ambivalence, it will construct a new identity based on the encounter between the colonizer and the colonized. Nevertheless, the novel shows the availability of an alternative result where the new identity is failed to be constructed because of the particular situations faced by the creole. What follows is the depiction of Antoinette Cosway as a Creole in *Wide Sargasso Sea*

Creole is derived from the Portuguese *criolulo* meaning “native”, via French *créole*, meaning “indigenous”. In general, creole refers to a white person of European descent, born and raised in a tropical colony. From 17th until 19th century, the most common use of the term is in English was to mean “born in the West Indies”, whether white or negro.

In *Wide Sargasso Sea*, Antoinette Cosway and her mother, Annette, are Creoles. The place setting of the story is in Jamaica in the 1830s. According to Brathwaite as it is quoted by Ashcroft (Bill Ashcroft, p.51), in Jamaica, and the old settled English colonies, the word [creole] was used in its original Spanish sense of *criollo*: born into, native, committed to the area of living, and it was used in relation to both white and black, free and slave.

There are some passages in the story which depict the representation of Antoinette Cosway as a creole. Through these passages, the motive behind Antoinette's acts may be understood clearer. Besides, since the story is narrated mostly through her point of view, it also can help the reader to understand the psychological condition of Antoinette relating to her status as a creole.

(1) The Jamaican ladies had never approved of my mother, ‘because she pretty like pretty self’ Christophine said. She was my father’s second wife, far too young for him they thought, and, worse still, a Martinique girl. (Rhys 9)

This passage shows the position of Antoinette Cosway in Jamaican ladies’ view. Antoinette Cosway is seen as different from them. She is prettier and she is a Martinique girl.

(2) I never looked at any strange negro. They hated us. They called us white cockroaches. Let sleeping dogs lie. One day a little girl followed me singing, ‘Go away white cockroach, go away, go away.’ I walked fast, but she walked faster. ‘White cockroach, go away, go away. Nobody want you. Go away.’ (Rhys 13)

This passage shows the image of creole people in black people’s view and vice versa. In one side, black people like to mock creole people (in this case physically white people). Consequently, creole people then think that black people hate them.

(3) We ate English food now, beef and mutton, pies and puddings. I was glad to be like an English girl but I missed the taste of Christophine’s cooking. (Rhys 21)

This passage shows the desire of a creole to adapt one dominant culture. In this case, the dominant culture is the colonizer’s culture that is English culture. Nevertheless, the adaptation is not fully desired since in the other side, there is also the desire to adapt the colonized culture which in this case is symbolized by “Christophine’s cooking”.

(4) Creole of pure English descent she may be, but they are not English or European either. (Rhys 39)

This passage shows the dominating people’s view toward the creole which constructs the creole’s ambivalent identity. Even if the creole is the descendant of pure English but he/she is not classified as the English or European.

(5) They tell you perhaps that your wife's name is Cosway, the English gentleman Mr. Mason being her stepfather only, but they don't tell you what sort of people were these Cosways. Wicked and detestable slave-owners since generations—yes everybody hate them in Jamaica and also in this beautiful island where I hope your stay will be long and pleasant in spite of all, for some not worth sorrow. Wickedness is not the worst. There is madness in that family... Money is good but no money can pay for a crazy wife in your bed. Crazy and worse besides. (Rhys 59)

This passage shows the one-side view of the dominating people toward the creole. This view indicates the complex situation faced by a creole. Besides, it also becomes the symbol of the lack of supporting factor to construct a new identity.

(6) Miss Antoinette a white girl with a lot of money, she won't marry with a coloured man even though he don't look like a coloured man. (Rhys 73)

This passage indicates the complex situation faced by a creole too. In this case, Antoinette Cosway is a rich white girl and so people assume that she will not marry a coloured man. Nevertheless, without the mixture with coloured people, the new identity will not be constructed.

THEORETICAL CONCEPT: BHABHA'S AMBIVALENCE

Ambivalence is one notion of the post-colonial key concepts confined by Homi K. Bhabha. In his book, Bhabha differentiates the diversity and difference of the culture. The ambivalent concept was elaborated in the difference. The concept of cultural difference focuses on the problem of the ambivalence of cultural authority that is the attempt to dominate in the name of cultural supremacy which is itself produced only in the moment of differentiation (Bhabha, 2002, p.35). Cultures are never unitary in themselves, nor simply dualistic in the relation of Self to Other. The pact of

interpretation is never simply an act of communication between the "I" and the "You" designated in the statement. The production of meaning requires that these two places/ entities be mobilized in the passage through a Third Space, which represents both the general conditions of language and the specific implication of the utterance in a performative and institutional strategy of which it cannot 'in itself' be conscious. He explains that the intervention of the Third Space of enunciation, which makes the structure of meaning and references an ambivalent process, destroys this mirror of representation in which cultural knowledge is customarily revealed as an integrated, open, expanding code (Bhabha, 2002, p.36). It is that Third Space, though unrepresentable in itself, which constitutes the discursive conditions of enunciation that ensure that the meaning and symbols of culture have no primordial unity or fixity, that even the same sign can be appropriated, translated, rehistoricized and read anew. Third Space of enunciation has become the precondition of cultural difference (Bhabha, 2002, p.38). This argument has become Bhabha's counter account on Said's Self-Other binary. The elaboration of the ambivalence describes the relation among the colonizer and colonized is never simply one-way order, but more in two ways. Both groups are affected and influenced by each other, the discursive process of class among people creates a new identity for a certain group.

Bhabha's ambivalence is commonly read in a positive notion since it serves as a way out from what Said's Self-Other binary cannot explain. An example of the positive nuance of ambivalence can be seen in the article "Iranian Exilic Poetry in Australia: Reinventing the Third Space" written by Laetitia Nanquette in 2014. In this article Nanquette argues that the way the Poet makes her own style by combining both her original country's landscape and her new country's landscape provides her a quirk in the literary world. The poet also accepts a literary prize on her ambivalent poems

indicating the society's acceptance of her style, her ambivalent style. In this case, it can be said that the poet is successful in negotiating her new identity with the existed cultures. Besides the success story in achieving Third Space, there are also condition when the ambivalent character achieves no negotiated identity. The example is captures in the article entitled "Heirs of Ambivalence: The Study of the Identity Crisis of the Second-Generation Indian Americans in Jhumpa Lahiri's Interpreter of Maladies" written by Harehdasht et al. in 2018. In this article, the second generation Indian diaspora are in the ambivalence in constructing their identity, whether to introducing their new identity as a part of the American society which marginalized them or to identify themselves as a part of Indian immigrant which they have no experience being in the "homeland" India. In this article, they end up with their ambivalent identity. They prefer to be acknowledged as a part of the dominant culture, America in this case, indicating their incapability to negotiate between American society and their identity as a second-generation Indian immigrant.

DISCOURSE ON CREOLE IDENTIFY: FROM AMBIVALENCE TO MADNESS

Jean Ryes' Wide Saragosa Sea presents Creole as an ambivalent identity which leads to the madness for two major characters, Antoinette and Annette. As a Creole woman, Antoinette as well as her mother, Annette faces a situation that is being alienated from both the colonizer (British) and colonized (Jamaican). Creole is a mixture person of the European descendant and black people, especially the Caribbean. Performing an ambivalent identity, having an extreme alienated experience in the story drives these both women to the madness.

Annette's Ambivalence Identity to her Madness

The ambivalence of Annette's identity as a creole woman is depicted explicitly by Ryes. The position as a slave Dominican woman who married a master is a starting point for her. Then the depiction starts growing to the more complex situation on Jamaica in Coulibri Estate, the new plantation of her husband, especially when it entered the moment a year after the slavery liberation from the parliament the UK in 1833. The society becomes sensitive regarding the enslavement practice done by Mr. Cosway, his first husband. After the death of Mr. Cosway, she needs to fight for both economically and socially. The situation becomes worse by the time she married another white man/master, Mr. Madson. He is described as the one who has a lot of money and comes to seek peculiar gain from the fallen of economic in Jamaica. Under her second husband, the situation in Jamaica becomes worse. Her husband's economic greediness leads to the anger of the native. The anger turns into action when one of the Jamaican burn Annette's house down which resulted in the death of her son, Richard Mason. The death of her son leads to her madness.

The ambivalence of Annette's identity, the half white and half black puts her in the situation of not belonging to any of the group. For her husbands, she never really a wife, the love of their life, especially for Mr. Madson. Her position also places her as a colonizer through the eyes of the Jamaicans which results in their anger upon her. According to Bhabha, the conflict between people, between self and other is needed to achieve a discursive way out, a new identity which is hoped to be accepted by both cultures. Seen in the story that the figure, Annette, possesses not enough capital to present herself as a white and gains less social interaction to become accepted by society. More than that, her identity as a white makes her labeled as a colonizer first before her attitude as a part

of society. In this sense, she is unable to achieve the discursive position, the new identity accepted by both cultures. This failure to fulfill the agreement between self and others, the inexistence of the third space drives Annette to the imbalance mental situation. Even though, the direct cause of her madness is the loss of her boy, but the circumstances forcing that particular situation to happen is because of her (family) incapability to adjust in the society.

Antoinette's Ambivalence Identity to her Madness

As a main character in the story, Antoinette is presented as a creole woman under the oppress of patriarchal society, British colonizer and even Jamaican society. Being not belong to any of the group drives Antoinette into a madwoman (in the attic). The oppressions she experienced are distributed in all three chapters of the novel. Unlike the oppresses that happened to her mother, in her experience, the oppressions are intensified by the oppression within her marriage life with unknown Englishman which is presumed to be Mr. Rochester. Despite the oppression by the social life in Jamaican and alienated in English society as it is seen in the previous subtitle, her personal marriage even pushes her harder to be mad. Since she is a creole, she is considered not as a wife by this unknown Englishman, and only considered only as the object satisfying his (animal) desire. She has never been acknowledged as a woman which can feel the way Mr. Rochester can feel. He looks down at her. He even cheats on her by their own servant, Amelie. She is also treated as a madwoman when she tries to go away from her husband. She is carried away to England and locked up in the attic until the end of the story.

The source of Antoinette's misery life is her identity as a creole. Her ambivalent identity influences her husband's attitudes toward her. Despite all the discrimination she

experienced during childhood until the moment she married Mr. Rochester, her marriage life is the direct cause of her madness. Being a creole places her into a pathetic life journey. Her current condition, even though it is beyond her will, damages her present situation. Her surroundings are the entities who fail to accept the existence of the third space, the ambivalent identity.

CONCLUSION

It is observed throughout Rhys' *Wide Saragossa Sea* that it is not simply the self and other binary relation which influences the oppression between races. The fact that there is a race between, there is an entity with a mixture identity which also experiences the discrimination needs to be highlighted. Annette and Antoinette are the examples of the ambivalent identities experiencing social oppression because of there is no discursive way out upon it. They present how racial discrimination is a complex situation.

REFERENCES

- Bhabha, Homi K. 2002. *The Location of Culture*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffiths, and Helen Tiffin. 2007. *Post-Colonial Studies: The Key Concepts*. London: Routledge.
- Harehdasht, Hossein Aliakbari, Muhammad Ataee, and Leila Hajjari. 2018. Heirs of Ambivalence: The Study of the Identity Crisis of the Second-Generation Indian Americans in Jhumpa Lahiri's *Interpreter of Maladies*, *International Journal of Applied Linguistics & English Literature*, 7 (2), 113-120.
- Nanquette, Laetitia. 2014. Iranian Exilic Poetry in Australia: Reinventing the Third Space. *Anitpodes*, 28(2), 393-

403.

doi:10.13110/antipodes.28.2.0393

Ramazani, Jon Stallworthy and Jahan, Eds.
2006. *The Norton Anthology of English Literature: The Twentieth Century and After*. New York: W. W. Norton & Company.

Rhys, Jean. 1999. *Wide Sargasso Sea*. New York: W. W. Norton & Company.

Ambivalence of Identity and Dislocation Seen in “Lotus Eater” by W. Somerset Maugham and “The Prisoner Who Wore Glasses” by Bessie Head

Christoforus Sigi Bramaditya
Sanata Dharma University
e-mail: sbramaditya@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

This paper focuses on identifying the ambivalence and displacement seen in two short stories. The first is “Lotus Eater” by W. Somerset Maugham and the second is “The Prisoner Who Wore Glasses” by Bessie Head. Both of the stories tell us about the cultural contact which occurs in the colonial era where there are differences of culture and power operate. This paper uses Bhabha’s theory of ambivalence and dislocation in order to scrutinize the ambivalence and dislocation in the two short stories. This research paper finds out that in those stories, the ambivalent identity and sense of dislocation emerge and affect to both sides interacting in the cultural contact. Both the ambivalent identity and the sense of dislocation operate together to tell the complex relation of the entities inside the stories.

Keywords: *cultural contact, ambivalent identity, displacement*

INTRODUCTION

Facing the postcolonial era makes us realize that the cultural contact is a common thing. Especially in this globalization era, we are getting more familiar to it as there is no nation can isolate itself from the global contact. The cultural encounter results in the emergence of hybridity. Hybridity is a creation of new transcultural forms (Bhabha, 1994). In this process, new unique individuals are created from a cross between two cultures. However, this process of creating hybridity sometimes can spark a problem which is caused by the difference of culture. The most common problem is how the difference of identity and place affect someone’s performance in the society.

In post-colonial criticism, problems of identity and place become two of the most discussed concepts which are related to the emergence of cultural contact and hybridity. The idea of identity and place are important to be scrutinized further in order to understand how the colonial discourse has penetrated all aspects of human life. Both cases of identity and place in postcolonial criticism are highly related to the theory of ambivalence. According to Bhabha, ambivalence describes the complex mix of attraction and repulsion that characterizes the relationship between colonizer and colonized (Bhabha, 1994). This complex situation has led the case of identity and place in postcolonial discussion become interesting to be discussed as the ambivalence creates a state where the idea of identity and place become fluid not merely restricted to binary opposition of colonizer and colonizer or dominant and subversive. This condition of

ambivalence and dislocation can occur to both sides interact in the cultural contact.

There are two short stories that will be discussed in this paper. The first is "Lotus Eater" by W. Somerset Maugham and the second is "The Prisoner Who Wore Glasses" by Bessie Head. Both of the stories tells us about the cultural contact which occur in the colonial era. The first one tells about the cultural interaction between a settler and the natives in Naples, and the second tells about the interaction of the colonizer and the colonized in South Africa. In such situation, there must be ambivalent condition. Therefore, it is important scrutinize how the concept of ambivalence seen in the short stories especially when we talk about the idea of place and identity. This paper will elaborate that the ambivalent identity and the sense of dislocation operates together.

AMBIVALENCE OF IDENTITY AND DISLOCATION IN "LOTUS EATER"

The ambivalence and sense of dislocation in the short story "Lotus Eater" by Somerset Maugham can be seen firstly from how Wilson, as the main character, always romanticizes the beauty of the island of Capri. Wilson is an Englishman who inhabits Capri for fifteen years. "Fifteen years it is, and when I look back it seems like a month... But it wasn't the wine that made me drunk, it was the shape of the island and those jabbering people, the moon and the sea and the oleander in the hotel garden. I'd never seen an oleander before (4)." Although, he is an Englishman, he feels like the island is his true home after such miserable events happened to his family in England. He thinks that there he can find "leisure time" after such toil in his employment in England and after several family misfortune he had. He feels like he is attracted there and after such hard considerations he inhabits the island. As he lives displaced now from his native country, the practice of inhabiting becomes very substantial for him in order to find a

sense of belonging. This practice of habitation is more than the occupying of a location, it is itself a way of being within which, and through which, place comes to be (Aschroft, 2001). With inhabiting the island, he has to survive and feel it like his own home to build a sense of belonging.

Despite his attraction to the island, I find here that actually he feels ambivalent toward his sense of belonging in the island. I find that he always keeps boundaries and limits his interaction with the people of the island regardless of their locality or nationality.

"He bathed; he walked a great deal, and he seemed never to lose his sense of the beauty of the island which he knew so intimately; he played the piano and he played patience; he read. When he was asked to a party he went and, though a trifle dull, was agreeable. He was not affronted if he was neglected. He liked people, but with an aloofness that prevented intimacy" (p. 7).

This act of keeping boundaries can be the sign that he actually feels displaced in the island. In a new environment, act of keeping boundaries marks that a person has difficulty in assimilating into the new culture and, slowly, a sense of seclusion will start to emerge (Kaur and Singh, 2014). Wilson keeps himself away from the closeness to the people of the island and he does not talk much with other people that makes other people wonder about him. To find a sense of belonging usually someone will befriend or interact closely to the society but not with Wilson.

After his wife and mother died, he feels alone especially that he has no close relative in England anymore. "None. I was an only child. My father had a brother, but he went to Australia before I was born. I don't think anyone could easily be more alone in the world than I am" (5). This sense of loneliness leads him to feel displaced. Displacement is actually a common problem faced by person who

leaves his native land. Leaving the comforts of home and the familiarity of a routine daily life often leads to a feeling of displacement (Kaur and Singh, 2014). Wilson has to face this that he is not with his usual routine and relatives anymore. He feels attracted to the beauty of the island but his sense of displacement has created an ambivalent situation which creates the unique representation of Wilson in the story.

Further ambivalent situation of Wilson in "Lotus Eater" can be seen from his complex identity in the story. Wilson who was an Englishman owned a respectable position in his job when he was in England. He was a bank manager, in which the salary of a bank manager must be enough for him to be classified as the upper middle class person in the society. "Yes. I was manager of the Crawford Street branch of the York and City. It was convenient for me because I lived up Hendon way" (5). However, his way of living in the island is way different from his life in England. The narrator in the first sight of Wilson actually describes him as "he looked like the manager of a branch office in an insurance company, who should by rights be wearing a black coat with pepper-and-salt trousers, a white collar, and an unobjectionable tie" (2) but the way he lives up in the island is opposite "He lived thriftily, but with sufficient comfort. He never owed a penny" (7). This ambivalent identity is caused by the fact that he left his homeland. Leaving one's own country puts the person in "diaspora" and brings him/her "hybridity" and "ambivalence" (Zohdi, 2017). In fact, sense of home plays a crucial function in stability of one's identity. Therefore, a sense of displacement can be the main cause of an ambivalent identity.

AMBIVALENCE OF IDENTITY AND DISLOCATION IN "THE PRISONER WHO WORE GLASSES"

In the story "The Prisoner Who Wore Glasses" by Bessie Head, I can find similar problems of ambivalent identity and displacement. The story tells about a clash between a white South African warden and an African prisoner named Brille. The postcolonial concept of place and identity here is clearly seen from the setting and characters. The setting is in the South African prison and the character's conflict is between the white minorities who rule the authority versus the black prisoners who oppose the system.

Prison in the story here presents as the boundary control that can be seen in the story as a place where the dominant exercises his power. Prison is the most concrete model possible of the coercive and surveillant power of a dominant authority, and when we observe the responses of political prisoners, particularly in South African prison writing, we find a concentrated example of transformative responses to imperial boundaries (Aschroft, 2000). Hannetjie, as the warden is seen firstly as the strictest warden who ward Brille and the Span One. He has ever violently punished Brille, as Brille steals a cabbage. "The next thing Warder Hannetjie whipped out a knobkerrie and gave Brille several blows about the head" (3). Here we see that Hannetjie, as the white warden is more dominant than the prisoners. He

also refuses to take order or answer back to the prisoners as he considers the prisoners as "kaffir" who are the racial acknowledgment given to the black South Africans by the white people. This is one strategy of the dominant to suppress the identity of the prisoners and give them a sense of displacement.

Although in this place, where the boundaries are overt, the ambivalent

situation can still occur. As Bhabha said, the ambivalent situation is disturbing the binary concept and the monolithic power of the colonizer (Aschroft, 2000), here we see that there is ambivalent situation between the warden and the prisoner. Hannetjie, who is supposed to be the dominant then becomes less dominant as his affair of stealing the prison's fertilizer stock was found out by Brille. "I saw Hannetjie in the shed today, I caught him in the act of stealing five bags of fertilizer, and he bribed me to keep my mouth shut" (3). After this event, Brille and Span One decide to give Hannetjie punishment back in order to make him cooperate with them. Hannetjie falls to their trick and the domination of him is over. Here, his action towards Brille and Span One becomes ambivalent, in one side he has to maintain his position higher as a warden but in the other side he has to cooperate with the prisoner. "He [Hannetjie] had a way of producing unheard-of luxuries like boiled eggs from his farm nearby and things like cigarettes, and Span One responded nobly and got the reputation being the best work span in the camp. And it wasn't only taking from their side. They were awfully good at stealing commodities like fertilizer which were needed on the farm of Warden Hannetjie" (4). This situation alters the

CONCLUSION

The cultural interaction between two different cultures can lead to such ambivalent situation where the idea of identity and place become more complex. Interacting in two different cultures can build up a sense of dislocation where someone loses the feeling of belonging and creates boundary with the society. The sense of dislocation then disrupts the identity of the people and makes them ambivalent. The ambivalence of identity experienced by an individual is also due to the clash of culture with different power when they disagree about a certain value. They are torn with the condition where their own old identity should be pre-

identities of Hannetjie. This alteration including ambivalence and in-betweenness in their social, psychological and cultural attitudes and perspectives towards world, people and themselves (Oguz, 2013).

The ambivalent situation is caused by the failure of the prison system to suppress the identity of the prisoners. The prisoner's identity is still strongly preserved but the warden's identity here is suppressed and led toward ambivalence. Werbner as cited in Olson states that in the colonial encounter, it is not just the colonized who are subjected to Western ways, the colonizers too are transformed, while the colonized deploy borrowed forms to tell their own, distinct narratives which unsettle and subvert the cultural authority of the colonizers (Olson, 2010). Therefore, the ambivalence condition is not always occurred to the subservient but can also occur to the dominant. The warden, Hannetjie, who seems to be ruthless is the one who finally fails to survive in the system that is his own culture's invention. His identity now is in ambivalence as he starts to cooperate with the Span One. His ambivalence is the mark of colonialism that cannot fully control the identity of the entities interacting inside it.

served but in the other hand they must adapt to the new one like what happens to Wilson, from the first story. His identity as an Englishman becomes ambivalent due to the interaction of two cultures, between him and the people of Capri and also there is a sense of displacement that strengthens the ambivalent situation faced by Wilson.

Ambivalence might also occur to both of the colonizer and colonized and affect to the disturbance of the monolithic power of the colonizer. In an ambivalent situation, there is a clash of two different cultures and power of the dominant and the subservient. Not only the subservient that can be ambivalent but also the dominant. It presents in the second story that tells the clash

of power between the white warden and the African prisoners. The warden is faced with ambivalent situation when the prison that should be the system of displacing the prisoners fails to contain them. The prisoners' identity is still strongly preserved but the warden's identity here is suppressed and led toward ambivalence. Thus, an ambivalent identity is later formed by the warden to survive.

International Journal of Applied Linguistics & English Literature.

<http://docs.lib.purdue.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1323&context=ijpbl> on October 24, 2014.

REFERENCES

- Ashcroft, Bill. 2001. *Post-colonial Transformation*. New York: Routledge.
- Bhabha, Homi K. 1994. *The Location of Culture*. London: Routledge.
- Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffith, Helen Tiffin. 2000. *Post-Colonial Studies: The Key Concepts Second Edition*. New York: Routledge.
- Burhanudin, Arif. 2017. "The Ambivalence of Identity as a Result of Intergenerational Cultural Clash in PP Wong's *The Life of a Banana*."
- Hardev Kaur and Jugar Singh. 2014. "A Study of Displacement in Jean Rhys' Novel *Wide Sargasso Sea*." *Advances in Language and Literary Studies*
- Oguz, Dr. Ayla. 2013. "Ambivalence and In-betweenness in Hanif Kureishi's *The Buddha Of Suburbia* and Doris Lessing's *Victoria and The Staveney's*." *The Journal of Academic Social Science Studies*.
- Olsson, Monica. 2010. "Colonial Legacies - Ambivalence, mimicry and hybridity in Chinua Achebe's *Things Fall Apart* and Louise Erdrich's *Tracks*." (2010).
- Zohdi, Esmaeil. 2017. "Lost-identity; A Result of "Hybridity" and "Ambivalence" in Tayeb Salih's *Season of Migration to the North*."

The Function of Myth within Noah's and Utanapishtim's Stories: A Comparative Analysis of the Deluge in *Genesis 6-9* and *the Epic of Gilgamesh Tablet XI*

Natan Setiawan Gultom

Sanata Dharma University

e-mail: natangultom@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Ancient stories which depict similarities in their details of the narrative can be found in various cultures and civilization. Two stories that look similar to each other are the ancient text of The Epic of Gilgamesh and the Biblical book of Genesis. The deluge, observed in both stories, seems to have an impact towards the ever-famous discussion of which story is more authentic. This article gives a comparative analysis of both stories. The aim of this study does not concern with such discussions, rather arguing how both stories, after investigating the similarities and differences, generates a myth—which may come from a factual history—for their respective people and culture, preserving cultural history, rational conducts, and religious rituals of each culture concerned.

Keywords: *Genesis, Epic of Gilgamesh, Noah, Utanapishtim, Ancient Text, Mythology*

INTRODUCTION

It is fascinating to explore how many of the same stories, mostly ancient ones, can be found in different cultures and languages. A story that has its similarities in many cultures is the legend of great flood. In fact, Mark Isaak has an extensive list of flood legends across the continents (Isaak, 2002). Two of the prominent and ancient flood stories familiar in our ears are the stories from the epic of Gilgamesh and the biblical story of Noah and his ark. Many studies have argued that the epic of Gilgamesh resembles the Bible's story of Noah's Ark, or vice versa.

The epic of Gilgamesh originates from twelve fire-hardened mud tablets which was written in cuneiform, based on the Mesopotamian culture around 2.500 BCE. This epic poem is regarded as the earliest

surviving great work of literature. In summary, this epic can be divided into two halves. The first half mainly discusses the great king of Uruk, Gilgamesh, and his adventures with Enkidu, an enemy that eventually befriended Gilgamesh. The second half of the epic tells the story of Gilgamesh after the loss of Enkidu, his dearly departed friend. Gilgamesh is distressed about his own death and undertook a perilous journey for discovering eternal life. Eventually, he meets an immortal Utanapishtim, who tells his own journey about a great flood and his story of becoming eternal living with the gods.

In the biblical story, Noah is one of the prominent characters in the book of Genesis. He is the representation of the patriarch, who was chosen by God, to confront the human race and their

wickedness by means of great flood. God instructed Noah to build an ark and took with him species of the world's animals to replenish the earth. The traditions of great apocalyptic flood run deep in the characters of Utanapishtim and Noah. Utanapishtim is introduced in the Tablet XI of the Gilgamesh epic who, like Noah, survived a deluge by following the divine instructions to build an ark. In this essay, I compare the two stories where hints of the commonalities and crucial differences of flood are evident.

NOAH VS. UTANAPISHTIM

The story of Noah is found in the Book of Genesis. This is the first book in the Hebrew Bible and the first book in the Christian Old Testament (Hamilton, 1990: 1). It is the Judaism's account concerning the world creation and the origins of its people (Sweeney, 2012: 657). The flood is depicted specifically in the chapters 6-9. Throughout these chapters we have the textual biblical basis of the flood narrative. In these chapters, Noah is portrayed as a righteous man, and is faithful to the supreme deity in Judaism, Yahweh. Yahweh sees the corruption of the human race, whose hearts and deeds are filled with violence. Yahweh instructed Noah to build an ark so that he and his family, along with the male and female of all living animals, would be saved from the deluge.

As with Utanapishtim, this character is found in the second half of the Gilgamesh epic when Gilgamesh, the protagonist, is riddled and burdened in dealing with death. Tablet XI is the primary source concerning Utanapishtim and the deluge. In the effort to escape death and search for immortality, Gilgamesh's journey found its way to the doorsteps of Utanapishtim. Gilgamesh is given the secrets and knowledge pertaining to eternal life. Based of the story written in Tablet XI, Utanapishtim is the survivor of the deluge in the Babylonian epic. He was the only person to escape death, and preserved the hu-

man race and animal life in the great boat he built. By these deeds, he is blessed by Enlil and is granted immortality.

Of these biblical narrative and Gilgamesh epic, there are found similarities and differences. (The biblical text referred to in this study is the New International Version; the narrative of Utanapishtim is the translations of Maureen Gallery Kovacs and his simple but accurate translation of Tablet XI [Kovacs, 1998]).

The flood

In Tablet XI, the first mention of the flood is in the 15th line, "The hearts of the Great Gods moved them to inflict the Flood". This is the secret that Utanapishtim shares to Gilgamesh and Utanapishtim received such warning by Ea. "Ea, the Clever Prince(?), was under oath with them [the councils of the gods] so he repeated their talk to the reed house" (line 20). Ea told Utanapishtim through a reed wall of a reed house. The coming of the flood is clearly shown in the tablet. In Genesis, by contrast, Noah was warned by Yahweh, "I am going to put an end to all people, for the earth is filled with violence because of them. I am surely going to destroy both of them and the earth. So make yourself an ark" (6:13-14). The mention of the flood is implicit where Yahweh is going to end mankind and gives Noah the order to make an ark. From both texts, here we can see the similarities about the coming of the flood and its warning from the respective gods.

The differences between the two texts, however, are also evident. In Tablet XI, the reason why the gods sent flood is absent, while in the Bible the reason is given. In the former, as many, on the basis of various sources and translations, argue, the reason of the flood is that of excessive human noisiness that troubles the gods to sleep (but such depiction is not mentioned specifically in Tablet XI). In the latter, Genesis mentions that Yahweh "saw how great man's wickedness on the earth was... God was grieved that he had made man on the

earth" (6:5-6), so God "will wipe mankind ... from the face of the earth" (6:7). In relation to this coming calamity, a further question can be raised with regard to the reason of why, of all the people living in their respective time, Noah and Utanapishtim were the "chosen ones". In the tablet, the details on the worthiness of such information about Utanapishtim seems absent. In Genesis, by contrast, it is written that "Noah was a righteous man, blameless among the people of his time, and he walked with God" (6:9). This reason of Noah's righteousness and blamelessness are in contrast with the wickedness of his contemporaries (6:11-12). Due to his righteousness, Noah is deemed worthy to carry out the divine plans.

As the flood was revealed, the characters' response to such news for his neighbors and contemporaries can then be learned. In Genesis, however, such an account is absent, although there are hints that Noah, the "preacher of righteousness", warned his neighbors of the upcoming calamity (as is in the New Testament: 2 Ptr. 2:4-5). In Tablet XI, by contrast, Utanapishtim was told by Ea to deceive his neighbors so that they may continue to help him finish his boat. The calamity brought forth from the flood was to be told as a good omen or blessing for the people.

Ea spoke, commanding me, his servant:

'You, well then, this is what you must say to them: "It appears that Enlil is rejecting me so I cannot reside in your city (?), nor set foot on Enlil's earth.

I will go down to the Apsu to live with my lord, Ea, and upon you he will rain down abundance, a profusion of fowl, myriad(!) fishes.

He will bring to you a harvest of wealth, in the morning he will let loaves of bread shower down, and in the evening a rain of wheat!" (line 37-47)

One profound way of how the flood covered the earth was by the pouring storm and

rain. Both stories tell about a storm, but the account of rain covering the land differs in details, especially in the terms of duration. The tablet mentions, "When the seventh day arrived, the storm was pounding ... The sea calmed, fell still, the whirlwind (and) flood stopped up" (line 135 and 137). In the Gilgamesh epic, the rain causing the flood lasted for seven days. In contrast, Genesis tells a different duration, "And rain fell on the earth for forty days and forty nights" (7:12). The whole flood duration is also different. The tablet mentions, "When the seventh day arrived I sent forth a dove and released it" (line 156-157) (after the pouring rain for seven days). So, the whole duration of the Babylonian flood was 14 days. Meanwhile, Genesis mentions "In the six hundredth year of Noah's life, on the seventeenth day of the second month—on that day all the springs of the great deep burst forth, and the floodgates of the heavens were opened" (7:11). By this, we learn that Noah's flood lasted for 370 days.

Clearly, both texts mention flood as a doom device for human race, but further explorations of the details show differences in terms of: 1) the reason the gods sent the flood, 2) the absence of reasoning why Utanapishtim was the one given the flood revelation, 3) the absence of Noah's response for his contemporaries after the flood information was revealed, 4) the differences in the length of days the storm and rain impacted the flood, and 5) the whole flood duration.

The Ark

The next similarity the two stories have in common pertains to the ark or boat as a means of salvation. In the tablet, after revealing the information of the upcoming flood to Utanapishtim, Ea directly gave him instructions to "Tear down the house and build a boat!" (line 24). In Noah's account, the same instruction was given after Yahweh gave his reason for destroying mankind, "I am surely going to destroy both of them and the earth. So make yourself an

ark” (6:13-14). The logic of both stories is well in check where the means to survive a deluge was in the making of an ark. The ark holds a significant role in both stories and now we continue to search the differences of the ark within each story.

The first difference is concerned with its size. Both stories mention the length, the width, and the height of it. In the tablet, “its walls were 10 times 12 cubits in height, the sides of its top were of equal length, 10 times its cubits each” (line 57-58). It is also mentioned that “its dimensions must measure equal to each other: its length must correspond to its width” (line 29 and 30). In Genesis, the size of the ark is stated, “the ark is to be 450 feet long, 75 feet wide and 45 feet high”. In the description of the size, the shape is seen differently; Noah’s ark is more of a rectangular-shaped boat, while Utanapishtim’s is much more of a square or cube. Within each ark, decks are created for compartments and spaces. In Genesis, the description of the decks reads, “Put a door in the side of the ark and make lower, middle, and upper decks” (6:16). In the tablet, Utanapishtim himself “provided it with six decks” (line 60). So, the number of decks is different, a comparison of 3 and 6 decks. The character who closes the ark’s door is also different. In Genesis, “the animals going in were male and female of every living thing”, as God had commanded Noah. In the tablet, the LORD “shut him in” (7:16) where Shamash told Utanapishtim to “go inside the boat, [and] seal the entry” (line 93).

The different description of who or what enters the ark is also noticeable. As with the humans entering the ark, Genesis records, “But I will establish my covenant with you, and you will enter the ark—you and your sons and your wife and your sons’ wives with you” (6:18). In the tablet, Utanapishtim “had all my kith and kin go up into the boat ... and the craftsmen I had go up” (line 87-89). In the Noah story, the people who entered the ark were exclusive, only limited to Noah and his direct family,

such as his wife, sons, and daughters-in-law. In the Gilgamesh epic, more people entered the boat, not just eight, meaning that it is not only exclusively his own family and kin, but also the craftsmen of the ark as well. In terms of what possessions that entered the ark, both accounts mentioned the preservation of animals to bring them into it. Genesis 6:19 affirms this, “You are to bring into the ark two of all living creatures, male and female, to keep them alive with you.” In the tablet, we see the preservation of animals as it reads, “all the beasts and animal of the field” shall enter the boat. In addition to humans and animals, the tablet also mentions that Utanapishtim’s wealth was to be brought in the boat as well. “Whatever I had I loaded on it: whatever silver I had I loaded on it, whatever gold I had I loaded on it.” In Genesis, such mentioning of material wealth is absent, but the possibility of Noah’s loading his wealth into the ark as Utanapishtim did might also make sense.

Both texts mention the ark or boat as a means of salvation. Differences in details appear with respect to: 1) the size and the shape of the ark or boat, 2) the sum of the decks inside, 3) the character who closes the ark’s door, 4) the sum of people entering the ark, and 5) the material wealth preserved by Utanapishtim and the absence of such preservation by Noah.

The Aftermath

Eventually, the flood receded and both accounts tell this in each narrative. The important means of telling the decline of the flood waters is the sending of the birds. This is quite interesting in details. While both texts do claim the role of birds in telling the decline of the waters, differences in detail persist. In the tablet, here is the account of Utanapishtim:

When a seventh day arrived
I sent forth a dove and released it.
The dove went off, but came back to me;
no perch was visible so it circled back to me. I sent forth a swallow and released it.

The swallow went off, but came back to me; no perch was visible so it circled back to me. I sent forth a raven and released it. The raven went off, and saw the waters slither back.

It eats, it scratches, it bobs, but does not circle back to me. (line 156-165) In Genesis, the account of sending off the birds is mentioned in Ch. 8:6-12:

Noah opened the window he had made in the ark and sent out a raven, and it kept flying back and forth until the water had dried up from the earth. Then he sent out a dove to see if the water had receded from the surface of the ground. But the dove could not find no place to set its feet because there was water over all the surface of the earth; so it returned to Noah in the ark. He reached out his hand and took the dove and brought it back to himself in the ark. He waited seven more days and again sent out the dove from the ark. When the dove returned to him in the evening, there in its beak was a freshly plucked olive leaf! Then Noah knew that the water had receded from the earth. He waited seven more days and sent the dove out again, but this time it did not return to him.

The most unique feature of similarities of both accounts probably lies in the release of birds to detect the receding waters. Some significant differences are apparent between the two, however. In the tablet, the first bird sent by Utanapishtim is a dove, whereas in Genesis, Noah sent out a raven first. The second bird sent in the Gilgamesh epic is a swallow, while in Genesis it is a dove. The third bird sent out by Utanapishtim is a raven, while in Genesis it is the dove, which is sent out again, the return of which brings along with it an olive leaf. In Genesis, the dove is sent out the third time and it does not return.

Both stories also conclude with an offering after the flood. After the recession of the waters, "Noah built an altar to the LORD and, taking some of all the clean animals and clean birds, he sacrificed burnt

offerings on it" (8:20). In the Gilgamesh, Utanapishtim "sent out everything in all directions and sacrificed (a sheep). I offered incense in front of the mountain-ziggurat. Seven and seven cult vessels I put in place, and (into the fire) underneath (or: into their bowls), I poured reeds, cedar, and myrtle" (line 166-171). The details of the offerings were also different. The Gilgamesh epic describes the offering of sheep and wines. Meanwhile, in Genesis, Noah gives burnt offerings of all the clean animals on the ark, but no drink offering. Although it may seem unusual thing to do, the cultures of offering at the time would be deemed as an act of appreciation (thanksgiving).

One possible explanation for the multiple ancient passed on across generations of different cultures and preserved in the form of myths. Myth is a story from ancient times, especially one which narrates supernatural events or describes early history of a people. It is a story about supernatural characters (gods, goddesses, or spirits) used to validate their belief system, understanding of the world, or practical religious observance in life (Maduka, 2000: 52). The story in Genesis and the Gilgamesh epic "serves to explain (in terms of the intentions and actions of deities, other supernatural beings, and heroes) why the world is as it is and things happen as they do to provide a rationale for social customs and observances and to establish the sanctions for the rules by which people conduct their lives" (Abrams, 2005: 206).

CONCLUSION

We have flood accounts is that the flood was a real event in the history of mankind, and was examined the similarities and differences between the Epic of Gilgamesh and the Genesis account of flood in the Bible. There are a number of similarities and differences between the two. Differences and similarities pertaining to the details would also be found in many

more ancient flood accounts by locality around the Middle East.

Passed on from one generation to the next, both accounts can be conveniently preserved as myths. In this frame, similarities found in the story of Noah and that of Gilgamesh may confer similar roots of history and geographical location. In terms of differences, each story provides a rationale of conduct and rules for how people live and how religious beliefs are constructed—one in the social construct of Judaism and the other in an old Babylon society. The realization of myth as a means of providing basis of cultural history (the flood story), creating rational conduct and rules (the making of the ark), and religious practices and beliefs (the aftermath of flood by giving sacrifices and offerings) will result a more fruitful and beneficial discussion of ancient stories. It outweighs the discussion or debates about which version of the story is the most authentic or famous, or from which a similar version might be merely copied.

Maduka, Chidi and Luke Eyoh. 2000. *Fundamental of Poetry*. Uyo: Scholars Press, 2000.

Sweeney, Marvin. 2012. "Genesis in the Context of Jewish Thought". In Evans, Craig A.; Lohr, Joel N. (eds). *The Book of Genesis: Composition, Reception, and Interpretation*. Boston: BRILL.

REFERENCES

Abrams, M. H. 2005. *A Glossary of Literary Terms*. Canada: Wadsworth.

Hamilton, Victor P. 1990. *The Book of Genesis: Chapters 1-17*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans. Isaak, Mark. September 2002. *Flood Stories from Around the World*. The TalkOrigins Archive, 2 September. <http://www.talkorigins.org/faqs/flood-myths.html>. Accessed on 26 September 2019.

Kovaks, Maureen G. 1998. "Tablet XI The Story of The Flood." *The Epic of Gilgamesh*, Academy of Ancient Text <https://www.ancienttexts.org/library/mesopotamian/gilgamesh/tab11.htm>. Accessed on 26 September 2019.

Code-Switching and Portuguese Influence in the Invention of Tetun-Portu as a Creole

Jean Antunes Rudolf Zico Ma'u

Sanata Dharma University

e-mail: jeanmau1510@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

A creole is a pidgin that has attained the first generation of the speaker. The formation of a creole might be influenced by several factors and the two of them are code-switching and the influence of a dominant language. In relation to the two factors, there is a creole that might fit the situation. The creole is the Tetun-Portu language and the creole is presumably invented from the combination between the Tetun-Terik language and the Portuguese language. The backbone of the language might be adopted from the Tetun-Terik language but the codes have been dominated by the Portuguese language. The invention of the creole might be related to the Portuguese occupation in the Timor Island several centuries ago. Due to the interesting characteristics, the researcher would like to investigate the creole further. In conducting the study, the focus will be on how the code-switching influence the invention of the creole and the Portuguese influence within the invention of the creole itself. The findings of the study confirm that the Tetun-Portu language might be considered as a creole because it has completely different structures and it has adopted more codes from the Portuguese language.

Keywords: *Creole, Tetun-Terik, Tetun-Portu, code-switching, Portuguese influence*

INTRODUCTION

Language as means of communication is always interesting to study. Since the nature of language is to bridge communication among the users, it can be very flexible and thus different from one region to another. In addition, language can also be absorbing other codes in order to build mutual understanding between the two parties who are involved in the communication. This situation is depicted clearly by a language phenomenon known as creole. A creole might be formed by combining two different languages into one and such combination might be very subtle that one might not find the trace of the origins of the two languages.

Before stepping any further, a definition of creole should be provided first. Creole is

formed first from pidgin. A pidgin is a language that does not have any native speakers; in the very first place, it is a contact language (Wardhaugh, 2006). The formation of pidgin is enabled by a multilingual situation in which those who want to establish communication should find or improvise a simple language system. The language system then will enable the invention of mutual communication. If the multilingual situation is related to colonization as the influencing factor, then the imbalance of power may be the main factor behind the invention of pidgin. The reason is that the speakers of one language dominate the speakers of other languages. Specific to the case of the study, the speakers of Portu language had dominated the speakers of the Tetun language.

Overtime the pidgin certainly develops itself so that it will acquire native speakers. When a pidgin has attained its native speakers, it will be regarded as creole. Creole therefore can be regarded simply as pidgin that has attained its native speakers (Holmes, 2013); or in a more complicated manner creole may be defined as a pidgin that has become the first language of a new generation of speakers. Pidgin is enabled to be creole only when it is mastered by the new generation of speakers or when it has become the mother tongue of the new generation. As a result, the creole will be used as the daily language. When this creole is related to the context of colonization, apparently the creole serve as the communication means between the colonizer and the colonized. To put it simply, creole serves as the language of the slaves. The position of such language thus becomes important in order that the colonizer may exert their power onto the colonized.

One creole from the context of colonization is Tetun-Portu. Tetun-Portu is a creole resulted from the combination between the original Tetun language and the Portuguese language. The background behind the invention of the creole can be found in the historical fact that Portuguese conquered East Timor first in 1515 and their occupation was marked by the establishment of their first fortress in this region within the same year (TirtoID, 2017). Prior to their conquest upon East Timor, the Portuguese first landed in the Ternate Sultanate around 1512 (one year after they conquered Malaka under the leadership of Alfonso d'Albuquerque). Their original plan was to conquer Molluca but, unfortunately, their presence in this region was followed by Spain. In the same time, there was a battle between the two sultanates there namely the Ternate Sultanate and the Tidore Sultanate. As a result, the two countries were engaged in the battle for their own interest. The

Portuguese assisted the Ternate Sultanate while the Spanish assisted the Tidore Sultanate. In 1522, the Portuguese were permitted to establish a fortress in the Ternate Sultanate under the following conditions: the Portuguese should help the Ternate Sultanate to fight the Tidore Sultanate. As something in return, the Portuguese demanded that the Ternate Sultanate sell their clovers to the Portuguese only. In other words, the Portuguese wanted to monopolize the clover trade in this region.

In 1562, a new Sultan was crowned and his name was Sultan Baabullah. Under his reign, the relationship between the Portuguese and the Ternate Sultanate got worse. Then, in 1575 Sultan Baabullah demanded the Portuguese to leave his sultanate and finally in 1578 the Portuguese completely fled themselves to the Tidore Sultanate and the Timor Island. Presumably, their presence in the Tidore Sultanate was not long because the Spanish still had their influence in that area. Therefore, the Portuguese continued their escape to the Timor Island. As a result, the Portuguese finally conquered the whole island around the same year. Based on the urban stories told from one generation to another, the Portuguese catholicize the local people and they even took the royal prince from the local kingdoms to be their advisors. Most of the royal prince came back home but they were unable to speak the original Tetun language since they often used the Tetun Portu language in their daily communication with the Portuguese. Ever since then, the Tetun Portu language started to be spoken until the present day.

Tetun-Portu creole has drawn the interest of many linguistics. An early study toward the creole spoken in the Timor Island dated back to 1992 and 1995. In 1992, the Department of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia conducted a research on the morphological system of the predicate of Tetun language and the

conclusions of the study are as follows: (a) it seems the predicate of Tetun language has closed characteristics; (b) the membership of the predicate is relatively limited; (c) the predicates are also found in multiple types of discourse, speech style, and problems; and (d) there are also predicates that have been similar to those of Bahasa Indonesia (Soedjatno, Solchan, Aminoedin, & Djajengwasito, 1992). On the other hand, in 1995 the Department of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia conducted another study and the focus of the study in this period was the oral literature of Tetun; the conclusion of the study has been that the oral tradition of Tetun plays significant role in multiple domains of Tetun society (Suarjana, Ardana, Sudiarga, & Negara, 1995).

Unfortunately, the two studies only focus on the Tetun in general instead of the creole Tetun-Portu whereas the case of the present study is the creole Tetun-Portu. From the name, the creole involves the fusion of two languages namely Tetun and Portu. Looking at the possibility of the fusion of the two languages, a creole should be sociohistorical (McWhorter, 1998). Based on the sociohistorical trait, there is another interesting aspect that should also be investigated within the invention of the creole Tetun-Portu, namely code-switching. Code-switching refers to the use of certain codes among certain people or addressees (Holmes, 2013). There is a possibility that code-switching occurs due to the efforts to maintain a major source of conversational implicatures (Scotton, 1982). These conversational implicatures are very important to maintain good communication in a multilingual community. Not to mention, during the period of the invention the Timor Island had been occupied by the Portuguese. Thus, Tetun-Portu has an important and even significant role to play within the daily communication at that period; however, there is a significant impact that the Tetun-Portu language has been in use up to date and this is the impact

of colonization that people are not aware of. As a result, the code-switching might also play a part in the invention of Tetun-Portu creole (St. Clair & Murai, 1974).

From the overall explanation, the Tetun-Portu creole seems to be interesting to study and since there are few studies that have been directed toward analysing the creole studying the creole might be worth to doing. In guiding the process of analysis, the main focus will be answering the question of how languages get mixed (DeCamp & Hancock, 1974). Then, the efforts of answering the main question will be performed by answering the two problems as follows:

1. How does the code-switching influence the invention of Tetun-Portu language?
2. How does the Portuguese people influence the invention of the Tetun-Portu language?

Through the two problems, it is expected that better a description on the Tetun-Portu Language might be provided so that better understanding toward the creole might be gained among the readers in general and the linguists in specific.

METHODOLOGY

The data for the analysis in the study were gathered through an informal focused group discussion (FGD). The participants of the FGD were the university students in the City of Yogyakarta who speak the creole Tetun-Portu, namely those who were presumably from the Timor Island. Then, the informal FGD was conducted on Saturday, May 12th, 2018. Within the informal FGD, the researcher had set a data gathering instrument. It consisted of 10 sentences of Bahasa Indonesia and their translation into English, Tetun-Terik, and Tetun-Portu, 10 vocabularies of Bahasa Indonesia and their translation into English, Tetun-Terik, and Tetun-Portu, and 10 questions on the predicate of Bahasa Indonesia and their translation into English,

Tetun-Terik, and Tetun-Portu. The 10 sentences in the first instrument were randomly selected from the studies on the oral tradition of Tetun-Terik language (Suarjana, Ardana, Sudiarga, & Negara, 1995) so that the use of Tetun-Portu might be confirmed.

Then, in order to support the data that had been found in the informal FGD the researcher conducted an informal interview. The informal interview involved three participants (2 males and 1 female) who speak Tetun-Terik, Tetun-Portu, or both languages. The speaker of Tetun-Terik was involved because the backbone of Tetun-Portu is the Tetun-Terik language. Within the interview, 10 questions around the creole were asked to all of the respondents. The interview was conducted in Bahasa Indonesia; as a consequence, the responses that had been gathered within the interview should be transcribed first and then all of these responses should be translated into English. All of the data that had been gathered would be analysed in order to depict the process of the creole invention.

DISCUSSION

After having conducted the informal focused group discussion (FGD) and interview, the findings would be presented and be discussed in the following sections. The focus of the discussions would be around the influence of code-switching in the invention of Tetun-Portu language and the Portuguese influence within the invention of the Tetun-Portu language.

The Influence of Code Switching in the Invention of Tetun-Portu Language

As having been stated in the introductory section of the paper, creole referred to a pidgin that had gained speakers or that has had the first generation of speakers. In relation to the definition, during the FGD several words from both languages, namely Tetun-Terik and Tetun-Portu, had been

gathered. These words were presented in the following table (Timor, 2018).

Table 1. Sampled Vocabulary between Tetun-Terik and Tetun-Portu

N o	Bahasa Indones ia	Englis h	Tetun- Portu	Tetun- Terik
1	Tidak	No	Na'ó	Lae
2	Tuan	Mister	Senhor	Nain
3	Jalan	Street	Rua	Dalan
4	Terima kasih	Thank you	Obrigad o	Obriga do Terima kasih
5	Bencana	Disast er	Desastr e	Desastr e Bencan a
6	Masalah	Proble m	Proble mo	Lia
7	Malas	Lazy	Barukte n	Baruk
8	Bekerja	Work	Servisu	Kriyan
9	Berangk at	Go	Boa viagem	Laon
10	Pulang	Return	Fila	Fila

The above vocabulary had been randomly selected in order to confirm that the two languages had different words or codes. From the vocabulary, it might be inferred that Tetun-Terik and Tetun-Portu have different codes. These codes were native to each region; however, some codes were similar not only to each other but also to the national language (Bahasa Indonesia). The solid example was code number 4: for saying terima kasih or thank you, the code was obrigado for both Tetun-Portu and Tetun-Terik (exactly the same from the

Portuguese code obrigado); in the same time, the code from Bahasa Indonesia terima kasih might also be used presumably in the daily conversation. The similar case was also found in code number 5 and also the other codes from the above vocabulary. Furthermore, there was another interesting finding, namely code number 3: for stating jalan (Bahasa Indonesia) or street (English), the code from Tetun-Terik was *dalan* and this code had exactly the same meaning as the code *dalan* in Javanese. This finding might be intriguing since several sources state that Gadjah Mada under the reign of Majapahit Empire expanded the territory up to the area of Timor Island; therefore, the code appearance might be the influence of the expansion. However, there should be further investigation on the case.

After gathering the different codes, analysis on the structure between the two languages should be conducted. The analysis aimed at seeing structure-level similarities or differences. Finding the similarities or differences in the structure level was very important in order to assure whether the Tetun-Portu was a creole or a mere code-switch in the daily life. Regarding the analysis, ten random sentences from Tetun-Terik and Tetun-Portu had been selected but three examples would be discussed further so that a brief yet complete understanding toward the Tetun-Portu might be established (Timor, 2018).

Table 2. First Example of the Comparison between Tetun-Terik and Tetun-Portu on the Structure-Level

Bahasa Indonesia	Seorang bapak dan seorang ibu mempunyai tujuh orang anak dan yang bungsu bernama Suri Ikun.
English	A father and a mother had seven children and the youngest one was named Suri Ikun.
Tetun-	Ema nia aman <u>ida</u> <u>no</u> <u>ema nia inan</u> <u>ida</u> iha oan nain hitu, <u>ida</u>

Terik	<u>Ikun</u> tau naran Suri Ikun.
Tetun-Portu	Ema nia aman <u>ho</u> <u>ferik</u> iha oan nain hitu, <u>no</u> <u>nia</u> <u>oan</u> <u>Ikun</u> naran Suri Ikun.

In a glance, the structure seemed to be quite similar. However, there were several codes in the Tetun-Terik language that had been omitted and been replaced in the Tetun-Portu language specifically *ida*. The code *ida* seemed to occupy the function of nominal marker *a* in English or *seorang* in Bahasa Indonesia. Probably, for the sake of effectiveness within the invention such codes had been omitted. Then, the code *no*, which means and or *dan*, had been replaced by *ho* with similar meaning. This, once again might have been the influence of Portuguese language. The structure itself looks quite different despite the similarity.

In the second sentence, more codes from Portuguese language had been adopted into the Tetun-Portu language and the structure was even more concise (Timor, 2018).

Table 3. Second Example of the Comparison between Tetun-Terik and Tetun-Portu on the Structure-Level

Bahasa Indonesia	Menurut cerita zaman dahulu, matahari dan bumi jaraknya tidak seperti sekarang ini.
English	According to the story from long time ago, the sun and the earth used to be close to each other.
Tetun-Terik	<u>Tuir ai</u> <u>kranok</u> <u>uluk</u> <u>nian</u> <u>katak loro</u> <u>no</u> <u>rai</u> <u>la</u> <u>dok</u> <u>malu</u> <u>hanesan</u> <u>oras</u> <u>ne'E</u> <u>daudaun</u> .
Tetun-Portu	<u>Histori</u> <u>uluk</u> <u>loron</u> <u>e</u> <u>rai</u> <u>la</u> <u>besik</u> <u>hansa</u> <u>agora</u> <u>ne</u> .

In this example, the structure of Tetun-Portu was briefer than that of Tetun-Terik. The brief structure could be seen from the

codes of Tetun-Terik that had been omitted and been replaced by the codes of Portuguese. Tuir ai kraonik (menurut cerita zaman dahulu/according to the story from long time ago) had been simply replaced by histori just the same as the other codes (loron e rai for nian katak loro no rai and besik hansa agora ne for dok malu hanesan oras ne'E daudaun). Such replacement implied that the Tetun-Portu language adopts the structure of Tetun-Terik as the backbone for the development of the creole.

In the third example, once again the adoption of codes from the Portuguese language had been adopted. The adoption was clearly depicted in the following example (Timor, 2018).

Table 4. Third Example of the Comparison between Tetun-Terik and Tetun-Portu on the Structure-Level

Bahasa Indonesia	Seorang permaisuri dan seorang raja mempunyai dua orang putra.
English	A queen and a king once had two sons.
Tetun-Terik	<u>Liurai fetu ida no liurai mane ida iha oan rua.</u>
Tetun-Portu	<u>Iha uno fetu rai ho iha uno mane rai por dois <u>oang mane.</u></u>

In addition to the brief structure, more codes from the Portuguese had been adopted. The adoption of uno and por was more than enough to confirm that the codes from the Portuguese had been used in the structure of Tetun-Portu. Then, as usual the structure of Tetun-Portu was briefer than that of Tetun-Terik and the brief structure could be seen from the fewer codes that have been used. Apart of the brief structure, there was a code that might be similar between the Tetun-Terik language and the Tetun-Portu language namely oan and oang. Both of these codes referred to the

same code namely child. However, the difference was that the code oan in the Tetun-Terik already bore the meaning son while the code oang in the Tetun-Portu language had not born the meaning son, instead it merely bears the meaning child. Therefore, the gender marker mane should be added into the code oang in order to form the meaning son. Since there were two sons the word dois (meaning two in Tetun-Portu) should be used.

The use of gender marker was another interesting finding that had been gathered during the informal FGD. Just like the other European language, the Tetun-Portu language also had gender marker namely mane for a male and fetu for a female. However, the gender only served as specifier. For example, in order to state which man or which woman a speaker of Tetun-Portu would simply say mane ne'e ka or fetu ne'e ka. In the daily life, the gender marker was not used for stating the different actor and also the different point of view except for the third singular person point of view. The description of the case was provided in the following table (Timor, 2018).

Table 5. Statement of Daily Activities Based on Gender and Point of View

Bahasa Indonesia	Saya (pria/wanita) sedang makan. Kamu (pria/wanita) sedang makan. Dia (pria) sedang makan. Dia (wanita) sedang makan.
English	I am eating. You are eating He is eating. She is eating.
Tetun-Terik	Ha'u ko'i ka ne'e. Ha'u ko'i ka ne'e.

	Mane ko'i ka ne'e. Feto ko'i ka ne'e.
Tetun-Portu	Ha'u sei han hela. Ha'u sei han hela. Mane sei han hela. Feto sei han hela.

The above structure seemed quite similar to that of English. This finding was very interesting because typically a European language had a gender marker to all objects. Due to the typicality, the Tetun-Portu language, since it adopted the Portuguese codes, should also bear the same characteristic namely using the gender marker in all objects. Instead, the gender marker was used only as a specifier for the actor. Other than that, the regular codes would be used in the conversation. Such characteristic might be influenced more by the Tetun-Terik language as the foundation or the backbone of Tetun-Portu language.

In brief, the code-switching was very useful in showing the dominance of Portuguese language within the Tetun-Portu language. Recalling the fact that there should be an imbalance of power in order that a creole might be invented, the imbalance of power had been shown in the adoption of more Portuguese codes than the Tetun-Terik codes within the Tetun-Portu language. These codes were very apparent in the structure that the Tetun-Portu language had. In the same time, the adoption of more Portuguese codes implied that the Portuguese language served as a means of authority for the local people during the occupation period. In other words, the Portuguese codes in the Tetun-Portu language served as a symbol of political authority during the occupation period.

The Portuguese Influence within the Invention of Tetun-Portu Language

From the codes and the structure, it might be inferred that the Tetun-Portu language has already met the criteria of being a creole namely being a new language that the speakers of both original language (namely the speakers of Tetun-Terik and the speakers of Portuguese language) do not understand. However, further confirmation should be conducted. In order to confirm that the Tetun-Portu language is categorized as creole, an interview that involves three respondents, namely Respondent A, Respondent B, and Respondent C, is performed (Language, 2018). Respondent A is a male speaker of Tetun-Terik language; he comes from the District of Kakulukmesak, the Regency of Belu, the Province of East Nusa Tenggara and he is about 22 years old. Respondent B is a female speaker of Tetun-Terik and Tetun-Portu language; she was born in Dili but she has grown up in the Regency of Atambua and she is 30 years old. Respondent C is a male speaker of Tetun-Portu and Tetun-Terik language; his origin is Timor Leste but he has grown up in the County of Atambua due to the Referendum that took place around 1998-1999 and he is around 29 years old. Ten questions are provided to the three respondents and their responses are far beyond the expectation of the study.

In general, the three respondents agreed that Tetun-Terik and Tetun-Portu are two different languages. Respondent A said that since his mother tongue was Tetun-Terik he had been accustomed to speaking the Tetun-Terik language; as a result, he would be confused when he met people who spoke the Tetun-Portu language. However, a different situation was encountered by Respondent B and Respondent C. According to Respondent B, she used to speaking the Tetun-Terik language but because of the influence from her father's family she was forced to learn speaking the Tetun-Portu language

Mother tongue, oh Mom's tongue, that will be Kupang (Tetun-Terik) but Dad's tongue is Tetun-Portu. So my mother tongue is Tetun-Terik. However, when the big family of our father pays a visit we should and (even) we are forced to learn Tetun-Portu (Respondent B).

On the other hand, Respondent C said that he had been able to speak both languages but he was more fluent in speaking the Tetun-Portu language than the Tetun-Terik language. He learned speaking the Tetun-Terik language after he had to move to West Timor due to the Referendum that took place around 1998-1999.

For me, probably because I had been raised in Timor Leste, at that time Timor-Timur, I learn speaking Tetun-Portu. After the Referendum between 1998 and 1999, I moved to West Timor (Respondent C).

From the above response, it might be inferred that Respondent C should learn to speak the Tetun-Terik language in order to be accepted by the surrounding community. Learning the Tetun-Terik therefore was very important in order that Respondent C might survive within the new community.

Regarding the structure, all of the three respondents agreed that the Tetun-Portu language had different structure in comparison to the Tetun-Terik language. In addition, the Tetun-Portu language had different forms, speech style, stress, and intonation. For example, the equivalent form of now in the Tetun-Terik language is *huin* while in the Tetun-Portu language is *agora*. This might be the reason why, according to the opinion by Respondent A, the Tetun-Portu language had also been known as the Tetun-Agora language.

The difference might be they have *agora* (the Bahasa Indonesia word for "sekarang" (now) is "agora" in Tetun-Portu). In Tetun-Terik, the equivalent word will be *huin* (Respondent A).

Despite the differences, Respondent C stated that there were several words that had been similar. Thus, the statement confirm the similar codes that had been gathered in Table 1. However, most of the times the codes between the two languages were completely different.

In my opinion, some words are similar (while) some other words are different between Tetun-Terik and Tetun-Portu (Respondent C).

Through the interview, the researcher would like to investigate how the languages get mixed as well in order to confirm that the Tetun-Portu language might be considered as creole. With regards to the question, the three respondents provided various responses but the three responses indicated that there might be a contact between the Tetun-Terik language and the Portuguese language.

It might be that, because we live there, let's say we are the landowner there (the local region) so the spoken language is Tetun-Terik. The use of Tetun-Agora (Tetun-Portu) might be influenced by foreign people who live in the local region, for example Timor Leste, so that the people who live there are influenced by the language of the foreign people (Tetun-Portu) (Respondent A).

Respondent A said that the contact was established between the landowners (the native people) and the foreign people (presumably the Portuguese). The contact was intense in the region known as Timor Leste (used to be Timor-Timur, the 28th province of the Republic of Indonesia). However, the response by Respondent A implied that Portuguese people might not be the only nation that had been influencing the local people. On the contrary, Respondent B said that the Tetun-Portu language had been dominating because of the mixed marriage between the descendants of the people from Timor Leste who got married with the local

people or the people who came from outside Dili region.

In my opinion, about Tetun-Terik and Tetun-Portu, the speakers of Tetun-Portu mostly come from Dili. So, their ancestors are mostly from Portu (Portuguese). Regarding the Tetun-Terik, the speaker of Tetun-Terik are the descendants of the Dili ancestors who got involved in a mixed marriage with the local people living outside Dili (Respondent B).

Different than the other two responses, Respondent C seemed to provide the clearest picture regarding the contact between the speakers of Tetun-Terik language and the Portuguese people. In his opinion, there used to be three tribes that spoke the Tetun-Terik language namely Kemak, Marae, and Bunak. However, from the three tribes the Kemak tribe was able to speak Tetun-Portu; as a result, the Kemak tribe had been able to establish communication with the Portuguese people through the use of the Tetun-Portu language.

In my opinion, as far as I know, from my grandfather, long time ago during the occupation period of Portuguese there have been certain tribes. These certain tribes, namely Kemak, Marae, and Bunak, are the pioneering tribes or the very first speakers of Tetun-Terik. The two tribes, Marae and Bunak, dominantly speak Tetun-Terik. However, the Kemak Tribe, the eldest tribe in the Timor Land, specifically ranging from Atambua to Timor Leste, is more of moderate speaker. So, the people of this tribe are able to speak Tetun-Terik and Tetun-Portu fluently. So, it is the two tribes (Marae Tribe and Bunak Tribe) who speak Tetun-Terik for the very first time (Respondent C).

From the response by Respondent C, it might also be inferred that the Kemak tribe served as the mediator between the local

tribes (such as Marae and Bunak) and the Portuguese people so that the Portuguese people might exert their influence toward the native people. In the same time, the Kemak tribe might expand the use of Tetun-Portu language to further regions; consequently, the Tetun-Portu language might be better known by people who lived in the other regions at that time.

In relation to how the two languages get mixed in order to invent a creole, there was one matter that had been drawing the interest of the researcher. Based on these responses, it seemed that Portuguese people had strong influence over the people in the Timor Island. The strong influence had also been confirmed by all of the respondents. Respondent A stated that the influence does not only come from Portuguese but also from other foreign countries especially in terms of employment. Most of the people who work in the Portuguese-influenced area such as Dili are not originally from Timor especially the high rank officials. On the other hand, Respondent B stated that the Portuguese influence had been strong only in the regions that they used to occupy such as Dili. In the regions that they did not occupy, the influence was not that strong. Then, the solid example of the Portuguese influence could be found in the clothing and specifically the signature dish. Back then in Dili, whenever her family had banquet the signature dish such as alderalda and watercress should be on the table and the culture of serving the signature food had been brought by the Portuguese.

The Portuguese influence had also been confirmed by Respondent C. However, instead of stating that the Portuguese influence had been weak in the regions that had not been occupied by the Portuguese, Respondent C stated that the Portuguese influence had still been strong throughout the Timor Island. The influence had not only been brought by the Portuguese occupation but also by the people who took refuge to the parts of Timor Island that belonged to the Republic of Indonesia after

the Referendum took place around 1998 and 1999. During the event, the people who took refuge did not only bring their material belongings but also their cultural belongings and thus these cultural belongings influenced the people where these refugees settled down.

The influence of Portuguese is still strong even until now. Outside the ex-Portuguese occupied region the influence of Portuguese is still strong. The examples are the matters of conversation and probably the food. Usually the signature dish from *Portu* (Portuguese) can still be found. Even the culture of sipping coffee and wine is still strong from the old times. The *Tetun-Portu* is still spoken outside the ex-Portuguese occupied region because of the Referendum; at the time of Referendum between 1998 and 1999, people from Timor-Timur took refuge to Atambua. It is from this moment on that the people from Timor-Timur who entered Atambua starts speaking the language (*Tetun-Portu*). And the community who live nearby the area (Atambua) still speak the language (*Tetun-Portu*) due to the fact that there are several refugees from Timor-Timur community who have settled in Atambua and who have still been speaking the language (*Tetun-Portu*) (Respondent C).

Despite the contradiction between Respondent B and Respondent C, overall it might be inferred that the Portuguese language had exerted a strong dominance over the *Tetun-Terik* language. In the surface level, the *Tetun-Portu* language had adopted the structure of the *Tetun-Terik* language and the codes of Portuguese language altogether in the same time. Then, the codes of Portuguese language had been adopted in order to show the dominant power that the Portuguese people as the occupier. Since the imbalance of power had been one of the drivers for the invention of a creole, along with the newly resulted

language structure, the *Tetun-Portu* language might be considered as a creole.

CONCLUSION

Based on the overall discussion, several concluding remarks might be drawn. First, the code-switching has been helpful in maintaining the authority over the local people under the occupation era. The impact of the authority has been found even to date in the adoption of the Portuguese codes. The long-term adoption of the Portuguese codes signals the strong influence that the Portuguese people have as occupied in the Timor Island. Second, with regards to the Portuguese influence, the Portuguese influence might be said to have internalized the Portuguese culture and as a result the speakers of *Tetun-Portu* language develop closer relationship to Portuguese rather than to the native language. As a result, the original culture that the *Tetun-Portu* used to have might have been marginalized and even be replaced by the Portuguese culture. Overall, the influence has led to the invention of *Tetun-Portu* language among the local people of Timor Island. Thus, the *Tetun-Portu* language might be considered as a creole.

Finally, there are several limitations that should be given further investigation. The study only relied on the informal focused group discussion (FGD) and the interview for gathering the data. Therefore, in order to provide better data, field study might be worth to consider. Then, in order to describe the *Tetun-Portu* language well, the future researchers are expected to conduct field study with a focus on the syntactic and morphological process of the invention of the *Tetun-Portu* language so that a complete understanding toward the language might be developed with which more elements from the *Tetun-Portu* language may also be discovered to complete the discussion.

REFERENCES

- DeCamp, D., & Hancock, F. 1974. Pidgins and Creoles: Current Trends and Prospects. Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press.
- Holmes, J. 2013. An Introduction to Sociolinguistics: Fourth Edition. New York: Routledge.
- Language, S. o.-T.-P. 2018. Interview Session with the Speakers of Tetun-Terik Language and Tetun-Portu Language. (J. Z. Ma'u, Interviewer, June 17)
- McWhorter, J. H. 1998. Identifying the Creole Prototype: Vindicating a Typological Class. *Language*, 788-818.
- Scotton, C. M. 1982. The Possibility of Code Switching: Motivation for Maintaining Multilingualism. *Anthropological Linguistics*, 432-444.
- Soedjatno, Solchan, Aminoedin, A., & Djajengwasito, S. 1992. Sistem Morfologi Kata Tugas Bahasa Tetum. Jakarta: Pusat Pembinaan dan Pengembangan Bahasa Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan.
- St. Clair, R. N., & Murai, H. M. 1974. Code Switching in Hawaiian Creole. *The Kansas Journal of Sociology*, 75-82.
- Suarjana, I. N., Ardana, I. G., Sudiarga, I. M., & Negara, N. P. 1995. Sastra Lisan Tetun. Jakarta: Pusat Pembinaan dan Pengembangan Bahasa Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan.
- Timor, S. f. 2018. Informal FGD for Attaining Preliminary Data on Tetun-Portu Language. (J. Z. Ma'u, Interviewer, May 12)
- TirtoID. 2017, November 8. Portugis Menjamah Nusantara - Mozaik Tirto. Retrieved June 16, 2018, from www.youtube.com.
- Wardhaugh, R. 2006. An Introduction to Sociolinguistics: Fifth Edition. Blackwell Publishing: Oxford.

